

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

GENERAL MEETING AGENDA

List of Complaint Panel members

Melizel Asuncion (Verite), Henry Barlow (Affiliate Member), Michelle Desillets (Orangutan Land Trust), Matthias Diemer (WWF Switzerland), Marieke Leegwater (Solidaridad), Priya Gopalan (UBS AG), Frasier Lanier (Citibank), Lim Sian Choo (Bumitama), Lanash Tanda (SEPA), Robert Kruger (RKG).

9.00am-10.00am

1. Opening Remarks by Chairperson
2. Declaration of Conflict of Interest
3. To confirm and adopt the minutes of the 21 February 2018 CP Meeting
4. New Complaints:-
 - a) PT. Surya Agro Palma (Genting Plantation)
 - b) PT. Sumatera Makmur Lestari (Wilmar)
 - c) PT. Perkebunan Nusantara IV
 - d) PT. Ivo Mas Tunggal
 - e) Wilmar International
5. Potential complaints
 - a) Aceydesa (Honduras)
 - b) Bumi Sawit Kencana II (Central Kalimantan) /Wilmar International
 - c) PT. Permata Putera Mandiri and PT. Putera Manunggal Perkasa (ANJ Group)".
 - d) REPSA
 - e) Jeramah
 - f) CRR Article
6. Complaints Case Statistic
7. Any other matter:-
 - a) Dates for Complaints Panel meetings
 - b) Expansion of the Complaints Panel
 - c) Expansion of the Complaints Team
 - d) Complaints system revamp
 - e) Engagement with ASI
8. Amnesty International report on Wilmar - a media enquiry by Sydney Morning Herald.
9. Request for Re-opening the case of PT Gunta Samba Jaya/PT SIMP.
10. Research Report, "Palming Off Responsibility: Labour rights violations in the Indonesian palm oil sector, by SOMO and CNV International (Pt Aneka Inti Persada - Sime Darby; and PT Murini Sam Sam – Wilmar).
11. Accountability of Financial Institutions

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

12. Complaints for deliberation:-

Group 1: 10.00am-10.50am

- i. FELDA vs Orang Dusun Lahad Datu (Desa Begahak) (Robin Balud)
 - ii. Agropalma SA vs José Maria Tabaranã da Costa and Aida Raimunda Maia da Costa
 - iii. Hap Seng Plantations Holdings Bhd vs Sia Yi Chin
 - iv. Coles Supermarket Ltd vs Palm Oil Investigation
 - v. PT. Pusaka Agro Lestari (PT.PAL - Noble Plantation) vs EIA and Greenpeace
 - vi. PT. Prima Mitra Jaya Mandiri (PT. PMM - MP Evans) vs Serbundo
 - vii. PT. Agro Indomas (Goodhope) vs Mr. Ravindran Veerasamy.
 - viii. PT. Susantri Permai, PT Dwie Warna Karya, PT Kapuas Maju Jaya (Genting Plantation Berhad) vs Commission IV of Indonesia's House of Representative
 - ix. PT. Susantri Permai (Genting Plantation Berhad) vs Borneo Orangutan Survival Foundation (BOSF)
 - x. PT. Limpah Sejahtera (First Resources) vs Yayasan Indonesian Animal Rescue International
 - xi. PT. Mitra Austral Sejahtera (Sime Darby) vs NGO TuK
PT. Minamas Gemilang (Sime Darby) vs Oky Wardianto (*move to address conflict of interest)
-
- i. Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL) vs. Green Advocate for the Butaw Community; FPP; SDI; SESDEV; A-Bloteh

Group 2: 10.50am-11.50am

- i. PT. Permata Hijau Pasaman (PHP - Wilmar International) vs Gampo Alam
- ii. Extractora La Gloria SAS vs ASOCOL, ASOCADAR
- iii. PT. Bumitama Gunajaya Agro (BGB- Bumitama) vs Sawit Watch
- iv. PT. Hati Prima Agro (HPA- Bumitama) vs Sawit Watch
- v. PT. Bumi Sawit Kencana II (BSK- Wilmar International Ltd.) vs Village Kapuk
- vi. Palmas Del Espino SA vs FREDEIALBA
- vii. Western Pacific Oil vs MOI Foods USA Inc
- viii. FELDA Global Venture Holding Berhad vs Chain Reaction Research
- ix. FELDA Global Venture vs Article by The Wall Street Journal
- x. PT. Sarana Esa Cita (Musim Mas) vs M. Ali Napiah
- xi. Aceites S.A vs Association of Palm Growers of the Irrigation District of Marialabaja

Group 3: 11.50am-12.30pm

- i. PT. London Sumatra (Lonsum) vs Sawit Watch
- ii. PT. London Sumatra (Lonsum) vs RAN, Oppuk, ILRF
- iii. PT. Kartika Prima Cipta (GAR) vs FPP and TUK Indonesia

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

- iv. PT. Kartika Prima Cipta (GAR) vs Link-Ar Borneo
- v. Poligrow vs Environmental Investigation Agency
- vi. PT. Nabire Baru (Goodhope) vs Yayasan PUSAKA
- vii. Goodhope Asia Holdings Ltd vs FPP, Greenpeace, EIA and PUSAKA
- viii. PT. Hari Sawit Jaya (PT Inti Indo Sawit Subur) vs Konsulat Cabang Federasi Serikat Pekerja Metal Indonesia (FSPMI)
- ix. PT. Nubika Jaya (Permata Group) vs Masyarakat Peduli Lingkungan Hidup (MPLH)
- x. PT. Sawit Nabati Agro/ PT Sukses Karya Sawit/ PT Berkat Nabati Sawit/ PT Bumi Sawit Sejahtera (IOI Group) (Ketapang) vs Aid Environment
- xi. IOI Pelita vs Community of Long Teran Kanan

Agenda item

1. Opening Remarks by Chairperson

CCP welcomes everyone to the physical CP Meeting.

2. Declaration of "No Conflict of Interest"

ML reiterated her Col.

3. Minutes of the meeting of 24 January 2018

The February minutes were adopted.

4. New Complaints

New Complaints

a) **PT. Surya Agro Palma (Genting Plantation Berhad)**, Complainant : Link Ar Borneo

Complaint Received: 21 January 2018

Allegations:

Lack of transparency on the Plasma Scheme.

Locations: Tapang Tingang Village dan Kiungkang Village, Sanggau, West Kalimantan.

28 March 2018 (CP Meeting)

Secretariat has started Initial Diagnosis. Once it is finalized, CP will be notified and subsequently, the Company.

b) **PT. Sumatera Makmur Lestari (Supplier of Wilmar)**

Complainant: Link-Ar Borneo

Complaints received: 30 January 2018

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

Allegation:

- a. Lack of FPIC;
The operations of the company on the ground has caused Water Pollution to the farm around the plantation.;
- b. Lack of transparency
Regarding the benefit sharing of the plasma, the plasma farmers stated that they still have to pay different types of bills in the form of cuts, so the average plasma farmer only receives a net result of 1.36% of the total of the land granted to the company (complainant has provided the evidence of this allegations);

28 March 2018 (CP Meeting)

Secretariat has started Initial Diagnosis. Once it is finalized, CP will be notified and subsequently, the Company.

c). **PT. Perkebunan Nusantara VI**

Complainant: PT. REKI;

Complaints received: 8 February 2018

Allegation:

The complainant claimed that PT. PN VI has bought illegal FFB from the communities. The complainant informed that the communities has planted palm oil plantations on their concession area and sold FFB to members of RSPO (PT. PN IV). The complainant has provided the evidence of these allegations.

28 March 2018 (CP Meeting)

The Secretariat will follow up with the complainant to complete the complaint form;

d). **PT. Ivo Mas Tunggal**

Complainant: LBH Sakai Riau

Complaint received: 22 January 2018

Allegations:

- 1) Land clearing outside HGU;
- 2) Operated on community's land without compensation (\pm 6,505.42 Ha);
- 3) The company has operated without an appropriate permit

28 March 2018 (CP Meeting)

The Secretariat have followed up with the complainant to complete the supporting documents. Secretariat to continue with the initial diagnosis.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

e) Orang utan shooting

28 March 2018 (CP Meeting)

The Secretariat is doing initial diagnosis and reviewing the documents from Centre for Orang Utan Protection.

5. Potential Complaints

a) Aceydesa (Honduras)

Major unrest is brewing in Honduras post the elections. There were a series of reports in the foreign press relating to the land around Baja Aguan area, at a concession owned by one of RSPO's certified members, Aceydesa. The allegations are related to land grabbing, social and FPIC related issues amongst the Garifuna indigenous community. Since it's a certified unit, our certification team has already contacted the CB, Control Union, who is supposed to initiate a re-audit. This was initially scheduled for the 8th December 2017 but given the current unrest, they have postponed it to this year. We are on standby and have received a media query from a Swiss press source and we have given our usual response. This matter is on high alert.

21 February 2018 (CP Meeting)

The situation in Honduras remains the same so the CBs are not able to go in to conduct the verification. They will inform the Secretariat when they are able to go in.

28 March 2018 (CP Meeting)

The CB has done the audit and the Secretariat will follow up on the audit report.

b) Bumi Sawit Kencana II (Central Kalimantan) /Wilmar International

An incident happened on 18 December 2017, at a Wilmar concession in Central Kalimantan, where 2 workers were allegedly shot by the BRIMOB. They are currently hospitalized in Sampit. Upon receiving the information on 20 December morning, CH immediately followed up with the company giving them 24 hours to respond. We later received letters from several NGOs notifying us of the incident. Wilmar responded on 21 December 2018 alleging that it was an incident involving several workers attempting to steal FFB. Wilmar's security forces had allegedly tried to control the situation but when the individuals allegedly resisted they had sought the assistance of the Brimob. The BRIMOB allegedly first shot up in the air followed by shooting at the workers. They had allegedly used rubber bullets but the workers were still injured.

21 February 2018 (CP Meeting)

The NGO has responded to RSPO, they were asking on the classifications of the complaints as formal and others as not formal. As this is not a formal complaint, there will no information related to this case on

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

the case tracker. This case is still under the investigation of the police. We haven't received any updates on this.

28 March 2018 (CP Meeting)

There is no further information from the Complainant. Secretariat to follow up with the Company.

c) PT. Permata Putera Mandiri and PT. Putera Manunggal Perkasa (ANJ Group), (West Papua, Indonesia)

This is related to the information on the excessive use of force against a community member by the BRIMOB at one of PT ANJ's concession in West Papua. On 14th December 2017, we received a letter from several NGOs including FPP, Yayasan Pusaka and Greenpeace, directed to the Secretariat and asking the Secretariat to lodge a complaint. The allegations were on deforestation and development on disputed land at 2 concessions, PT PMM and PT PMP. The technical team is following up with the company for a response and we are also conducting a GIS mapping to determine if primary forest has indeed been cleared. Technical will advise if this actually warrants being escalated into a formal complaint.

21 February 2018 (CP Meeting)

To make this an official complaint and demand a stop work order or advise the company and make the expectation clear that they must stop. If the Company informs that they have stopped work, they should provide evidence of aerial photographs.

28 March 2018 (CP Meeting)

Technical Department has communicated their findings with the the NGOs. We are waiting for their response.

d) REPSA

28 March 2018 (CP Meeting)

The owners and a senior management executive were arrested last week. It's on the basis on environmental violations in Guatemala. Secretariat have asked the Company for a statement and response.

e) Jeramah

28 March 2018 (CP Meeting)

A company in Honduras. Workers have gone on strike and had been threatened. Secretariat has contacted the company for information.

f) CRR article

28 March 2018 (CP Meeting)

Allegations targeted at PT Tunas Baru Lampung where 6 of their concession units have been listed as having committed very serious violations, e.g. use of security forces, land matters, compensation etc. Secretariat has contacted the company for information.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

6. Complaints Case Statistic.

	January 2018	February 2018	March 2018
Complaints received	3	1	0
Status	Initial Diagnosis	Initial Diagnosis	-
Certified	2	0	-
Country	3 Indonesia	1 Indonesia	-
Typed of Allegations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Plasma Scheme FPIC/Lack of Transparency Land clearance/no compensation to community/ no permit i.e IUP, AMDAL, forest release. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Buying illegal FBB 	

7. Any other matters for the Complaints Panel:

7.1 Dates for the next Complaints Panel Meeting.

The upcoming CP meeting date: **25 April 2018**

7.2 Expansion of the Complaints Panel

Another call for application will be posted at the end of the month.

7.3 Expansion of the Complaints Team

CCP welcomed the new Grievance Manager and DSF Manager.

7.4 Complaints System Revamp

Secretariat is working with the developers on revamping the website.

7.5 Engagement with ASI

Social Audit Guidelines

The Social Manager is working with ASI to develop the social audit guidelines, which will have significant

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

emphasis on labour audits.

Meeting with ASI

The Complaints and Certification team had a meeting with ASI on 13 March 2018. The discussion focused on the opportunities for collaboration.

8. Amnesty International's Investigation report on Wilmar International

"Amnesty International interviewed 120 workers working on palm plantations owned by two Wilmar subsidiaries and three Wilmar suppliers in Kalimantan and Sumatra in Indonesia. The investigation exposed a wide range of abuses including:

- i. Women forced to work long hours under the threat of having their pay cut, paid below minimum wage and kept in insecure employment without pensions or health insurance;
- ii. Children as young as eight doing hazardous, hard physical work, sometimes dropping out of school to help their parents on the plantation;
- iii. Workers suffering severe injuries from paraquat, an acutely toxic chemical banned in the EU and by Wilmar itself;
- iv. Workers being made to work outdoors without adequate safety;
- v. Workers having to work long hours to meet ridiculously high targets, some of which involve highly physically demanding tasks".

29 November 2016 – Press release from Wilmar was published. The internal actions and assessment report are available at this link :<http://www.wilmar-international.com/sustainability/wp-content/uploads/2016/11/Internal-Assessment-Report-on-Human-and-Labour-Rights-Issues-in-North-Sumatra.pdf>

RSPO Secretariat public statement on the issue: <http://www.rspo.org/news-and-events/news/rspo-response-to-amnesty-international-report-the-great-palm-oil-scandal-labour-abuses-behind-big-brand-names>

30 November 2016 – Musim Mas response on the issue: <http://www.musimmas.com/news/general-news/2016/musim-mas-responds-to-labour-risks-in-the-palm-oil-industry>

RSPO Secretariat public statement on the issue: <http://www.rspo.org/news-and-events/news/rspo-response-to-amnesty-international-report-the-great-palm-oil-scandal-labour-abuses-behind-big-brand-names>

Complaints Panel is following up with Wilmar International and TSH.

Update:

21 February 2018 - The report from the Labour Study is still pending.

28 March 2018 (CP Meeting) – The final report is still pending.

9. Request for Reopening the case: PT Gunta Samba Jaya/PT SIMP

Greenpeace, upon releasing their investigative report, **Dirty Bankers**, which exposes HSBC's role in

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

funding palm oil companies linked to environmental and human rights abuses followed up with RSPO on the PT Gunta Samba Jaya and Indofood/PT SIMP filed in 2013. The case remains unresolved after Indofood CEO Mark Wakeford informed RSPO that “[Indofood does] not have any shareholding in PT Gunta Samba Jaya and it is not part of the IndoAgri or SIMP Group.”

Greenpeace claim that their analysis of the company deeds and corporate structures revealed considerable overlap between PT GSJ and its parent companies, and other Salim Group businesses.

In light of this evidence they are formally requesting that the Complaints Panel re-examine the case against PT Gunta Samba Jaya / PT SIMP.

Update:

21 February 2018 (CP Meeting)

We have two candidates to conduct forensic audit, they are from Public Accounting Firms in Jakarta. RRO office will follow up on with them and also check on the Conflict of Interest.

28 March 2018 (CP Meeting)

We have identified an auditor. A meeting will be held with the auditor on the 5th and 6th April 2018 and we will proceed with the plans.

10. Research Report “Palming Off Responsibility: Labour Rights violation in Indonesia palm oil sector by SOMO and CNV International (PT Aneka Inti Persada – Sime Darby and PT Murini Sam Sam – Wilmar International)

SOMO/CNV International published their report on labour violations at PT Murini Sam Sam and PT Aneka Inti Persada. The following violations were noted in the report:

PT Murini Sam Sam

- Temporary workers and contract issues
- Wages and overwork
- Child labour
- Health and safety
- Gender equality – mainly hired as plantation maintenance workers and as such employed on a seasonal basis. Day workers are denied their 3 months of paid maternity leave.
- Freedom of association

PT Aneka Inti Persada:

- Temporary workers and contract issues
- Wages and workload
- Child labour
- Health and safety
- Gender equality

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

- Freedom of association

Update:

28 March 2018 (CP Meeting)

There is no development. Secretariat to follow up with ASI.

11. Accountability of Financial Institutions.

There were discussions:-

1. For financial institutions to encourage other banks to become RSPO members.
2. To encourage banks to examine their commercial banking relationship with other banks. This is where the challenge is.
3. To have a draft write up of FL's analysis of the issue.

28 March 2018 (CP Meeting)

FL reported that the financial institution to get back to him by the next meeting in April regarding their feedback.

DELIBERATION OF COMPLAINTS

Group 1

Complaint 1.1.	
Member Organization	FELDA (Federal Land Development Authority) FELDA Ventures Bhd.
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Orang Dusun Lahad Datu (Desa Begahak)
Date filed	16 February 2015
Nature of complaint	<p>According to the Enquiry National Hak Tanah document by SUHAKAM, the state government had given 1260 acres of land to the Dusun Begahak community in 1981. At the same time, the same land was alienated to FELDA for development.</p> <p>The complainant raised the issue that FELDA has no right to develop their land and should return it to the community because the land originally belonged to the community. The complainant also stated that the cemetery area is being developed by FELDA.</p> <p>Felda encloved 916 acres of the said land and gave it back to the community. The community planted fruits and other crops on the land.</p> <p>A police report has been made by the community and that is the source of the complaint.</p>

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

Status	Box F – Action Plan
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to follow up with all parties.

Complaint 1.2.	
Member Organization	Agropalma SA
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Brazil
Complainant	José Maria Tabaranã da Costa and Aida Raimunda Maia da Costa
Date filed	13 August 2015
Nature of complaint	That Agropalma has acquired land and planted oil palm in violation of the RSPO Principles and Criteria
Status	Box G - Closed for Monitoring
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to continue following up with the company and complainant.

Complaint 1.3.	
Member Organization	Hap Seng Plantations Holdings Bhd.
Membership category	Palm Oil Company
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Sia Yi Chin of Lahad Datu Sabah
Date filed	11 November 2015
Nature of complaint	The complainant is claiming that Hap Seng Plantations Bhd is illegally occupying his property (River Estates) of 6,454 acres in Lahad Datu, Sabah. He says that he is the beneficial owner of the said land and the land office in Kota Kinabalu has confirmed that the said land is still in his name as beneficial owner. He has filed a civil suit against Hap Seng; originating summons: BKI-24-127/5 of 2012 filed on 30.07.2015
Status	Box D – Complaint Legitimate
Decision /Justification	Continued trial is fixed for 23 rd -27 th April 2018.

Complaint 1.4.	
Member Organization	Coles Supermarket Ltd.
Membership category	Retailers

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

Country	Australia
Complainant	Palm Oil Investigation
Date filed	8 December 2016
Nature of complaint	<p>Allegation:</p> <p>Coles are labelling on pack that the product contains either certified sustainable palm oil OR sustainable palm oil without any RSPO approved audits.</p> <p>Please also be aware that as Coles use close to 1,000 contract manufacturers (not all of which are using palm), it would be impossible for all these certification claims to be correct as there are only around 100 certified manufacturers in Australia that have undergone official audits. The majority of these manufacturers are contracted by Coles.</p> <p>COLES CLAIM THAT</p> <p>All Coles brand food and drink products now contain RSPO certified palm oil from physical supply chains. This represents almost all of the palm oil used in Coles brand products. Non-food Coles brand products are made with RSPO certified palm oil from either physical supply chains or book and claim (Green Palm).</p> <p>AND</p> <p>Coles' brand food and drinks now use sustainable palm oil. More than 3,000 tonnes of palm oil used by Coles comes from a sustainable source. The conversion program for Coles non-food products is also underway and in May 2015, Coles launched Coles Hand Sanitisers with sustainable palm oil. The use of palm oil in Coles Brand non-food products has been offset with GreenPalm certificates while the conversion program take place.</p> <p>POI have been engaging with Coles on this issue often and for quite some time, however when we ask for their official audit certificates, they cease responding.</p>
Status	Box F. Action Plan
Decision /Justification	To follow up with the Company on their labelling and meeting CP's deadline.

Complaint 1.5.	
Member Organization	PT. Pusaka Agro Lestari.
Membership category	Oil Palm Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	EIA and Greenpeace
Date filed	20 June 2017
Nature of complaint	1. Potential risk on Clearance a large areas of Primary Forest in Papua;

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

	2. Official Complaint against one of HCV Assessors – Nyoto Susanto.
Status	Box A. Complaint received.
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to follow up with the Independent expert on the verification report.

Complaint 1.6.	
Member Organization	PT. Prima Mitrajaya Mandiri.
Membership category	Oil Palm Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Serbundo (Serikat Buruh Perkebunan Indonesia).
Date filed	26 September 2017.
Nature of complaint	Promote the status of the contract worker to become permanent worker, especially those who have been working in permanent basis work.
Status	Box A. Complaint received.
Decision /Justification	CP to draft the decision letter once the report is received and reviewed.

Complaint 1.7.	
Member Organization	PT. Agro Indomas
Membership category	Oil Palm Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Mr. Ravindran Veerasamy.
Date filed	8 June 2017.
Nature of complaint	Terminations of employment contract without severance pay
Status	Box B. Complaint Categorised.
Decision /Justification	CP will deliver the decision letter.

Complaint 1.8.	
Member Organization	Genting Plantation Berhad (PT Susantri Permai, PT Kapuas Maju Jaya and PT Dwie Warna Karya)
Membership category	Oil Palm Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	-
Date filed	18 December 2016

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

Nature of complaint	PT. Susantri Permai, PT. Kapuas Maju Jaya and PT. Dwie Warna Karya are illegally operating and planting palm in the area of Productive Forest. The three companies were alleged to break the Indonesian law specifically UU No. 41 Tahun 1999, UU No. 18 Tahun 2013, and UU No. 39 Tahun 2014. The 3 companies have not obtained forest land swap area or Forest Area Release Permit and Business Permit (HGU)
Status	Box A. Complaints Categorised.
Decision /Justification	Secretariat tasked to follow up with the Company for status of development on the ground based on the satellite images.

Complaint 1.9.	
Member Organization	PT Susantri Permai (Genting)
Membership category	Oil Palm Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Borneo Orangutan Survival Foundation (BOSF)
Date filed	31 March 2017
Nature of complaint	On 14 February 2017, a report published by US News and Indonesian's local News reported that an Orangutan was killed in the concession of PT Susantri Permai / Genting Plantation. BOSF requested the RSPO to suspend the membership of PT Susantri Permai until a socialisation on the endangered species protection to the workers has been conducted.
Status	Box C. Panel Convened
Decision /Justification	To follow up with technical on the review of the report.

Complaint 1.10.	
Member Organization	PT Limpah Sejahtera (a subsidiary of First Resources Ltd (FRI))
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Yayasan International Animal Rescue Indonesia (YIARI)
Date filed	1 May 2010
Nature of complaint	Violation of RSPO P&C 5.2 and P&C 7.3. The company is alleged to have breached: Principle 5: Environmental responsibility and conservation of natural resources and biodiversity Principle 7: Responsible development of new plantings.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

	The company is alleged to have destroyed Orangutan habitats and not to have carried out an HCV assessment before the development of the plantation.
Status	Box F – Action Plan
Decision /Justification	To inform the Company that they can proceed with certification.

Complaint 1.11.	
Member Organization	PT Mitra Austal Sejahtera (Sime Darby subsidiary)
Membership category	Oil Palm Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Transformasi untuk Keadilan (TuK)
Date filed	31 October 2012 (under DSF) Transferred from DSF to the CP on 9 June 2017
Nature of complaint	It is alleged that the company is breaching the RSPO P&C: Principle 1 on Transparency, Principle 2 on Compliance with applicable laws and Principle 6 Responsible consideration of employees and individuals and communities affected by growers and mills. The issues filed by the complainant are: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Lack of Transparency on land status and partnership agreements 2. Lack of compliance to our customary land rights 3. The absence of (documented) compensation 4. Lack of compliance to local regulation.
Status	Box D. Complaint Legitimate
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to have a meeting with the parties on 14 May 2018.

Complaint 1.12.	
Member Organization	PT Minamas Gemilang (Sime Darby subsidiary)
Membership category	Oil Palm Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Mr. Oky Wardianto
Date filed	19 November 2017
Nature of complaint	The Complainant is an individual, Mr Oky Wardianto and the allegations are with regards to non-payment of salary to the Complainant in his position as Director and Commissioner.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

	<p>Secretariat to complete the Initial Diagnosis.</p> <p>21 December 2017 (CP Meeting) Initial diagnosis has been completed and we will be sending it to the CPs. The Complainant alleges that he has not been paid his salary as the Director and Commissioner since 2010. On the basis of the allegations, there are potential breaches of the P&C.</p>
Status	Box C. Panel Convened
Decision /Justification	To collect all the information from the parties and then CP to proceed to decide on the case.

Complaint 1.13	
Member Organization	Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Liberia
Complainant	Green Advocate for the Butaw Community; FPP; SDI; SESDEV; A-Bloteh
Date filed	2 October 2012
Nature of complaint	<p>Golden Veroleum Liberia:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) has not provided public notification for a 30 day period consistent with the New Planting Procedures, ii) y commencing land preparation new planting and infrastructure development prior to the expiry of the minimum 30-day period iii) By not conducting a comprehensive and participatory independent social and environmental impact assessment(s) of the area concerned and incorporate the results into relevant action plans (see RSPO criteria 5.1, 6.1, 7.1 & 7.4) including the identification of: (a) all primary forest, (b) any area required to maintain or enhance one or more High Conservation Values (HCVs), and (d) local peoples' land iv) clearing land without the free, prior and informed consent of the customary land owners as represented through representative organizations of their choice (P&C 2.2, 2.3, 7.5 and 7.6
Status	Box C. Panel Convened.
Decision /Justification	To ask the Company to revise their action plan.

Group 2

Complaint 2.1.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

Member Organization	PT Permata Hijau Pasaman (PHP) 1 –Wilmar International
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	S.H Gampo Alam, <i>Pucuk Adat Nagari Kapa</i> (indigenous leader of Nagari Kapa) as well as Head of <i>Kerapatan Adat Nagari Kapa</i> (KAN – a village/Nagari-level customary institution in Minangkabau which maintains and preserves the Minangkabau customs and culture). Supported by Forest People Programme (FPP) and HuMa (Association for Community and Ecology-Based Law Reform)
Date filed	30 October 2014
Nature of complaint	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Complainant seeks clarity of the extent of PT. PHP 1's nucleus estate in Nagari Kapa. 2. Complainant rejects PT. PHP 1's application to the National Land Agency for a HakGuna Usaha (HGU) certificate over the customary (<i>ulayat</i>) land of Nagari Kapa. 3. Violation of RSPO Principles & Criteria 6.2 – community did not participate in decision making on the areas to set aside as HCV areas. 4. Complainant seeks clarification to whom will the land be reverted at the end of the HGU period
Status	Box P – Appeal
Decision /Justification	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Continue discussion on the budget and come up with guidelines. 2. Proceed with the capacity building initiative.

Complaint 2.2.

Member Organization	Extractor La Gloria SAS
Membership category	Grower
Country	Colombia
Complainant	Fredy Antonio Corrales, representative of the Colombian Association for Displaced Peoples' Prospects (ASOCOL), Adelfo Segundo Rodríguez, representative of the Association of Returning Displaced Farmers (ASOCADAR), Senator Iván Cepeda, Senator Alberto Castilla, and Representative Alirio Uribe
Date filed	19 November 2015
Nature of complaint	Extractor La Gloria SAS, in planting palm oil in the former Hacienda Bellacruz- today Hacienda La Gloria- occupies 9,000 hectares in the municipalities of La Gloria, Pelaya and Tamalameque, in southern Cesar Department without following RSPO rules. It

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

	does not comply with the following RSPO principles (1.1, 2.1, 2.2, 2.3, 4.5, 5.2, 6.4, 6.13)
Status	Box F – Action Plan
Decision /Justification	Continue to monitor. Inform the Company that they have until June to give the Secretariat a clear timeline.

Complaint 2.3.	
Member Organization	Bumitama Gunajaya Abadi (Bumitama).
Membership category	Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Sawit Watch
Date filed	13 November 2015
Nature of complaint	<p>The allegations are:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Destroying graves and planting trees surrounding the graves; 2) Dispute on plasma scheme mechanism; 3) Termination of labourers and the status of labourer i.e. are they casual or permanent? 4) Compensation not paid directly to the land owner; 5) Loss of land certification and using the land of migrants which is still under control of the owner; 6) Criminalisation of Gusti Gelombang, a former Company Public Relation officer and now the Head of Cooperative Body. <p>This case has been handled bilaterally since 2014. It was escalated to RSPO because police came to Sawit Watch's office to arrest Gusti Gelombang, who was in their office at that time.</p>
Status	Box G - Closed for Monitoring (for allegation no. 1, 3, 4, & 5) Box D – Complaint Legitimate (for plasma issue, cooperative issue & claim from 15 villagers of Sukajaya and Kinjil)
Decision /Justification	To proceed with the meeting with the Complainants on 1 May 2018

Complaint 2.4.	
Member Organization	PT Hati Prima Agro
Membership category	Oil Palm Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Sawit Watch

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

Date filed	13 October 2017
Nature of complaint	A complaint was initially lodged in 2012 on allegations related to land matters. It was dismissed in April 2015 when Bumitama said that they were planning to divest the property and no longer had management control. However, in this request for reopening of the complaint, Sawit Watch has made allegations that although Bumitama claimed to have divested the property they continued to have management control. Further, in July 2016 Bumitama had repurchased the concession unit. Thus, the request for reopening is on the basis that Bumitama allegedly made deceptive claims before the Complaints Panel. The Complainants further claim that Bumitama had not submitted NPP despite the land clearance.
Status	Box C – Panel Convened
Decision /Justification	To proceed to follow up with the Company for the additional document and proceed to share with the Complainants for comments.

Complaint 2.5.	
Member Organization	PT Bumi Sawit Kencana II
Membership category	Palm Oil Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Community of Kapuk Village & NGO Progress
Date filed	22 July 2016
Nature of complaint	Community of Kapuk Village demanded the company to give the compensation on 78 Ha land owned by the Farmers Group
Status	Box C – Panel Convened
Decision /Justification	To follow up with the Company for the full GRTT.

Complaint 2.6.	
Member Organization	Palmas Del Espino SA
Membership category	Palm Oil Grower
Country	Peru
Complainant	FREDEIALBA
Date filed	4 July 2017
Nature of complaint	a. The company and their group member developing the plantation without proper NPP process;

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> b. Developing plantation without informing the local communities; c. The company has failed to comply with national law on the forest conversion; d. Mistreatment of employees including arbitrary dismissal; e. New plantings established without EIA and HCV assessment.
Status	Box A. Complaint received
Decision /Justification	To follow up with the LATAM director and proceed with the meeting with the Company.

Complaint 2.7.	
Member Organization	Western Pacific Oil
Membership category	Supply Chain Associate
Country	USA
Complainant	MOI Foods USA Inc
Date filed	17 March 2017
Nature of complaint	Western Pacific Oils claimed that they are purchasing MB shortening from MOI Foods. MOI Foods clarified that WPO is not their supplier.
Status	Box A. Complaint received
Decision /Justification	To follow up with Complainant for further evidence.

Complaint 2.8.	
Member Organization	Felda Global Venture Holding Berhad
Membership category	Palm Oil Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Chain Reaction
Date filed	19 April 2017
Nature of complaint	There was a report issued by Chain Reaction which reported the fact that FGV in their Kalimantan concession had cleared 1600 Ha peat forest. On 25 th April 2017 Secretariat had a meeting with FGV and they claimed that they only planted on less than 100 Ha of shallow peat.
Status	Box A. Complaint received
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to follow up with FGV on further information.
Complaint 2.9.	

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

Member Organization	FELDA Global Venture
Membership category	Grower
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Article by The Wall Street Journal
Date filed	26 July 2015
Nature of complaint	<p><i>“Palm-Oil Migrant Workers Tell of Abuses on Malaysian Plantations Global palm-oil industry contributes to human trafficking, rights advocates say”.</i> <i>The palm-oil plantations of Malaysia have become magnets for refugees from Bangladesh and Myanmar. Many have complained of onerous working conditions and few legal protections. (Syed Zain Al-Mahmood/The Wall Street Journal.)</i></p> <p>The issues including human trafficking, general poor labour conditions, Use of labour contractors, to exploit illegal immigrants from Bangladesh and Myanmar; Withholding of passports; Poor health care; Pay below minimum wages; Non-payment of wages; Bonded labourers.</p>
Status	Box F - Action Plan
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to have a meeting with the experts in planning the field verification.

Complaint 2.10.	
Member Organization	Sarana Esa Cita (Musim Mas)
Membership category	Palm Oil Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	M. Ali Napiah
Date filed	6 October 2017
Nature of complaint	The complainant stated that the company has operated on his land without compensation.
Status	Box C. Panel Convened
Decision /Justification	CP to draft the decision letter to close the case.

Complaint 2.11.	
Member Organization	Aceites S.A
Membership category	Palm Oil Grower
Country	Maria la Baja, Columbia

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

Complainant	Confidential
Date filed	11 August 2017
Nature of complaint	One of ACEITES mills is allegedly purchasing its FFB from an operation run by Mrs. Alva Yiseth Villamizar Navas in the Maria la Baja area since May 2016. Alva Navas is allegedly collecting FFB from palm growers who accepted her offer of paying them below the market price, without invoices and also offered to harvest the fruit for them. Further, she also made several trucks available to transport the FFB from the field to the collection site. It is also alleged that she buys fruits from anyone, regardless of their ownership. Due to this, people started stealing fruit in the area, because she purchases fruit regardless of its origin, collecting the fruit without any type of sanitary control and with staff hired outside the rules laid down by the Ministry of Labor. The vehicles that collect the fruit do so during the night, a time when restrictions apply on mobility imposed by the City Hall. The FFB has been transferred to the mills located in the department of Magdalena, belonging to Aceites S.A and Palma Aceite.
Status	Box C. Panel Convened
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to follow up with the CP for the full audit report.

Group 3

Complaint 3.1.	
Member Organization	PT London Sumatra (Lonsum)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Community of Desa Pergulaan via Sawit Watch
Date filed	7 April 2009
Nature of complaint	The following points were raised by the community of Desa Pergulaan: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Legality of the extension of the concession and demands for the return of land totaling 165.6 ha. 2. The status of the law suit filed by 5 of the residents which are 'out-of-time' (compensation paid in 1971). 3. The legality of the security drains to prevent access. 4. Prohibiting cattle herding in the plantation. 5. The non-employment of residents of Desa Pergulaan in the plantation. 6. Failure by Lonsum to carry out Corporate Social Responsibility programs as promised.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

	7. No complaint letters have been addressed to Lonsum directly. 8. Status of residents on the Police 'Wanted List'.
Status	Box E – Reviewing Response
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to write to the Company seeking clarification on the number of plantation cycles and on the status of compensation offered in 2015 as part of CSR activities.

Complaint 3.2.	
Member Organization	PT PP London Sumatra/IndoAgri
Membership category	Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Rainforest Action Network (RAN), ILRF, OPPUK Indonesia
Date filed	12 October 2016
Nature of complaint	A report published by RAN, OPPUK, and ILRF titled, " <u><i>The Human Cost of Conflict Palm Oil: Indofood, PepsiCo's Hidden Link to Worker Exploitation in Indonesia.</i></u> " The report reveals the findings of field investigations and worker interviews completed on two palm oil plantations owned and operated RSPO member and Indofood subsidiary PT London Sumatra. The full report available at ran.org/indofood .
Status	Box C – Panel Convened
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to continue following up on the comments to the TOR from both Parties to the Complaints.

Complaint 3.3.	
Member Organization	PT Kartika Prima Cipta/ Golden Agri Resource (GAR)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Forest People Programme (FPP) and Transformasi untuk Keadilan (TUK) Indonesia
Date filed	14 October 2014
Nature of complaint	Points raised : 1. PT. KPC is in persistent violation of the RSPO P&C pertaining to HCV assessment, the recognition of customary land rights and free, prior, and informed consent (FPIC). Lack of FPIC of the local Dayak and Malay people during the acquisition of the land. 2. The land was acquired without a land tenure study and participatory mapping. 3. Late HCV assessment which was done by Institute Pertanian Bogor, final consultation was in May 2014. 4. Dissatisfaction among smallholders and resentment because of reduced land set aside for plasma compared to HCV areas.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

	<p>5. The land has been set aside as HCS area that made no provision for customary land uses and tenure and local peoples' livelihood.</p> <p>6. GAR as the parent company of all 18 subsidiaries listed is acting in violation of the New Planting Procedures (NPP) by submitting information which it knows is false. No HGU exists in 16 of the 18 concessions where NPP was submitted.</p>
Status	Box E - Reviewing Response
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to send letter to FPP after finalizing the review of the HCV peer review reports.

Complaint 3.4.	
Member Organization	PT Kartika Prima Cipta
Membership category	Oil Palm Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Link-Ar Borneo
Date filed	18 December 2016
Nature of complaint	<p>Specific Findings:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Land Claim by 1 community member of Nanga Suhaid, Mr. Saudi; 2. Land compensation claim by 1 community member of Nanga Suhaid, H. Kutai; 3. Water Pollution in the Kapuas river which is affecting the fish farmers' business production; 2. Conflict between residents and Village Head of Tanjung regarding water quality; 3. Conflict between residents and Village head of Emperiang regarding the land acquisition process.
Status	Box C. Panel Convened
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to follow up with the Complainant on updates including requesting for supporting documents

Complaint 3.5.	
Member Organization	Poligrow Colombia
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Colombia
Complainant	Environmental Investigation Agency
Date filed	13 August 2015
Nature of complaint	The Italian-owned Poligrow Ltd has prohibited the Jiw and Sikuni indigenous communities from freedom of movement. The EIA's video alleged abuses by RSPO's Italian member in Colombia

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

Status	Box D – Complaints Legitimate
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to follow up with the Company.

Complaint 3.6.	
Member Organization	PT Nabire Baru
Membership category	Palm Oil Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Yayasan PUSAKA
Date filed	19 April 2016
Nature of complaint	Allegations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Deforestation which causing severe flood in Village Sima 2. Irregularities including development without EIA 3. Land grabbing of the Indigenous people 4. Failure in following proper FPIC process 5. Excessive use of force and violence using of state security forces
Status	Box D – Complaint Legitimate
Decision /Justification	CP to draft the communication and look at issues to determine next steps.

Complaint 3.7.	
Member Organization	Goodhope Asia Holdings
Membership category	Oil Palm Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	RSPO Secretariat
Date filed	19 April 2017
Nature of complaint	FPP and the other NGOs sent a complaint to the BoG on the fact that Goodhope had insisted that their NPP be posted for public consultation despite the Secretariat's finding that the HCV Assessment was not satisfactory. The complainants had also questioned the role of the Secretariat in acting in accordance to GA 12 Resolution 6(H).
Status	Box F. Action Plan
Decision /Justification	To proceed with the legal review of the permit.

Complaint 3.8.	
-----------------------	--

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

Member Organization	PT Hari Sawit Jaya
Membership category	Oil Palm Growers
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Konsulat cabang Federasi Serikat Pekerja metal Indonesia (FSPMI) Selabuhanbatu Raya
Date filed	25 September 2017
Nature of complaint	The allegations are: a. the worker force to bring wife and children as helper/ gerdang to help the worker to reach the target as a harvester; b. impositions of penalties on the worker. This matter was queried by the worker, but the management failed to give satisfactory explanations; c. The absent machine for the workers was broken, it has impact on the payroll; d. Bonus deductions; e. Discrimination of the casual workers;
Status	Box C. Panel Convened
Decision /Justification	To close the case and monitor under IMU.

Complaint 3.9.

Member Organization	PT Nubika Jaya
Membership category	Supply chain and mill
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Masyarakat Peduli Lingkungan Hidup (MPLH)
Date filed	3 October 2017
Nature of complaint	The complainant informed that the company has dumped waste into rivers. During rainy seasons, the river overflowed and inundated residents' houses. The complainant stated the company have failed to implement the agreement from 2015.
Status	Box C. Panel Convened
Decision /Justification	Close the case and transfer to IMU to monitor.

Complaint 3.10.

Member Organization	PT Sawit Nabati Agro/ PT Sukses Karya Sawit/ PT Berkat Nabati Sawit/ PT Bumi Sawit Sejahtera (IOI Group) – Ketapang
Membership category	Oil Palm Growers

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

28 March 2018 | 9.00am-12.30pm | Meeting No. 3/2018

Meeting location: *Capri by Fraser, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

Country	Indonesia
Complainant	AidEnvironment
Date filed	3 April 2015
Nature of complaint	Issues raised by AidEnvironment: a. 10,000 ha of planting without permit (IUP). b. Encroachment into the forest sanctuary. c. IOI has cleared the land without submitting NPP.
Status	Box F – Action Plan.
Decision /Justification	Follow up with the Company for their comments on the verification report.

Complaint 3.11.	
Member Organization	IOI Pelita / IOI
Membership category	Palm Oil Grower
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Community of Long Teran Kanan
Date filed	10 March 2010 Transferred from DSF to Complaints Panel on 17 January 2017
Nature of complaint	Infringement of P&C No.2.2 – the right to land use disputed
Status	Box F – Action Plan
Decision /Justification	Secretariat to continue reviewing the Company’s action plan.