

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

19 December 2016 | 3.30pm – 6.30pm | Meeting No. 12/2016

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

GENERAL MEETING AGENDA

List of Complaint Panel members

Melizel Asuncion (Verite), Henry Barlow (Affiliate Member), Michelle Desillets (Orangutan Land Trust), Matthias Diemer (WWF Switzerland), Bambang Dwilaksono (First Resources), Marieke Leegwater (Solidaridad), Sabarinah Marzuki (Sime Darby), John Payne (Borneo Rhino Alliance), Priya Gopalan (UBS AG), Frasier Lanier (Citibank), Tom McLaughlin (Woolworths), Lim Sian Choo (Bumitama), Lanash Tanda (SEPA), Robert Kruger (RKG).

3.30pm – 4.20pm

1. Opening Remarks by Chairperson
2. Declaration of Conflict of Interest
3. To confirm and adopt the minutes of the 7 November 2016 Complaints Panel Meeting
4. New Complaints
5. Reported cases
6. Monthly List of Complaints
7. RSPO's responses on the Palm Oil Investigation (POI)'s position
8. Sale of concessions/subsidiaries with complaints by members
9. Amnesty International report on Wilmar International Ltd.

Group 1: 4.20pm- 4.50pm

1. Agropalma SA
2. PT Limpah Sejahtera (First Resources Ltd)
3. Orang Dusun Lahad Datu/ FELDA
4. Palma Tica SA
5. Hap Seng Plantations Holdings Bhd

Group 2: 4.50pm – 5.30pm

6. PT Permata Hijau Pasaman (PHP) 1/ Wilmar International
7. Equatorial Palm Oil / KLK
8. Plantaciones de Pucallpa SAC
9. FELDA Global Venture
10. Extractora La Gloria SAS
11. PT Bumitama Gunajaya Agro / Bumitama

Group 3: 5.30 – 6.00pm

12. PT London Sumatra (Lonsum) / Sawit Watch
13. Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL)
14. PT Kartika Prima Cipta/ Golden Agri Resource (GAR)
15. PT Sawit Nabati Agro/ PT Sukses Karya Sawit/ PT Berkat Nabati Sawit/ PT Bumi Sawit Sejahtera / IOI group
16. Poligrow Colombia Ltda
17. PT PP London Sumatra (Lonsum)/RAN, OPPUK & ILRF

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

19 December 2016 | 3.30pm – 6.30pm | Meeting No. 12/2016

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

<p>Agenda item</p>
<p>1. Opening Remarks by Chairperson</p> <p>The Chair opened the meeting by welcoming everybody and then invited everyone to scrutinize the minutes of the previous meeting.</p>
<p>2. “No Conflict of Interest”</p> <p>None of the CP members’ declared any new “conflict of interest” in the cases being deliberated.</p>
<p>3. Minutes of the meeting of 7 November 2016</p> <p>The minutes of the meeting were adopted and confirmed by the members unanimously.</p>
<p>4. New Complaints</p> <p>a) Woolworths Limited – filed by Palm Oil Investigation on 8 December 2016</p> <p>Allegations:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Woolworths are labelling on the pack that the product contains either certified sustainable palm oil OR sustainable palm oil without any RSPO approved audits. Woolworths are using non-RSPO approved financial auditor Deloitte to audit the supply chain certification to back up the claims. • As Woolworths use close to 1,000 contract manufacturers (not all of which are using palm), it would be impossible for all these certifications claims to be correct as there are only around 100 certified manufacturers in Australia that have undergone official audits. The majority of these manufacturers are NOT contracted by Woolworths. • It is alleged that Woolworths has breached the RSPO Communications and Claims Rules, RSPO Code of Conducts. <p>Status: Box A. Complaints Case Received.</p> <p>Update:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - To be referred to the Communication & Claim Committee for actions and recommendation decision. <p>19 December 2016 – Secretariat to put the case under formal complaint.</p>
<p>5. Reported Cases</p> <p>The following are reported cases received by the RSPO Secretariat, which have not been deliberated by the Complaints Panel.</p> <p>i. PT Bumi Sawit Kencana II/Wilmar International Ltd. – filed by the community of Kapuk Village on 22 July 2016</p> <p>The community of Kapuk Village demanded the company to give compensation on 78 Ha of land owned by the Farmers Group.</p> <p>Status: Box B – Reported case categorized.</p> <p>ii. PT Bumi Sawit Kencana/Wilmar International – filed by the Farmer Group of Pantap Village on 27 July 2016</p> <p>It is alleged that the company:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Has not paid compensation for 1.482,90 Ha land of which 0. 33 Ha land (owned by Mr. Simamora) should have been enclaved.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

19 December 2016 | 3.30pm – 6.30pm | Meeting No. 12/2016

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

- Has not developed plasma for the local community.
- The waste from the mills flows into the river during the rainy season, causing floods.
- CSR, as promised, has not been implemented in 2016.

Status: Box B – complaint categorized

iii. PT Mustika Sembuluh/Wilmar International – filed by the Farmers Group of Pondok Damar on 18 July 2016

It is alleged that the mill has polluted the Sei Sampit river (P&C 5.3).

Status: Box B – complaint categorized

iv. PT Karunia Kencana Permai Sejati (PT KKPS II & KKPS III) /Wilmar International – filed by the community of Desa Tangar on 19 July 2016

It is alleged that the company:

- has not paid compensation on 1.099 Ha land to the Farmers Group of Berkat Harapan and Lampung Tarung
- The company has not developed plasma for the local community.

Status: Box B – complaint categorized

Update for reported cases i - iv

19 December 2016 – A stakeholders meeting with 4 groups of community and the company will be held in Sampit on 7-8 February 2016. The meeting will be facilitated by an independent party.

v. PT Nabire Baru / Goodhope – filed by Yayasan PUSAKA on 19 April 2016

Allegations:

- i. Land grabbing from the indigenous people of Yerisiam.
- ii. Violence and involvement of Brimob (police mobile brigade)
- iii. Deforestation that is causing floods in Village Sima, the home village of the Yerisiam tribe.
- iv. The company has destroyed sacred places and Dusun Sagu (the source of main food of Yerisiam tribe).

The complainant requested RSPO to:

- Do the ground verification of the allegations
- Request PT Nabire Baru to compensate and stop their activity, unless they got the consent from the people of Yerisiam.

Status: Box B. Reported case categorized.

Update:

19 December 2016 – Secretariat to escalate the case as a formal complaint.

5. Monthly List of Complaints (Status as of 1 December 2016)

Status	Number of Complaints	Number of Reported Cases
(A) Complaint received	0	0
(B) Complaint categorized	1	4
(C) Panel convened	1	0

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

19 December 2016 | 3.30pm – 6.30pm | Meeting No. 12/2016

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

(D) Complaint legitimate	5	1
(E) Reviewing response	5	0
(F) Action plan	6	1
(G) Case Closed for monitoring	7	2
(H) Case Closed	36	32
(I) Resubmission of complaint	0	0
(J) No case	0	5
(K) No response/ no action from member	0	0
(L) Termination	1	0
(M) panel decision disputed	0	0
(N) Non cooperation	0	0
(O) No consent on action plan	0	0
(P) Appeal	0	0
(Q) Not resolved	3	0
TOTAL	65	45
TOTAL OPEN CASES	19	6

On 1 November 2016, a total of 19 ongoing complaint cases were deliberated and 7 reported cases recorded.

6. Any other matters for the Complaints Panel:

6.1 Dates for the next Complaints Panel Meetings

- i. The upcoming CP meeting date: 24 January 2016

6.2 General Information

- i. The minutes of the 7 November 2016 CP meeting was published on the RSPO website on 22 November 2016.

6.3 Complaints System Revamp

- i. **1 December 2016** - The Public Consultation of Complaints Procedures and Appeals Mechanism has ended. Secretariat has compiled all feedbacks received during the public consultation period.
- ii. **19 December 2016** – A meeting between the Secretariat, Complaints Revamp Advisory Group and 3 members of the Complaints Panel who had volunteered to support finalisation of the document will be arranged in early 2017.

7. RSPO response on Palm Oil Investigations (POI)'s position

[Concerns from POI](#) has been raised during the CP meeting. RSPO respect POI's decision and will discuss this concern internally before responding.

8. Sale of Concessions/subsidiaries with complaints by members

We have had the following members selling their subsidiaries instead of resolving the complaints:

- i. **PT Asiatic Inti Persada/Wilmar**

Sold to the Ganda Group (non- RSPO members); we lost control over the complaint.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

19 December 2016 | 3.30pm – 6.30pm | Meeting No. 12/2016

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

ii. PT Sawit Sumber Sarana/Sawit Mandiri Lestari

The company is sold with the reason that there is a delay in fulfilling the legal/permit requirement so that the company cannot achieve the targets.

iii. PT Mitra Austral Sejahtera/Sime Darby

They are considering selling based on the fact that it is not profitable.

iv. Plantaciones de Pucallpa

They are planning to sell as advertisements have appeared in Malaysia and Indonesia. The complaint is pending for resolution.

The RSPO Code of Conduct for members:

“5. Breaches of this Code

5.1 Members will seek to resolve grievances directly with other member organizations in a timely fashion, and will not make unsubstantiated allegations of breaches against other members.

5.2 Breaches of this Code, or the by-laws and statutes of the RSPO may lead to exclusion from the organization.

5.3 Prior to taking public action in cases of unresolved allegations of breaches of this Code, members will report breaches to the Executive Board, which will deal with the alleged breaches in accordance with the RSPO Grievance Procedure.

5.4 Executive Board Members who are found, after due inquiry, to have breached the Code, will be replaced.

What can RSPO do to prevent non-compliant members from selling to non-RSPO’s members certifiable units where there are severe RSPO Compliance problems?

Update:

19 December 2016 – Secretariat will discuss the draft for Plantaciones de Pucallpa internally. It is recommended for secretariat to proceed the case with independent investigation.

10. Amnesty International’s Investigation report on Wilmar International

"Amnesty International interviewed 120 workers working on palm plantations owned by two Wilmar subsidiaries and three Wilmar suppliers in Kalimantan and Sumatra in Indonesia. The investigation exposed a wide range of abuses including:

- i. Women forced to work long hours under the threat of having their pay cut, paid below minimum wage and kept in insecure employment without pensions or health insurance;
- ii. Children as young as eight doing hazardous, hard physical work, sometimes dropping out of school to help their parents on the plantation;
- iii. Workers suffering severe injuries from paraquat, an acutely toxic chemical banned in the EU and by Wilmar itself;
- iv. Workers being made to work outdoors without adequate safety;
- v. Workers having to work long hours to meet ridiculously high targets, some of which involve highly physically demanding tasks”.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

19 December 2016 | 3.30pm – 6.30pm | Meeting No. 12/2016

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

- **29 November 2016** – Press release from Wilmar was published. The internal actions and assessment report are available at this link : <http://www.wilmar-international.com/sustainability/wp-content/uploads/2016/11/Internal-Assessment-Report-on-Human-and-Labour-Rights-Issues-in-North-Sumatra.pdf>
- RSPO Secretariat public statement on the issue: <http://www.rspo.org/news-and-events/news/rspo-response-to-amnesty-international-report-the-great-palm-oil-scandal-labour-abuses-behind-big-brand-names>

Update:

19 December 2016 – Secretariat to escalate this issue as a formal complaint and check whether the unit is certified.

DELIBERATION OF COMPLAINTS

Complaint 1	
Member Organization	Agropalma SA
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Brazil
Complainant	José Maria Tabaranã da Costa and Aida Raimunda Maia da Costa
Date filed	13 August 2015
Nature of complaint	That Agropalma has acquired land and planted oil palm in violation of the RSPO Principles and Criteria
Status	Box G- Closed for Monitoring
Decision /Justification	Waiting for the decision from the Brazilian Courts and authorities.

Complaint 2	
Member Organization	PT Limpah Sejahtera (a subsidiary of First Resources Ltd (FRI))
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Yayasan International Animal Rescue Indonesia (YIARI)
Date filed	1 May 2010
Nature of complaint	Violation of RSPO P&C 5.2 and P&C 7.3. The company is alleged to have breached: Principle 5: Environmental responsibility and conservation of natural resources and biodiversity Principle 7: Responsible development of new plantings. The company is alleged to have destroyed Orangutan habitats and not to have carried out an HCV assessment before the development of the plantation.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

19 December 2016 | 3.30pm – 6.30pm | Meeting No. 12/2016

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

Status	Box F – Action Plan
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to wait for the HCV review to be completed.

Complaint 3	
Member Organization	FELDA (Federal Land development Authority) FELDA Ventures Bhd.
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Orang Dusun Lahad Datu (Desa Begahak)
Date filed	16 February 2015
Nature of complaint	<p>According to the Enquiry National Hak Tanah document by SUHAKAM, the state government had given 1260 acres of land to the Dusun Begahak community in 1981. At the same time, the same land was alienated to FELDA for development.</p> <p>The complainant raised the issue that FELDA has no right to develop their land and should return it to the community because the land originally belonged to the community. The complainant also stated that the cemetery area is being developed by FELDA.</p> <p>Felda enclaved 916 acres of the said land and gave it back to the community. The community planted fruits and other crops on the land.</p> <p>A police report has been made by the community and that is the source of the complaint.</p>
Status	Box F – Action Plan
Decision /Justification	To wait for the feedback from Sabah Lands and Survey Department and community lawyer's report.

Complaint 4	
Member Organization	PT Permata Hijau Pasaman (PHP) 1 –Wilmar International
Membership category	Palm Oil Processors and/or Traders
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	<p>S.H Gampo Alam, <i>Pucuk Adat Nagari Kapa</i> (indigenous leader of Nagari Kapa) as well as Head of <i>Kerapatan Adat Nagari Kapa</i> (KAN – a village/Nagari-level customary institution in Minangkabau which maintains and preserves the Minangkabau customs and culture).</p> <p>Supported by Forest People Programme (FPP) and HuMa (Association for Community and Ecology-Based Law Reform)</p>
Date filed	30 October 2014
Nature of complaint	1. Complainant seeks clarity of the extent of PT. PHP 1's nucleus estate in Nagari Kapa.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

19 December 2016 | 3.30pm – 6.30pm | Meeting No. 12/2016

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

	<p>2. Complainant rejects PT. PHP 1's application to the National Land Agency for a Hak Guna Usaha (HGU) certificate over the customary (<i>ulayat</i>) land of Nagari Kapa.</p> <p>3. Violation of RSPO Principles & Criteria 6.2 – community did not participate in decision making on the areas to set aside as HCV areas.</p> <p>4. Complainant seeks clarification to whom will the land be reverted at the end of the HGU period</p>
Status	Box F – Action Plan
Decision /Justification	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Both parties to conduct participatory mapping, to seek for clarity from the government on HGU process, and to re-negotiate the partnership scheme. - Secretariat to draft a letter and send it to CP for review.

Complaint 5	
Member Organization	Equatorial Palm Oil PLC
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Liberia
Complainant	Sustainable Development Institute
Date filed	25 September 2013
Nature of complaint	<p>It is alleged that the company has cleared and planted on land that is the customary land of the community in New Cess, Grand Bassa County, Liberia; and is seeking to expand the plantation without the free, prior and informed consent of the communities.</p> <p>The community is also objecting to the company carrying out a re-survey of the existing concession area.</p> <p>The company is alleged to have breached Principle 2.2 & 2.3 of FPIC and Principle 7: Responsible development of new plantings.</p> <p>No NPP notification posted to RSPO.</p>
Status	Box G – Case Closed for monitoring
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to get confirmation from SDI on their response to the RSPO letter

Complaint 6	
Member Organization	Plantaciones de Pucallpa SAC
Membership category	Grower
Country	Peru
Complainant	Forest People Program (FPP)
Date filed	5 December 2015

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

19 December 2016 | 3.30pm – 6.30pm | Meeting No. 12/2016

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

Nature of complaint	Plantaciones de Pucallpa SAC has been accused of human rights violation by the Shipibo community of Santa Clara de Uchunya. In so doing, Plantaciones de Pucallpa has been alleged to have breached the Principles and Criteria of the RSPO on land acquisition and the conservation of forest. These allegations were made in a forum in London; please see link below. http://www.globalresearch.ca/illegal-deforestation-of-5000-hectares-of-peru-amazon-for-palm-oil-peruvian-indigenous-leader/5486126
Status	Box E - Reviewing Response
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to conduct an independent investigation to ascertain which allegations can be justified before making any decision.

Complaint 7	
Member Organization	FELDA
Membership category	Grower
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Article by The Wall Street Journal
Date filed	26 July 2015
Nature of complaint	<i>“Palm-Oil Migrant Workers Tell of Abuses on Malaysian Plantations Global palm-oil industry contributes to human trafficking, rights advocates say”.</i> <i>The palm-oil plantations of Malaysia have become magnets for refugees from Bangladesh and Myanmar. Many have complained of onerous working conditions and few legal protections. (Syed Zain Al-Mahmood/The Wall Street Journal.)</i> The issues including human trafficking, general poor labour conditions, Use of labour contractors, to exploit illegal immigrants from Bangladesh and Myanmar; Withholding of passports; Poor health care; Pay below minimum wages; Non-payment of wages; Bonded labourers.
Status	Box F - Action Plan
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to appoint an independent party to verify the action plan and time bound plan.

Complaint 8	
Member Organization	Extractora La Gloria SAS
Membership category	Grower
Country	Colombia
Complainant	Fredy Antonio Corrales, representative of the Colombian Association for Displaced Peoples’ Prospects (ASOCOL), Adelfo Segundo Rodríguez, representative of the

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

19 December 2016 | 3.30pm – 6.30pm | Meeting No. 12/2016

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

	Association of Returning Displaced Farmers (ASOCADAR), Senator Iván Cepeda, Senator Alberto Castilla, and Representative Alirio Uribe
Date filed	19 November 2015
Nature of complaint	Extractora La Gloria SAS, in planting palm oil in the former Hacienda Bellacruz- today Hacienda La Gloria- occupies 9,000 hectares in the municipalities of La Gloria, Pelaya and Tamalameque, in southern Cesar Department without following RSPO rules. It does not comply with the following RSPO principles (1.1, 2.1, 2.2, 2.3, 4.5, 5.2, 6.4, 6.13)
Status	Box E - Reviewing Response
Decision /Justification	To wait for the result of the meetings with the complainants and the company.

Complaint 9	
Member Organization	Bumitama Gunajaya Abadi/Bumitama
Membership category	Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Sawit Watch
Date filed	13 November 2015
Nature of complaint	<p>The allegations are:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Destroying graves and planting trees surrounding the graves; 2) Dispute on plasma scheme mechanism; 3) Termination of labourers and the status of labourer i.e. are they casual or permanent? 4) Compensation not paid directly to the land owner; 5) Loss of land certification and using the land of migrants which is still under control of the owner; 6) Criminalisation of Gusti Gelombang, a former Company Public Relation officer and now the Head of Cooperative Body. <p>This case has been handled bilaterally since 2014. It was escalated to RSPO because police came to Sawit Watch's office to arrest Gusti Gelombang, who was in their office at that time</p>
Status	Box G - Closed for Monitoring
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to wait for the outcome of the next stakeholders meeting and field visit to Pangkalan Bun on 10 January 2016 before making further decision.

Complaint 10	
Member Organization	PT London Sumatra (Lonsum)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

19 December 2016 | 3.30pm – 6.30pm | Meeting No. 12/2016

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

Complainant	Community of Desa Pergulaan via Sawit Watch
Date filed	7 April 2009
Nature of complaint	The following points were raised by the community of Desa Pergulaan: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Legality of the extension of the concession and demands for the return of land totaling 165.6 ha. 2. The status of the law suit filed by 5 of the residents which are 'out-of-time' (compensation paid in 1971). 3. The legality of the security drains to prevent access. 4. Prohibiting cattle herding in the plantation. 5. The non-employment of residents of Desa Pergulaan in the plantation. 6. Failure by Lonsum to carry out Corporate Social Responsibility programs as promised. 7. No complaint letters have been addressed to Lonsum directly. 8. Status of residents on the Police 'Wanted List'.
Status	Box E – Reviewing Response
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to request the NGO to send the copy of the document submitted to Government

Complaint 11	
Member Organization	Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Liberia, Africa
Complainant	Green Advocates
Date filed	3 October 2012
Nature of complaint	Violation of the RSPO Principles and Criteria and New Plantings Procedure by: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Not providing public notification for a 30 day period consistent with the New Planting Procedures, 2) By commencing land preparation for new planting and infrastructure development prior to the expiry of the minimum 30-days consultation period. 3) By not conducting a comprehensive and participatory independent social and environmental impact assessment(s) of the area concerned and incorporating the results into relevant action plans (see RSPO criteria 5.1, 6.1, 7.1 & 7.4) including the identification of: (a) all primary forest, (b) any area required to maintain or enhance one or more High Conservation Values (HCVs), and (d) local peoples' land. 4) Grabbing lands without respecting local customary rights and without the free, prior and informed consent (FPIC) of the customary landowners as represented

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

19 December 2016 | 3.30pm – 6.30pm | Meeting No. 12/2016

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

	through representative organizations of their choice (RSPO C2.2, C2.3, C7.5, and C7.6). 5) Forcibly evicting the people from their lands (RSPO C7.5 and C7.6).
Status	Box G (Monitoring progress of action plan for Complaint 1 by Green Advocates) Box D – Panel has made a preliminary decision for Complaints 2 to 9.
Decision /Justification	- Complaint will not be closed because of the concerns raised by the complainants and Global Witness - Secretariat to send an independent verification team.

Complaint 12	
Member Organization	PT Kartika Prima Cipta/ Golden Agri Resource (GAR)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Forest People Programme (FPP) and Transformasi untuk Keadilan (TUK) Indonesia
Date filed	14 October 2014
Nature of complaint	Points raised : 1. PT. KPC is in persistent violation of the RSPO P&C pertaining to HCV assessment, the recognition of customary land rights and free, prior, and informed consent (FPIC). Lack of FPIC of the local Dayak and Malay people during the acquisition of the land. 2. The land was acquired without a land tenure study and participatory mapping. 3. Late HCV assessment which was done by Institute Pertanian Bogor, final consultation was in May 2014. 4. Dissatisfaction among smallholders and resentment because of reduced land set aside for plasma compared to HCV areas. 5. The land has been set aside as HCS area that made no provision for customary land uses and tenure and local peoples' livelihood. 6. GAR as the parent company of all 18 subsidiaries listed is acting in violation of the New Planting Procedures (NPP) by submitting information which it knows is false. No HGU exists in 16 of the 18 concessions where NPP was submitted.
Status	Box E - Reviewing Response
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to continue to monitor the communication process between parties.

Complaint 13	
Member Organization	PT Sawit Nabati Agro/ PT Sukses Karya Sawit/ PT Berkat Nabati Sawit/ PT Bumi Sawit Sejahtera (IOI Group) –Ketapang
Membership category	Oil Palm Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	AidEnvironment

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

19 December 2016 | 3.30pm – 6.30pm | Meeting No. 12/2016

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

Date filed	3 April 2015
Nature of complaint	Issues raised by AidEnvironment: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. 10,000 ha of planting without permit (IUP) b. Encroachment into the forest sanctuary c. IOI has cleared the land without submitting NPP.
Status	Box F – Action Plan.
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to wait for the result of the field verification.

Complaint 14	
Member Organization	Poligrow Colombia
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Colombia
Complainant	Environmental Investigation Agency
Date filed	13 August 2015
Nature of complaint	The Italian-owned Poligrow Ltd has prohibited the Jiw and Sikuni indigenous communities from freedom of movement. The EIA's video alleged abuses by RSPO's Italian member in Colombia
Status	Box D – Complaints Legitimate
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to check the content of the report before sharing it with the NGO.

Complaint 15	
Member Organization	Palma Tica SA
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Costa Rica
Complainant	Paulo Hernan Picado Granados, Asociacion de Palmicultores del Sur (ASOPASUR)
Date filed	9 May 2016
Nature of complaint	A group of smallholders Asociación e Palmicultores del Sur (ASOPASUR) in Punta arena are complaining against Palma Tica, saying that they are not being paid fair prices by the company for their FFB. The farmers claim that there is no transparency or clarity in the way the prices are arrived at. Alleged breach of Criterion 1.1: Commitment to Transparency and Criterion 6.10: Growers and mills deal fairly and transparently with smallholder and other local businesses.
Status	Box B – Complaint categorized
Decision /Justification	Secretariat has sent the draft letter to Complaints Panel for review. Secretariat to wait for the feedback from Complaints Panel.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

19 December 2016 | 3.30pm – 6.30pm | Meeting No. 12/2016

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

	Secretariat to send it out once finalised.
--	--

Complaint 16	
Member Organization	Hap Seng Plantations Holdings Bhd.
Membership category	Palm Oil Company
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Sia Yi Chin of Lahad Datu Sabah
Date filed	11 November 2015
Nature of complaint	The complainant is claiming that Hap Seng Plantations Bhd is illegally occupying his property (River Estates) of 6,454 acres in Lahad Datu, Sabah. He says that he is the beneficial owner of the said land and the land office in Kota Kinabalu has confirmed that the said land is still in his name as beneficial owner. He has filed a civil suit against Hap Seng; originating summons: BKI-24-127/5 of 2012 filed on 30.07.2015
Status	Box D – Complaint Legitimate
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to wait for the final court decision.

Complaint 19	
Member Organization	PT PP London Sumatra
Membership category	Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Rainforest Action Network (RAN), Indonesia
Date filed	9 June 2016 (reported case) to be formal on 11 October 2016
Nature of complaint	A report published by RAN, OPPUK, and ILRF titled, " <u><i>The Human Cost of Conflict Palm Oil: Indofood, PepsiCo's Hidden Link to Worker Exploitation in Indonesia.</i></u> " The report reveals the findings of field investigations and worker interviews completed on two palm oil plantations owned and operated RSPO member and Indofood subsidiary PT London Sumatra. The full report available at ran.org/indofood .
Status	Box C – Panel Convened
Decision /Justification	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Secretariat to arrange the stakeholders meeting which tentatively is held on 19 January 2016. - Secretariat to wait for the result of the meeting