

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

GENERAL MEETING AGENDA

List of Complaint Panel members

Melizel Asuncion (Verite), Henry Barlow (Affiliate Member), Michelle Desillets (Orangutan Land Trust), Matthias Diemer (WWF Switzerland), Marieke Leegwater (Solidaridad), John Payne (Borneo Rhino Alliance), Priya Gopalan (UBS AG), Frasier Lanier (Citibank), Lim Sian Choo (Bumitama), Lanash Tanda (SEPA), Robert Kruger (RKG).

3.30pm – 4.15pm

1. Opening Remarks by Chairperson
2. Declaration of Conflict of Interest
3. To confirm and adopt the minutes of the 24 January 2018 CP Meeting
4. New Complaints:-
 - a) PT. Surya Agro Palma (Genting Plantation)
 - b) PT. Sumatera Makmur Lestari (Wilmar)
 - c) PT. Perkebunan Nusantara IV
 - d) PT. Ivo Mas Tunggal
 - e) PT. Steelindo Wahana Perkasa (Kuala Lumpur Kepong Berhad)
5. Potential complaints
 - a) Aceydesa (Honduras)
 - b) Bumi Sawit Kencana II (Central Kalimantan) /Wilmar International
 - c) PT. Permata Putera Mandiri and PT. Putera Manunggal Perkasa (ANJ Group)".
 - d) PT Kartika Prima Cipta
6. Complaints Case Statistic
7. Any other matter:-
 - a) **Dates for Complaints Panel meetings**
 - b) **Expansion of the Complaints Panel**
 - c) **Expansion of the Complaints Team**
 - d) **Complaints system revamp**
 - e) **Proposed meeting with DSF Advisory Group**
8. Amnesty International report on Wilmar - a media enquiry by Sydney Morning Herald.
9. Request for Re-opening the case of PT Gunta Samba Jaya/PT SIMP.
10. Research Report, "Palming Off Responsibility: Labour rights violations in the Indonesian palm oil sector, by SOMO and CNV International (Pt Aneka Inti Persada - Sime Darby; and PT Murini Sam Sam – Wilmar).

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

11. Accountability of Financial Institutions

12. Complaints for deliberation:-

Group 1: 4.15pm- 4.45pm

- i. FELDA vs Orang Dusun Lahad Datu (Desa Begahak) (Robin Balud)
- ii. Agropalma SA vs José Maria Tabaranã da Costa and Aida Raimunda Maia da Costa
- iii. Hap Seng Plantations Holdings Bhd vs Sia Yi Chin
- iv. Coles Supermarket Ltd vs Palm Oil Investigation
- v. PT. Pusaka Agro Lestari (PT.PAL - Noble Plantation) vs EIA and Greenpeace
- vi. PT. Prima Mitra Jaya Mandiri (PT. PMM - MP Evans) vs Serbundo
- vii. PT. Agro Indomas (Goodhope) vs Mr. Ravindran Veerasamy.
- viii. PT. Susantri Permai, PT Dwie Warna Karya, PT Kapuas Maju Jaya (Genting Plantation Berhad) vs Commission IV of Indonesia's House of Representative
- ix. PT. Susantri Permai (Genting Plantation Berhad) vs Borneo Orangutan Survival Foundation (BOSF)
- x. PT. Limpah Sejahtera (First Resources) vs Yayasan Indonesian Animal Rescue International
- xi. PT. Mitra Austral Sejahtera (Sime Darby) vs NGO TuK
- xii. PT. Minamas Gemilang (Sime Darby) vs Oky Wardianto (*move to address conflict of interest)
- xiii. Golden Veroleum Liberia vs. Green Advocate for the Butaw Community; FPP; SDI; SESDEV; A-Blotek

Group 2: 4.45pm – 5.15pm

- i. PT. Permata Hijau Pasaman (PHP - Wilmar International) vs Gampo Alam
- ii. FELDA Global Venture vs Article by The Wall Street Journal
- iii. Extractora La Gloria SAS vs ASOCOL, ASOCADAR
- iv. PT. Bumitama Gunajaya Agro (BGB- Bumitama) vs Sawit Watch
- v. PT. Hati Prima Agro (HPA- Bumitama) vs Sawit Watch
- vi. PT. Bumi Sawit Kencana II (BSK- Wilmar International Ltd.) vs Village Kapuk
- vii. Palmas Del Espino SA vs FREDEIALBA
- viii. Western Pacific Oil vs MOI Foods USA Inc
- ix. FELDA Global Venture Holding Berhad vs Chain Reaction
- x. PT. Sarana Esa Cita (Musim Mas) vs M. Ali Napiah
- xi. Aceites S.A vs Association of Palm Growers of the Irrigation District of Marialabaja

Group 2: 4.45pm – 5.15pm

- i. PT Permata Hijau Pasaman (PHP) 1/Wilmar International
- ii. FELDA Global Venture
- iii. Extractora La Gloria SAS – Colombia

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

- iv. PT BGA /Bumitama Gunajaya Agro
- v. PT. Hati Prima Agro (HPA)
- vi. PT BSK II/Wilmar International Ltd. (Village Kapuk)
- vii. Palmas Del Espino SA
- viii. Western Pacific Oil
- ix. FGV
- x. PT. Sarana Esa Cita (Musim Mas)

Group 3: 5.15 – 5.50pm

- i. PT. London Sumatra (Lonsum) vs Sawit Watch
- ii. PT. London Sumatra (Lonsum) vs RAN, Oppuk, ILRF
- iii. PT. Kartika Prima Cipta (GAR) vs FPP and TUK Indonesia
- iv. PT. Kartika Prima Cipta (GAR) vs Link-Ar Borneo
- v. Poligrow vs Environmental Investigation Agency
- vi. PT. Nabire Baru (Goodhope) vs Yayasan PUSAKA
- vii. Goodhope Asia Holdings Ltd vs FPP, Greenpeace, EIA and PUSAKA
- viii. PT. Hari Sawit Jaya (PT Inti Indo Sawit Subur) vs Konsulat Cabang Federasi Serikat Pekerja Metal Indonesia (FSPMI)
- ix. PT. Nubika Jaya (Permata Group) vs Masyarakat Peduli Lingkungan Hidup (MPLH)
- x. PT. Sawit Nabati Agro/ PT Sukses Karya Sawit/ PT Berkat Nabati Sawit/ PT Bumi Sawit Sejahtera (IOI Group) (Ketapang) vs Aid Environment
- xi. IOI Pelita vs Community of Long Teran Kanan

Agenda item

1. Opening Remarks by Chairperson

CCP welcomes everyone to the CP Meeting.

2. Declaration of “No Conflict of Interest”

No new Conflict of Interest.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

3. Minutes of the meeting of 24 January 2018

The January minutes were adopted with some minor amendments.

4. New Complaints

New Complaints

a) **PT. Surya Agro Palma (Genting Plantation Berhad)**, Complainant : Link Ar Borneo

Complaint Received: 21 January 2018

Allegations:

Lack of transparency on the Plasma Scheme.

Locations: Tapang Tingang Village dan Kiungkang Village, Sanggau, West Kalimantan.

21 February 2018 (CP Meeting)

The Secretariat to follow up with the Company to provide additional information ie: plasma agreement. The deadline for the Company to provide this is 27.2.2018. Initial diagnosis to be completed.

b) **PT. Sumatera Makmur Lestari (Supplier of Wilmar)**

Complainant: Link-Ar Borneo

Complaints received: 30 January 2018

Allegation:

a. Lack of FPIC;

The operations of the company on the ground has caused Water Pollution to the farm around the plantation.;

b. Lack of transparency

Regarding the benefit sharing of the plasma, the plasma farmers stated that they still have to pay different types of bills in the form of cuts, so the average plasma farmer only receives a net result of 1.36% of the total the land granted to the company (complainant has provided the evidence of this allegations);

21 February 2018 (CP Meeting)

Initial diagnosis to be completed.

c). **PT. Perkebunan Nusantara VI**

Complainant: PT. REKI;

Complaints received: 8 February 2018

Allegation:

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

The complainant claimed that PT. PN VI has bought illegal FFB from the communities. The complainant informed that the communities has planted palm oil plantation on their concession area and sold it to members of RSPO (PT. PN IV). The complainant has provided the evidence of these allegations.

21 February 2018 (CP Meeting)

Initial diagnosis to be completed.

d). PT. Ivo Mas Tunggal

Complainant: LBH Sakai Riau

Complaint received: 22 January 2018

Allegations:

- 1) Land clearing outside HGU;
- 2) Operated on community's land without compensation ($\pm 6,505.42$ Ha);
- 3) The company has operated without appropriate permit (No IUP, and AMDAL, and forest release)

21 February 2018 (CP Meeting)

Initial diagnosis to be completed.

5. Potential Complaints

a) Aceydesa (Honduras)

A major unrest is brewing in Honduras post the elections. There were a series of information in foreign press relating to the land around Baja Aguan area, at a concession owned by one of RSPO's certified member, Aceydesa. The allegations are related to land grabbing, social and FPIC related issues amongst the Garifuna indigenous community. Since it's a certified unit, our certification team has already contacted the CB, Control Union, who is supposed to initiate a re-audit. This was initially scheduled for the 8th December 2017 but given the current unrest, they have postponed it to next year. We are on standby and have received media query form a Swiss press and we have given our usual response. This matter is on high alert.

21 February 2018 (CP Meeting)

The situation in Honduras remains the same so the CBs are not able to go in to conduct the verification. They will inform the Secretariat when they are able to go in.

b) Bumi Sawit Kencana II (Central Kalimantan) /Wilmar International

An incident which happened on 18 December 2017, at a Wilmar concession in Central Kalimantan, where 2 workers were allegedly shot by the BRIMOB. They are currently hospitalized in Sampit. Upon receiving

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

the information on 20 December morning, CH immediately followed up with the company giving them 24 hours to respond. We later received letters from several NGOs notifying us of the incident. Wilmar responded a few hours ago on (21 December 2018) alleging that it was an incident involving several workers attempting to steal FFB. Wilmar's security forces had allegedly tried to control the situation but when the individuals allegedly resisted they had sought the assistance of the Brimob. The BRIMOB allegedly first shot up in the air followed by shooting at the workers. They had allegedly used rubber bullets but the workers were still injured.

21 February 2018 (CP Meeting)

The NGO has responded to RSPO, they were asking on the classifications of the complaints as formal and others as not formal. As this is not a formal complaint, there will no information related to this case on the case tracker. This case is still under the investigation of the police. We haven't received any updates on this.

c) PT. Permata Putera Mandiri and PT. Putera Manunggal Perkasa (ANJ Group), (West Papua, Indonesia)

This is related to the information on the excessive use of force against a community member by the BRIMOB at one of PT ANJ's concession in West Papua. On 14th December 2017, we received a letter from several NGOs including FPP, Yayasan Pusaka and Greenpeace, directed to the Secretariat and asking the Secretariat to lodge a complaint. The allegations were on deforestation and development on disputed land at 2 concessions, PT PMM and PT PMP. The technical team is following up with the company for a response and we are also conducting a GIS mapping to determine if primary forest has indeed been cleared. Technical will advise if this actually warrants being escalated into a formal complaint.

21 February 2018 (CP Meeting)

To follow up with the Technical Department on the outcome of the Secretariat's verification process.

d) PT Kartika Prima Cipta

21 February 2018 (CP Meeting)

Email from FPP about expansion of Kartika Prima Cipta. The community has accepted the settlement offer from KPC. The decision is to continue monitoring the process.

e). PT. Steelindo Wahana Perkasa (Kuala Lumpur Kepong Berhad)

This is potential complaint, the complainant walked in RRO office last week. The complainant will send an email to the secretariat on the information related to complaint.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

21 February 2018 (CP Meeting)

To wait for the Complainant to send email to the Secretariat.

6. Complaints Case Statistic.

| Country | Number of cases from 2009-2017 | Year | No. of cases |
|------------------|--------------------------------|--------------|--------------|
| Indonesia | 99 | 2017 | 21 |
| Malaysia | 12 | 2016 | 21 |
| USA | 2 | 2015 | 35 |
| Russia | 1 | 2014 | 5 |
| Peru | 3 | 2013 | 20 |
| Costa Rica | 1 | 2012 | 17 |
| Australia | 2 | 2011 | 6 |
| UK | 1 | 2010 | 9 |
| Netherlands | 1 | 2009 | 4 |
| France | 3 | TOTAL | 138 |
| Brazil | 1 | | |
| Columbia | 3 | | |
| Papua New Guinea | 3 | | |
| Liberia | 4 | | |
| Cameroon | 2 | | |
| Total | 138 | | |

| | Complaints Received | Resolved/Closed | Unresolved | Complaints against Certified Units | Complaints against Certified Units Resolved |
|------|---------------------|-----------------|------------|------------------------------------|---|
| 2017 | 21 | 2 | 19 | 6 | |
| 2016 | 21 | 13 | 8 | 5 | 3 |
| 2015 | 35 | 28 | 7 | 11 | 10 |
| 2014 | 5 | 3 | 2 | 1 | |
| 2013 | 20 | 20 | | 1 | 1 |
| 2012 | 17 | 15 | 2 | | |
| 2011 | 6 | 6 | | 2 | 2 |
| 2010 | 9 | 7 | 2 | | |
| 2009 | 4 | 3 | 1 | 1 | |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

| | | | | | |
|--------------|------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------|-----------------|
| Total | 138 | 97 (70%) | 41 (30%) | 27 | 16 (59%) |
|--------------|------------|-----------------|-----------------|-----------|-----------------|

| Category | 2017 |
|------------------|------|
| Resolved cases | 2 |
| Unresolved cases | 19 |
| Total | 21 |

| Category | 2017 |
|---------------|------|
| Land | 6 |
| Environmental | 3 |
| Human Rights | 6 |
| NPP | 3 |
| Others | 3 |
| Total | 21 |

7. Any other matters for the Complaints Panel:

6.1 Dates for the next Complaints Panel Meeting.

The upcoming CP meeting date: **28 & 29 March 2018**

6.2 Expansion of the Complaints Panel

Another call for application will be sent out at the end of March.

6.3 Expansion of the Complaints Team

No new updates. The Grievance Manager will be starting on 1/3/2018 and Secretariat is still looking for a Complaints Executive in Indonesia.

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

6.4 Complaints System Revamp

We will be following up with our developers to ensure the revamped webpage is up and running by end of March.

6.5 Proposed meeting with DSF Advisory Group

Complaints desk has followed up with the Chair of the DSF Advisory Group in order to plan the meeting back to back with the CP's physical meeting in March. Once the meeting is confirmed, an email will be sent out to see who else is available physically or through Webex.

8. Amnesty International's Investigation report on Wilmar International

"Amnesty International interviewed 120 workers working on palm plantations owned by two Wilmar subsidiaries and three Wilmar suppliers in Kalimantan and Sumatra in Indonesia. The investigation exposed a wide range of abuses including:

- i. Women forced to work long hours under the threat of having their pay cut, paid below minimum wage and kept in insecure employment without pensions or health insurance;
- ii. Children as young as eight doing hazardous, hard physical work, sometimes dropping out of school to help their parents on the plantation;
- iii. Workers suffering severe injuries from paraquat, an acutely toxic chemical banned in the EU and by Wilmar itself;
- iv. Workers being made to work outdoors without adequate safety;
- v. Workers having to work long hours to meet ridiculously high targets, some of which involve highly physically demanding tasks".

29 November 2016 – Press release from Wilmar was published. The internal actions and assessment report are available at this link :<http://www.wilmar-international.com/sustainability/wp-content/uploads/2016/11/Internal-Assessment-Report-on-Human-and-Labour-Rights-Issues-in-North-Sumatra.pdf>

RSPO Secretariat public statement on the issue: <http://www.rspo.org/news-and-events/news/rspo-response-to-amnesty-international-report-the-great-palm-oil-scandal-labour-abuses-behind-big-brand-names>

30 November 2016 – Musim Mas response on the issue: <http://www.musimmas.com/news/general-news/2016/musim-mas-responds-to-labour-risks-in-the-palm-oil-industry>

RSPO Secretariat public statement on the issue: <http://www.rspo.org/news-and-events/news/rspo-response-to-amnesty-international-report-the-great-palm-oil-scandal-labour-abuses-behind-big-brand-names>

Update:

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

21 February 2018 - The report from the Labour Study is still pending.

8. Request for Reopening the case: PT Gunta Samba Jaya/PT SIMP

Greenpeace, upon releasing their investigative report, **Dirty Bankers**, which exposes HSBC's role in funding palm oil companies linked to environmental and human rights abuses followed up with RSPO on the PT Gunta Samba Jaya and Indofood/PT SIMP filed in 2013. The case remains unresolved after Indofood CEO Mark Wakeford informed RSPO that "[Indofood does] not have any shareholding in PT Gunta Samba Jaya and it is not part of the IndoAgri or SIMP Group."

Greenpeace claim that their analysis of the company deeds and corporate structures revealed considerable overlap between PT GSJ and its parent companies, and other Salim Group businesses.

In light of this evidence they are formally requesting that the Complaints Panel re-examine the case against PT Gunta Samba Jaya / PT SIMP.

Update:

21 February 2018 (CP Meeting)

We have two candidates to conduct forensic investigations, they are from Public Accounting Firms in Jakarta. RRO office will follow up on the rates of these firms and Conflict of Interest.

9. Research Report "Palming Off Responsibility: Labour Rights violation in Indonesia palm oil sector by SOMO and CNV International (PT Aneka Inti Persada – Sime Darby and PT Murini Sam Sam – Wilmar International)

SOMO/CNV International published their report on labour violations at PT Murini Sam Sam and PT Aneka Inti Persada. The following violations were noted in the report:

PT Murini Sam Sam

- Temporary workers and contract issues
- Wages and overwork
- Child labour
- Health and safety
- Gender equality – mainly hired as plantation maintenance workers and as such employed on a seasonal basis. Day workers are denied their 3 months of paid maternity leave.
- Freedom of association

PT Aneka Inti Persada:

- Temporary workers and contract issues
- Wages and workload
- Child labour
- Health and safety
- Gender equality
- Freedom of association

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

Update:

21 February 2018 (CP Meeting)

The Secretariat to follow up with ASI on the verification exercise.

10. Accountability of Financial Institutions.

There were discussions:-

1. For financial institutions to encourage other banks to become RSPO members.
2. To encourage banks to examine their commercial banking relationship with other banks. This is where the challenge is.
3. To have a draft write up of FL's analysis of the issue.

DELIBERATION OF COMPLAINTS

Group 1

| Complaint 1.1. | |
|-----------------------|---|
| Member Organization | FELDA (Federal Land Development Authority) FELDA Ventures Bhd. |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Grower |
| Country | Malaysia |
| Complainant | Orang Dusun Lahad Datu (Desa Begahak) |
| Date filed | 16 February 2015 |
| Nature of complaint | <p>According to the Enquiry National Hak Tanah document by SUHAKAM, the state government had given 1260 acres of land to the Dusun Begahak community in 1981. At the same time, the same land was alienated to FELDA for development.</p> <p>The complainant raised the issue that FELDA has no right to develop their land and should return it to the community because the land originally belonged to the community. The complainant also stated that the cemetery area is being developed by FELDA.</p> <p>Felda enclaved 916 acres of the said land and gave it back to the community. The community planted fruits and other crops on the land.</p> <p>A police report has been made by the community and that is the source of the complaint.</p> |
| Status | Box F – Action Plan |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the Jurisdictional Approach Regional Committee to call on the Sabah Land and Survey Department speed up the process. |
|-------------------------|--|

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Complaint 1.2. | |
| Member Organization | Agropalma SA |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Grower |
| Country | Brazil |
| Complainant | José Maria Tabaranã da Costa and Aida Raimunda Maia da Costa |
| Date filed | 13 August 2015 |
| Nature of complaint | That Agropalma has acquired land and planted oil palm in violation of the RSPO Principles and Criteria |
| Status | Box G - Closed for Monitoring |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the Complainant. |

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Complaint 1.3. | |
| Member Organization | Hap Seng Plantations Holdings Bhd. |
| Membership category | Palm Oil Company |
| Country | Malaysia |
| Complainant | Sia Yi Chin of Lahad Datu Sabah |
| Date filed | 11 November 2015 |
| Nature of complaint | The complainant is claiming that Hap Seng Plantations Bhd is illegally occupying his property (River Estates) of 6,454 acres in Lahad Datu, Sabah. He says that he is the beneficial owner of the said land and the land office in Kota Kinabalu has confirmed that the said land is still in his name as beneficial owner. He has filed a civil suit against Hap Seng; originating summons: BKI-24-127/5 of 2012 filed on 30.07.2015 |
| Status | Box D – Complaint Legitimate |
| Decision /Justification | The new trial dates are February 26 th - 28 th . Secretariat to continue monitoring the situation. |

| | |
|-----------------------|------------------------|
| Complaint 1.4. | |
| Member Organization | Coles Supermarket Ltd. |
| Membership category | Retailers |
| Country | Australia |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Complainant | Palm Oil Investigation |
| Date filed | 8 December 2016 |
| Nature of complaint | <p>Allegation:</p> <p>Coles are labelling on pack that the product contains either certified sustainable palm oil OR sustainable palm oil without any RSPO approved audits.</p> <p>Please also be aware that as Coles use close to 1,000 contract manufacturers (not all of which are using palm), it would be impossible for all these certification claims to be correct as there are only around 100 certified manufacturers in Australia that have undergone official audits. The majority of these manufacturers are contracted by Coles.</p> <p>COLES CLAIM THAT</p> <p>All Coles brand food and drink products now contain RSPO certified palm oil from physical supply chains. This represents almost all of the palm oil used in Coles brand products. Non-food Coles brand products are made with RSPO certified palm oil from either physical supply chains or book and claim (Green Palm).</p> <p>AND</p> <p>Coles' brand food and drinks now use sustainable palm oil. More than 3,000 tonnes of palm oil used by Coles comes from a sustainable source. The conversion program for Coles non-food products is also underway and in May 2015, Coles launched Coles Hand Sanitisers with sustainable palm oil. The use of palm oil in Coles Brand non-food products has been offset with GreenPalm certificates while the conversion program take place.</p> <p>POI have been engaging with Coles on this issue often and for quite some time, however when we ask for their official audit certificates, they cease responding.</p> |
| Status | Box F. Action Plan |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat tasked to remind Coles of the deadline to change the labelling. |

| | |
|-----------------------|---|
| Complaint 1.5. | |
| Member Organization | PT. Pusaka Agro Lestari. |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Growers |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | EIA and Greenpeace |
| Date filed | 20 June 2017 |
| Nature of complaint | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Potential risk on Clearance a large areas of Primary Forest in Papua; 2. Official Complaint against one of HCV Assessors – Nyoto Susanto. |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Status | Box A. Complaint received. |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the independent reviewer to finalize the report in the next 2 weeks. |

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Complaint 1.6. | |
| Member Organization | PT. Mitra Jaya Mandiri. |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Growers |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Serbundo (Serikat Buruh Perkebunan Indonesia). |
| Date filed | 26 September 2017. |
| Nature of complaint | Promote the status of the contract worker to become permanent worker, especially those who have been working in permanent basis work. |
| Status | Box A. Complaint received. |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat mandated by the Complaints Panel to proceed with a bilateral meeting with the Company and the complainant. This is to be facilitated by an independent expert. |

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Complaint 1.7. | |
| Member Organization | PT. Agro Indomas |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Growers |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Mr. Ravindran Veerasamy. |
| Date filed | 8 June 2017. |
| Nature of complaint | Terminations of employment contract without severance pay |
| Status | Box B. Complaint Categorized. |
| Decision /Justification | To follow up with the Complainant on the new information shared with regards the claims lodged with the Malaysian labour court. |

| | |
|-----------------------|---|
| Complaint 1.8. | |
| Member Organization | Genting Plantation Berhad (PT Susantri Permai, PT Kapuas Maju Jaya and PT Dwie Warna Karya) |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Growers |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | - |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Date filed | 18 December 2016 |
| Nature of complaint | PT. Susantri Permai, PT. Kapuas Maju Jaya and PT. Dwie Warna Karya are illegally operating and planting palm in the area of Productive Forest. The three companies were alleged to break the Indonesian law specifically UU No. 41 Tahun 1999, UU No. 18 Tahun 2013, and UU No. 39 Tahun 2014. The 3 companies have not obtained forest land swap area or Forest Area Release Permit and Business Permit (HGU) |
| Status | Box A. Complaints Categorised. |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to proceed with a meeting with the Company. |

Complaint 1.9.

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Member Organization | PT Susantri Permai (Genting) |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Growers |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Borneo Orangutan Survival Foundation (BOSF) |
| Date filed | 31 March 2017 |
| Nature of complaint | On 14 February 2017, a report published by US News and Indonesian's local News reported that an Orangutan was killed in the concession of PT Susantri Permai / Genting Plantation. BOSF requested the RSPO to suspend the membership of PT Susantri Permai until a socialisation on the endangered species protection to the workers has been conducted. |
| Status | Box C. Panel Convened |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up on the report. |

Complaint 1.10.

| | |
|---------------------|--|
| Member Organization | PT Limpah Sejahtera (a subsidiary of First Resources Ltd (FRI)) |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Grower |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Yayasan International Animal Rescue Indonesia (YIARI) |
| Date filed | 1 May 2010 |
| Nature of complaint | Violation of RSPO P&C 5.2 and P&C 7.3. The company is alleged to have breached: Principle 5: Environmental responsibility and conservation of natural resources and biodiversity Principle 7: Responsible development of new plantings. |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| | The company is alleged to have destroyed Orangutan habitats and not to have carried out an HCV assessment before the development of the plantation. |
| Status | Box F – Action Plan |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the compensation panel. |

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Complaint 1.11. | |
| Member Organization | PT Mitra Austal Sejahtera (Sime Darby subsidiary) |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Growers |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Transformasi untuk Keadilan (TuK) |
| Date filed | 31 October 2012 (under DSF) Transferred from DSF to the CP on 9 June 2017 |
| Nature of complaint | It is alleged that the company is breaching the RSPO P&C: Principle 1 on Transparency, Principle 2 on Compliance with applicable laws and Principle 6 Responsible consideration of employees and individuals and communities affected by growers and mills. The issues filed by the complainant are: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Lack of Transparency on land status and partnership agreements 2. Lack of compliance to our customary land rights 3. The absence of (documented) compensation 4. Lack of compliance to local regulation. |
| Status | Box D. Complaint Legitimate |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to:- <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Share the Company's response with the Complainant. 2. Facilitate a meeting with the Complainant or a tripartite meeting with the Company to understand the bottom line of the negotiation. 3. Initiate a legal review. |

| | |
|------------------------|---|
| Complaint 1.12. | |
| Member Organization | PT Minamas Gemilang (Sime Darby subsidiary) |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Growers |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Mr. Oky Wardianto |
| Date filed | 19 November 2017 |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Nature of complaint | <p>The Complainant is an individual, Mr Oky Wardianto and the allegations are with regards to non-payment of salary to the Complainant in his position as Director and Commissioner. Secretariat to complete the Initial Diagnosis.</p> <p>21 December 2017 (CP Meeting) Initial diagnosis has been completed and we will be sending it to the CPs. The Complainant alleges that he has not been paid his salary as the Director and Commissioner since 2010. On the basis of the allegations, there are potential breaches of the P&C.</p> |
| Status | Box C. Panel Convened |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with both parties for additional information and further response. |

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Complaint 1.13. | |
| Member Organization | Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL) |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Grower |
| Country | Liberia |
| Complainant | Green Advocate for the Butaw Community; FPP; SDI; SESDEV; A-Bloteh |
| Date filed | 2 October 2012 |
| Nature of complaint | <p>Golden Veroleum Liberia:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> i) has not provided public notification for a 30 day period consistent with the New Planting Procedures, ii) y commencing land preparation new planting and infrastructure development prior to the expiry of the minimum 30-day period iii) By not conducting a comprehensive and participatory independent social and environmental impact assessment(s) of the area concerned and incorporate the results into relevant action plans (see RSPO criteria 5.1, 6.1, 7.1 & 7.4) including the identification of: (a) all primary forest, (b) any area required to maintain or enhance one or more High Conservation Values (HCVs), and (d) local peoples' land iv) clearing land without the free, prior and informed consent of the customary land owners as represented through representative organizations of their choice (P&C 2.2, 2.3, 7.5 and 7.6 |
| Status | Box C. Panel Convened. |
| Decision /Justification | CP reviewed the request for stay and it is only to be considered if and when an appeal is submitted. |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

Group 2

| Complaint 2.1. | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Member Organization | PT Permata Hijau Pasaman (PHP) 1 –Wilmar International |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Grower |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | S.H Gampo Alam, <i>Pucuk Adat Nagari Kapa</i> (indigenous leader of Nagari Kapa) as well as Head of <i>Kerapatan Adat Nagari Kapa</i> (KAN – a village/Nagari-level customary institution in Minangkabau which maintains and preserves the Minangkabau customs and culture). Supported by Forest People Programme (FPP) and HuMa (Association for Community and Ecology-Based Law Reform) |
| Date filed | 30 October 2014 |
| Nature of complaint | 1. Complainant seeks clarity of the extent of PT. PHP 1's nucleus estate in Nagari Kapa. 2. Complainant rejects PT. PHP 1's application to the National Land Agency for a HakGuna Usaha (HGU) certificate over the customary (<i>ulayat</i>) land of Nagari Kapa. 3. Violation of RSPO Principles & Criteria 6.2 – community did not participate in decision making on the areas to set aside as HCV areas. 4. Complainant seeks clarification to whom will the land be reverted at the end of the HGU period |
| Status | Box P – Appeal |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the Company on their meeting. |

| Complaint 2.2. | |
|-----------------------|--|
| Member Organization | FELDA Global Venture |
| Membership category | Grower |
| Country | Malaysia |
| Complainant | Article by The Wall Street Journal |
| Date filed | 26 July 2015 |
| Nature of complaint | <i>“Palm-Oil Migrant Workers Tell of Abuses on Malaysian Plantations Global palm-oil industry contributes to human trafficking, rights advocates say”.</i> <i>The palm-oil plantations of Malaysia have become magnets for refugees from Bangladesh and Myanmar. Many have complained of onerous working conditions and few legal protections. (Syed Zain Al-Mahmood/The Wall Street Journal.)</i> |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| | The issues including human trafficking, general poor labour conditions, Use of labour contractors, to exploit illegal immigrants from Bangladesh and Myanmar; Withholding of passports; Poor health care; Pay below minimum wages; Non-payment of wages; Bonded labourers. |
| Status | Box F - Action Plan |
| Decision /Justification | Verification exercise to be carried out in March. |

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Complaint 2.3. | |
| Member Organization | Extractora La Gloria SAS |
| Membership category | Grower |
| Country | Colombia |
| Complainant | Fredy Antonio Corrales, representative of the Colombian Association for Displaced Peoples' Prospects (ASOCOL), Adelfo Segundo Rodríguez, representative of the Association of Returning Displaced Farmers (ASOCADAR), Senator Iván Cepeda, Senator Alberto Castilla, and Representative Alirio Uribe |
| Date filed | 19 November 2015 |
| Nature of complaint | Extractora La Gloria SAS, in planting palm oil in the former Hacienda Bellacruz- today Hacienda La Gloria- occupies 9,000 hectares in the municipalities of La Gloria, Pelaya and Tamalameque, in southern Cesar Department without following RSPO rules. It does not comply with the following RSPO principles (1.1, 2.1, 2.2, 2.3, 4.5, 5.2, 6.4, 6.13) |
| Status | Box F – Action Plan |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the Company for their revised Action Plan. |

| | |
|-----------------------|---|
| Complaint 2.4. | |
| Member Organization | Bumitama Gunajaya Abadi (Bumitama). |
| Membership category | Grower |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Sawit Watch |
| Date filed | 13 November 2015 |
| Nature of complaint | The allegations are: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1) Destroying graves and planting trees surrounding the graves; 2) Dispute on plasma scheme mechanism; 3) Termination of labourers and the status of labourer i.e. are they casual or permanent? |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| | <p>4) Compensation not paid directly to the land owner;</p> <p>5) Loss of land certification and using the land of migrants which is still under control of the owner;</p> <p>6) Criminalisation of Gusti Gelombang, a former Company Public Relation officer and now the Head of Cooperative Body.</p> <p>This case has been handled bilaterally since 2014. It was escalated to RSPO because police came to Sawit Watch's office to arrest Gusti Gelombang, who was in their office at that time.</p> |
| Status | <p>Box G - Closed for Monitoring (for allegation no. 1, 3, 4, & 5)</p> <p>Box D – Complaint Legitimate (for plasma issue, cooperative issue & claim from 15 villagers of Sukajaya and Kinjil)</p> |
| Decision /Justification | To write a final letter to Sawit Watch to respond. |

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Complaint 2.5. | |
| Member Organization | PT Hati Prima Agro |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Growers |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Sawit Watch |
| Date filed | 13 October 2017 |
| Nature of complaint | <p>A complaint was initially lodged in 2012 on allegations related to land matters. It was dismissed in April 2015 when Bumitama said that they were planning to divest the property and no longer had management control. However, in this request for reopening of the complaint, Sawit Watch has made allegations that although Bumitama claimed to have divested the property they continued to have management control. Further, in July 2016 Bumitama had repurchased the concession unit. Thus, the request for reopening is on the basis that Bumitama allegedly made deceptive claims before the Complaints Panel. The Complainants further claim that Bumitama had not submitted NPP despite the land clearance.</p> |
| Status | Box C – Panel Convened |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the Complainants. |

| | |
|-----------------------|--------------------------|
| Complaint 2.6. | |
| Member Organization | PT Bumi Sawit Kencana II |
| Membership category | Palm Oil Grower |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Community of Kapuk Village & NGO Progress |
| Date filed | 22 July 2016 |
| Nature of complaint | Community of Kapuk Village demanded the company to give the compensation on 78 Ha land owned by the Farmers Group |
| Status | Box C – Panel Convened |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to proceed with the signing of the NDA in order to obtain the relevant documents from the Company. |

Complaint 2.7.

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Member Organization | Palmas Del Espino SA |
| Membership category | Palm Oil Grower |
| Country | Peru |
| Complainant | FREDEIALBA |
| Date filed | 4 July 2017 |
| Nature of complaint | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. The company and their group member developing the plantation without proper NPP process; b. Developing plantation without informing the local communities; c. The company has failed to comply with national law on the forest conversion; d. Mistreatment of employees including arbitrary dismissal; e. New plantings established without EIA and HCV assessment. |
| Status | Box A. Complaint received |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the Company for updates. |

Complaint 2.8.

| | |
|---------------------|---|
| Member Organization | Western Pacific Oil |
| Membership category | Supply Chain Associate |
| Country | USA |
| Complainant | MOI Foods USA Inc |
| Date filed | 17 March 2017 |
| Nature of complaint | Western Pacific Oils claimed that they are purchasing MB shortening from MOI Foods. MOI Foods clarified that WPO is not their supplier. |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Status | Box A. Complaint received |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the Complainant for a response. |

Complaint 2.9.

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Member Organization | Felda Global Venture Holding Berhad |
| Membership category | Palm Oil Grower |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Chain Reaction |
| Date filed | 19 April 2017 |
| Nature of complaint | There was a report issued by Chain Reaction which informed the fact of FGV in Kalimantan's concession had cleared 1600 Ha peat forest. On 25 th April 2017 Secretariat had a meeting with FGV and they claimed that they only planted on less than 100 Ha on a shallow depth. |
| Status | Box A. Complaint received |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the Company for clarification. |

Complaint 2.10.

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Member Organization | Sarana Esa Cita (Musim Mas) |
| Membership category | Palm Oil Grower |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | M. Ali Napiah |
| Date filed | 6 October 2017 |
| Nature of complaint | The allegations relate to land claims. However, this is also a closed case. The case was closed for lack of evidence on 3 December 2015. Both the complainants and allegations are similar in nature. |
| Status | Box C. Panel Convened |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the Complainant within the timeline to get a confirmation on the resolution of the case via bilateral negotiation. |

Complaint 2.11.

| | |
|---------------------|-------------------------|
| Member Organization | Aceites S.A |
| Membership category | Palm Oil Grower |
| Country | Maria la Baja, Columbia |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Complainant | Confidential |
| Date filed | 11 August 2017 |
| Nature of complaint | One of ACEITES mills is allegedly purchasing its FFB from an operation run by Mrs. Alva Yiseth Villamizar Navas in the Maria la Baja area since May 2016. Alva Navas is allegedly collecting FFB from palm growers who accepted her offer of paying them below the market price, without invoices and also offered to harvest the fruit for them. Further, she also made several trucks available to transport the FFB from the field to the collection site. It is also alleged that she buys fruits from anyone, regardless of their ownership. Due to this, people started stealing fruit in the area, because she purchases fruit regardless of its origin, collecting the fruit without any type of sanitary control and with staff hired outside the rules laid down by the Ministry of Labor. The vehicles that collect the fruit do so during the night, a time when restrictions apply on mobility imposed by the City Hall. The FFB has been transferred to the mills located in the department of Magdalena, belonging to Aceites S.A and Palma Aceite. |
| Status | Box C. Panel Convened |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the Company and CB and notify ASI. |

Group 3

| | |
|-----------------------|--|
| Complaint 3.1. | |
| Member Organization | PT London Sumatra (Lonsum) |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Grower |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Community of Desa Pergulaan via Sawit Watch |
| Date filed | 7 April 2009 |
| Nature of complaint | The following points were raised by the community of Desa Pergulaan: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Legality of the extension of the concession and demands for the return of land totaling 165.6 ha. 2. The status of the law suit filed by 5 of the residents which are 'out-of-time' (compensation paid in 1971). 3. The legality of the security drains to prevent access. 4. Prohibiting cattle herding in the plantation. 5. The non-employment of residents of Desa Pergulaan in the plantation. 6. Failure by Lonsum to carry out Corporate Social Responsibility programs as promised. |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| | 7. No complaint letters have been addressed to Lonsum directly. 8. Status of residents on the Police 'Wanted List'. |
| Status | Box E – Reviewing Response |
| Decision /Justification | CP to proceed with the decision letter after getting legal opinion. |

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Complaint 3.2. | |
| Member Organization | PT PP London Sumatra/IndoAgri |
| Membership category | Growers |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Rainforest Action Network (RAN), ILRF, OPPIK Indonesia |
| Date filed | 12 October 2016 |
| Nature of complaint | A report published by RAN, OPPIK, and ILRF titled, " <u><i>The Human Cost of Conflict Palm Oil: Indofood, PepsiCo's Hidden Link to Worker Exploitation in Indonesia.</i></u> " The report reveals the findings of field investigations and worker interviews completed on two palm oil plantations owned and operated RSPO member and Indofood subsidiary PT London Sumatra. The full report available at ran.org/indofood . |
| Status | Box C – Panel Convened |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the Complainants and Company with the plans for verification. |

| | |
|-----------------------|--|
| Complaint 3.3. | |
| Member Organization | PT Kartika Prima Cipta/ Golden Agri Resource (GAR) |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Grower |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Forest People Programme (FPP) and Transformasi untuk Keadilan (TUK) Indonesia |
| Date filed | 14 October 2014 |
| Nature of complaint | Points raised : 1. PT. KPC is in persistent violation of the RSPO P&C pertaining to HCV assessment, the recognition of customary land rights and free, prior, and informed consent (FPIC). Lack of FPIC of the local Dayak and Malay people during the acquisition of the land. 2. The land was acquired without a land tenure study and participatory mapping. 3. Late HCV assessment which was done by Institute Pertanian Bogor, final consultation was in May 2014. 4. Dissatisfaction among smallholders and resentment because of reduced land set aside for plasma compared to HCV areas. 5. The land has been set aside as HCS area that made no provision for customary land |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| | uses and tenure and local peoples' livelihood. 6. GAR as the parent company of all 18 subsidiaries listed is acting in violation of the New Planting Procedures (NPP) by submitting information which it knows is false. No HGU exists in 16 of the 18 concessions where NPP was submitted. |
| Status | Box E - Reviewing Response |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat tasked to respond to the Parties to the Complaints. |

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Complaint 3.4. | |
| Member Organization | PT Kartika Prima Cipta |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Growers |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Link-Ar Borneo |
| Date filed | 18 December 2016 |
| Nature of complaint | Specific Findings: 1. Land Claim by 1 community member of Nanga Suhaid, Mr. Saudi; 2. Land compensation claim by 1 community member of Nanga Suhaid, H. Kutai; 3. Water Pollution in the Kapuas river which is affecting the fish farmers' business production; 2. Conflict between residents and Village Head of Tanjung regarding water quality; 3. Conflict between residents and Village head of Emperiang regarding the land acquisition process. |
| Status | Box C. Panel Convened |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the Complainant. |

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Complaint 3.5. | |
| Member Organization | Poligrow Colombia |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Grower |
| Country | Colombia |
| Complainant | Environmental Investigation Agency |
| Date filed | 13 August 2015 |
| Nature of complaint | The Italian-owned Poligrow Ltd has prohibited the Jiw and Sikuani indigenous communities from freedom of movement. The EIA's video alleged abuses by RSPO's Italian member in Colombia |
| Status | Box D – Complaints Legitimate |
| Decision /Justification | CP's comments on the Action Plan to be sent to the Company. |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

| Complaint 3.6. | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Member Organization | PT Nabire Baru |
| Membership category | Palm Oil Grower |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Yayasan PUSAKA |
| Date filed | 19 April 2016 |
| Nature of complaint | Allegations: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Deforestation which causing severe flood in Village Sima 2. Irregularities including development without EIA 3. Land grabbing of the Indigenous people 4. Failure in following proper FPIC process 5. Excessive use of force and violence using of state security forces |
| Status | Box D – Complaint Legitimate |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to send the CRU report for translation and the CP to review the findings of the pre-assessment. |

| Complaint 3.7. | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Member Organization | Goodhope Asia Holdings |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Growers |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | RSPO Secretariat |
| Date filed | 19 April 2017 |
| Nature of complaint | FPP and the other NGOs sent a complaint to the BoG on the fact that Goodhope had insisted that their NPP be posted for public consultation despite the Secretariat's finding that the HCV Assessment was not satisfactory. The complainants had also questioned the role of the Secretariat in acting in accordance to GA 12 Resolution 6(H). |
| Status | Box F. Action Plan |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to wait for feedback from Technical Department. |

| Complaint 3.8. | |
|-----------------------|--------------------|
| Member Organization | PT Hari Sawit Jaya |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Growers |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Konsulat cabang Federasi Serikat Pekerja metal Indonesia (FSPMI) Selabuhanbatu Raya |
| Date filed | 25 September 2017 |
| Nature of complaint | The allegations are: a. the worker force to bring wife and children as helper/ gerdang to help the worker to reach the target as a harvester; b. impositions of penalties on the worker. This matter was queried by the worker, but the management failed to give satisfactory explanations; c. The absent machine for the workers was broken, it has impact on the payroll; d. Bonus deductions; e. Discrimination of the casual workers; |
| Status | Box C. Panel Convened |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the Complainant and check the status of the allegation and get the workers statements. |

Complaint 3.9.

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Member Organization | PT Nubika Jaya |
| Membership category | Supply chain and mill |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | Masyarakat Peduli Lingkungan Hidup (MPLH) |
| Date filed | 3 October 2017 |
| Nature of complaint | The complainant informed that the company has dumped waste into rivers. During rainy seasons, the river overflowed and inundated residents' houses. The complainant stated the company have failed to implement the agreement from 2015. |
| Status | Box C. Panel Convened |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the Company. |

Complaint 3.10.

| | |
|---------------------|---|
| Member Organization | PT Sawit Nabati Agro/ PT Sukses Karya Sawit/ PT Berkat Nabati Sawit/ PT Bumi Sawit Sejahtera (IOI Group) – Ketapang |
| Membership category | Oil Palm Growers |
| Country | Indonesia |
| Complainant | AidEnvironment |

COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

For Website

21 February 2018 | 3.30pm – 6.00pm | Meeting No. 2/2018

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37th floor Menara UOA, Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia*

| | |
|-------------------------|---|
| Date filed | 3 April 2015 |
| Nature of complaint | Issues raised by AidEnvironment: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> a. 10,000 ha of planting without permit (IUP). b. Encroachment into the forest sanctuary. c. IOI has cleared the land without submitting NPP. |
| Status | Box F – Action Plan. |
| Decision /Justification | Secretariat to follow up with the team of verification on the draft report. |

| | |
|-------------------------|--|
| Complaint 3.11. | |
| Member Organization | IOI Pelita / IOI |
| Membership category | Palm Oil Grower |
| Country | Malaysia |
| Complainant | Community of Long Teran Kanan |
| Date filed | 10 March 2010 Transferred from DSF to Complaints Panel on 17 January 2017 |
| Nature of complaint | Infringement of P&C No.2.2 – the right to land use disputed |
| Status | Box F – Action Plan |
| Decision /Justification | CP to grant extension until end of March for the revised timeline. CP to also respond to the queries from the Parties. |