

Minutes of Meeting

RSPO Communications & Claims Standing Committee (C&C SC)

Date: 11 May 2017

Venue: Ahold-Delhaize

Time: 10am – 4:30pm

ATTENDANCE LIST

Stakeholder Group	Members	Organization	Email
Consumer Goods Manufacturer	Jan Kees Vis (JKV)	Unilever	Jan-Kees.Vis@unilever.com
Consumer Goods Manufacturer	Marinella Giacobbe (MG)	Ferrero	marinella.giacobbe@ferrero.com
Processor/Trader	Eddy Esselink (EE)	MVO	esselink@mvo.nl
Consumer Goods Manufacturer	Chris Sayner (CS)	CRODA	chris.sayner@croda.com
Industry Association	Jelmen Haaze (JH)	IMACE	Jelmen.Haaze@imace.org
Retailer	Laura Jungmann (LJ)	Ahold	laura.jungmann@ahold.com
Service provider	Paula den Hartog	UTZ	paula.denhartog@utz.org
Service provider	Aleyda Carrillo Bustamente	UTZ	aleyda.carrillo@utz.org
Processor/ Trader	Judith Murdoch (JM)	AAK	Judith.Murdoch@aak.com
Environmental NGO	Emma Keller (EK)	WWF UK	Ekeller@wwf.org.uk
RSPO Secretariat	Stefano Savi (SS)	RSPO Secretariat	stefano.savi@rspo.org
RSPO Secretariat	Danielle Morley (DM)	RSPO Secretariat	danielle@rspo.org
RSPO Secretariat	Fay Richards (FR)	RSPO Secretariat	fay.richards@rspo.org
RSPO Secretariat	Inke van der Sluijs (IVDS)	RSPO	inke@rspo.org

Welcome

Apologies from Chris Sayner, Emma Keller and Jelmen Haaze as they are running late

Minutes

Part I

Last Committee Minutes Actions

SS:

1. Chinese Market study with CNFA due by end of May
2. ACOP updates online
3. Need another grower on the committee. No response from Sime Darby

DM: No update from Nordic Swan

IVDS: Premalatha Mogan missing from last meeting minutes. Amends made.

1. RSPO P&C Review Update (SS)

1.1. P&C Taskforce composition and process: all members should be updated by their representative on the board.

1.2. First taskforce meeting 23-25 May KL

1.3. Three meetings in 2017 and 1 more in 2018, plus public consultation

1.4. Communications team will keep SC update on headline developments.

JKV: Steering Group only become involved when process becomes stuck. Myself and EE are on the steering group

SS: Facilitators appointed for process and Proforest will facilitate the technical part.

2. RSPO Global Updates (SS)

2.1. Media Coverage

2.1.1. First Certification for RSPO NEXT by Daabon Group in Colombia. Very well received in Latin America and internationally (Oils & Fats technical coverage). 122 Smallholders included in this certification.

PDH – PalmTrace is ready to offer RSPO NEXT credits on the platform

2.1.2. Ecuador takes steps toward jurisdictional approach. Good news again for LatAm. Darrel Webber signed the agreement w. Minister of Agriculture and Ministry of Fisheries. RSPO positioned as innovator and facilitator. Jurisdictional approaches are also taking place in Sabah and Kalimantan. Aim to have updates on RSPO.org. Looking next to Africa

2.2. Social Media

2.2.1. Seeing peaks corresponding to news coverage e.g. Impacts Report, GSB Debate, Friends of Europe Deforestation event. Overall growth on platforms.

2.2.2. Stakeholder Mapping on social media to identify new influential followers to support response to criticism, increase awareness, create positive news and change.

2.3. ACOP – closes 19 May. Please remind your colleagues and networks as soon as possible. Some issues with 'My RSPO' section on website however these have been dealt with swiftly.

LJ - Serbia is missing countries options on ACOP submission forms.

2.4. Malaysian Updates

- 2.4.1. RSPO Roadshow in Malaysia to address misconception around RSPO and opportunity for members to share expertise.
- 2.4.2. Malaysia Sustainable Business Forum – held in joint effort with WWF Malaysia. Raise awareness and responsibility of Corporate Malaysia's role.
- 2.4.3. Media Briefing – in correspondence with roadshow. Avenue to clarify position of RSPO. Realised there was confusion regarding the EU PO Resolution and RSPO's response. Growing countries did not support the resolution and there was misunderstanding that RSPO was in full support of the resolution.
JVK – there is general lack of understanding in Europe too.

2.5. Indonesian Updates

- 2.5.1. Roadshow to 11 universities to find young ambassadors to promote PO issues and sustainability
- 2.5.2. Press Circle 4 – multi-stakeholder discussion with key representatives
- 2.5.3. Press Circle 5 – Partnership between BOS Foundation and PT Sawit Sumbermas Sarana. School for orangutans. Seen as a local solution to local challenge. RSPO received positive coverage, positioned as facilitator and contributor.
- 2.5.4. Multi-stakeholder dialogue held with ELSAM to address Human Rights
- 2.5.5. IMPACT Training – Organised by ELSAM in February and April to utilize local communities to protect human rights.
- 2.5.6. Four Roadshows for members; Riau, East Kalimantan, South Sumatera, Central Kalimantan. Good to see that addressing complaints directly with local communities has paid off.

MG: Good initiative for local uptake and awareness. Q: Is focus on physical supply and other different certification levels, or just RSPO as organisation and mission?

SS: Focus was on standard and human rights. How stakeholders can contribute to the process. A lot of work to be done in terms of local positioning, especially alongside other certification such as ISPO. Demand discussed but rather on 'lack of' than type of demand.

JM: Human rights big issue in EU and particularly in UK post Modern Day Slavery Act. Businesses nervous.

JKV: Bonn Challenge Initiative in Indonesia, are you aware?

SS: Yes. Event in Asia

2.6. China Updates

- 2.6.1. Increasing in new members – working with Master Kong's towards membership, they are a major user.
- 2.6.2. Increasing Certification – SinoGrain will certify all 3 facilities
- 2.6.3. CFNA Working Meetings – aim to deliver a PO supply chain mapping study by end of May. Good outcome.

2.7. India Updates

- 2.7.1. Participated in the FICCI Conference for Sustainable Business

- 2.7.2. RSPO spoke at Chemspec India
- 2.7.3. INDUS Forum – RSPO participated to facilitate trade and investment with Netherlands.
- 2.7.4. Times of India – media partnership to discuss sustainability but especially in terms of PO. Alike to GSB media partnership.

2.8. US & Canada Update

- 2.8.1. Recruited new large volume members including Dunkin Brands
- 2.8.2. Presented to ICAO delegates on the RPSO RED scheme and viability of PO for biofuels. Current use is minimal. We are monitoring.
- 2.8.3. First official North American Meeting will be held at the EURT – informal start to national initiative for N.Am.

LJ: How is RSPO dealing with food service chain of custody requirements for brands like Dunkin and McDonalds?

JM: Clear that food service companies are not becoming certified or members. HQs have tight control over procurement. Plan for UK visit with Dan Strechay and Jan van Driel to understand a food service HQ and audit process. Could provide footprint for how to proceed.

LJ: Is process being brought to Trade and Traceability SC?

JM: Hope to bring to committee in June.

2.9. Complaints Cases Updates

- 2.9.1. Complaints panel decision communicated to Woolworths – to remove product list and limit corporate claim. Review use of claims or to consider moving to individual claims. Woolworths very willing to meet decision. Complainant happy with response.

- 2.9.2. In future, RSPO may set up a taskforce outside C&C if size of such cases increases.

- 2.9.3. Complaints panel decision communicated to Coles and complainant. Discussion has been collaborative and how they deal with claims.

JM: Both cases highlight that members are struggling with rules. Is there an easier communication or helping hand RSPO can offer to members who consider going on pack with claims? Members can send their artwork 'for approval' but this is off-putting.

IVDS: Agree. Complicated also for auditors and how to use the trademark. Both do not understand the rules. Staff are confused.

MG: Why not use the ACOP data to send relevant segment of Claims rules to the member. E.g. If they buy MB then send section on MB. Targeted and proactive communication. Positive influence.

JM & MG: Good way to promote RSPO NEXT, 'we see you're eligible for RSPO NEXT'

JVK: Should we benchmark claims rules with other certification schemes?

DM: We could communicate more visually

JM: How do we get TM used more often?

IVDS: Products in market making claim without TM.

LJ: Sometimes not clear e.g. use of 'sustainable palm oil'

2.10. RSPO Credits Merchandise

2.10.1. Request from member to use 'supports Sustainable palm oil' on merchandise where there is no palm oil used. We are looking into whether we can sell merchandise to support smallholders. Each sale would equal value of sale of a credit. Merchandise (caps, t-shirts) could reference specific smallholder – carry credit claim and NGO supporting logos – by way of demonstrating their support for CSPO?

2.10.2. Claims can be made anywhere including 'marketing materials'. Could merchandise qualify as marketing materials for claims?

2.10.3. B&C is vital for those who do not have access to mill e.g. smallholders. Can they communicate their support (a claim) in other way such as on merchandise?

JVK: You cannot support something if ingredient not in the product. Talk to tax lawyers in Switzerland, this is commercial activity which needs to come under a different entity

SS: Our rules do not prevent a company from doing this. WWF do something similar.

EK: WWF has a separate shop. I can share how this works.

EE: Will it fly? Who would want to wear?

PDH: This will influence market price.

JVK: What is trade price volume? Nice enough concept. Outsource and think about it. Test online if there is an interest.

DM: Are there any reputational risks?

EK: Who would wear?

SS: 20-30 year olds, interested in sustainability

IVDS: Plantation companies are already printing t-shirts. Is this okay?

JM: Part of bigger conversation about consumer engagement and how they will respond. Where does it sit with businesses? Supporting smallholders is important and they want to do this.

JKV: Claims rules need to change to say claim of support must be on products containing CSPO. You would not be able to audit otherwise. Any merchandise needs ethical outsourcing.

DM: Needs working up and to be part of bigger picture

SS: Key question today is can materials not containing CSPO make a marketing 'support CSPO' claim on product?

JVK: Check with lawyers.

MG: I don't see the link between merchandise and credit. But it is an opportunity to make trademark more well known. E.g. Branded merchandise 'Look for RSPO logo' at events or available on website; promotional PR activity

ACB: Be clear, what you are selling? You would not buy multiple credits.

SS: To clarify RSPO would not sell t-shirts. A company would do so.

DM: It would be hard to police this.

JVK: You would need new rules for this type of relationship. This is a franchise operation alien to T&T.

EE: Not for T&T now. Needs to have a clearer worked out plan.

Part II

3. European Updates (DM)

3.1. France: French Alliance developing partnerships with CIRAD on SALSA platform.

3.1.1. RSPO continues to be proactive. RSPO will participate in a working group.

3.1.2. Huffington Post France rejected proposal for media partnership. Do not want to cover palm oil at all.

3.2. Italy

3.2.1. 5 Star Movement policing the debate

3.2.2. Hoping to sign a Huffington Post Italy partnership.

MG: they are more to 5 Star movement so this will be good.

DM: Risk worth taking and opportunity to engage with stakeholders and media

3.3. Nordics

3.3.1. Website platform launched on SPO in Sweden

3.3.2. Fair Finance Watch in Sweden & Norway, negative coverage on banks for funding deforestation

3.3.3. Denmark: is quiet. Needs proactive engagement in this region.

3.4. Poland

3.4.1. Constraints: very little political debate on the issues outside PL. Media shows little interest. Only Intl. NGOs in PL are showing interest. Limited and therefore unlikely to see the drivers.

3.4.2. Opportunities: there has been a public debate on double standards in food production so interest raised briefly.

- PO seen as a cheap ingredient. This is a hook of engagement for RSPO.
- Some growth in conscious consumers interest
- Big cosmetics exporter
- Food sector is very important

IVDS: Suggestion from PL FDA that retailers phasing PO out

JM: I am attending a conference 23 May in PL with CGMs and retailers. We can coordinate outreach.

EE: There is some resistance with FDA there.

3.4.3. Support needed to engage and develop action plan: JM, CS, EE & EK.

3.5. Spain

3.5.1. Spanish Sustainable Palm Oil Alliance is close to forming. There are some legal hold ups.

EE: Nutritional issues in the media. They see need to act within Europe.

MG: Some retailers want to remove PO from branded products. Situation is a bit difficult.

LJ: Increasing queries about PO claims and health threat. 'No palm oil' product selling much better in this market.

EE: SP Govt. is important. Ministry of Economic Affairs NL and SP govt trying to get on board.

IVDS: We will host a small meeting in Spain

JH: Belgian Ministry of Energy and Sustainable Development to take to Spain to sign Amsterdam Declaration

EE: Fair to wait until the initiative gets going before we begin.

3.6. Reputational Analysis: November 2016 – February 2017

- 3.6.1. Abnormally high profile from series of mainstream coverage which suppresses impact of GSB partnership
- 3.6.2. 16x more profile in this 4month period compared to whole previous year. From various topics related to PO – child labour expose, sourcing issues, Nutella, HSBC. Global/English language content.
- 3.6.3. Top Themes: Nutella, Cancer, Complaints, IOI Group, and Suspensions
- 3.6.4. Top Influencers: Amnesty International; The Guardian, Mongabay, FT, BBC, and Reuters.

3.7. EU Media Monitoring

- 3.7.1. Significantly greater coverage due to EU PO Resolution
- 3.7.2. More attention on financial sector's role in PO industry after Greenpeace report 'Dirty Bankers'
- 3.7.3. Increasing coverage in Switzerland, Spain and Sweden.
- 3.7.4. Recommendations to use EURT and P&C review to reconnect with EU stakeholders. Remind media about RSPO NEXT as voluntary addition.
- 3.7.5. EU media covered Indonesian and Malaysian reactions to EU PO resolution. We need to monitor how RSPO is represented in these stories.
- 3.7.6. Careful management of expectations required
- 3.7.7. EU PO Resolution briefing re-shared.
 - 3.7.7.1. Single Certification scheme has hit producing countries hardest and they are very concerned. MEPs thought one label for PO would be helpful for the consumer.

IVDS: Growers are very unhappy and we need to be clear what our position is.

JH: Grower govts. felt that this was EU is taking over and it is neo-colonial

DM: We support it as a commitment to increase uptake of SPO but remain neutral regarding schemes, and think that it is must be part of a global, inclusive approach.

JH / JKV: This is not legislation.

MG: Producing countries also seeing as commercial war because of resolution's sustainable sourcing recommendations e.g. favouring 'EU Vegetable oil', point 82 & 83 in resolution

JKV: Malaysian politicians likely promote MSPO over other oils, is EU promotion therefore bad?

JM: More concerned about politicians' health concerns and 'no palm oil' reactions.

SS: In today's political landscape, soundbites can be very dangerous. Our position is that this is an opportunity for all producing countries and certification schemes.

JH: It was a multilateral approach and we should continue to be involved. The resolution is a constructive start of the debate.

DM: Now up to commission to take over and facilitate multilateral dialogue. Should we take a role as a neutral facilitator also?

JH: There already is an international consensus on SDGs, COP21 etc. with concrete targets. Can certification schemes be used as a measure for these international targets? We have the same goals.

JM: Yet media telling 'getting out of palm oil'/boycott stories. Producing countries stirred up further by the public debate.

JH: Difficult meeting with GAPKI IPOA meeting earlier today due to perception that this is about trade barriers rather than SDGs. Also concerns about RSPO position.

DM: Will follow up bi-laterally with producer country embassies in Brussels.

3.7.7.2. Next steps: DM to meet one-to-one with major producing country embassies. Happy to share edits to the resolution in interest of transparency. Need to review next communication very carefully.

JM: There should be an opportunity for multilateral and international meeting and sharing.

DM: Julie Girling MEP to attend EURT for an address. International Trade Committee to visit Indonesia next week on Free Trade Delegation with Indonesian Government. They are yet to confirm which plantation but will be RSPO and we want to include ISPOA

3.8. EURT 2017

3.8.1. Registrations are 100% ahead on registrations compared to same period last year and we have expanded breakout sessions to meet demand.

3.8.2. Dame Frances Cairncross to give keynote address on financial institutions' involvement and shared responsibility to increase uptake CSPO. Feel free to suggest topics.

3.9. AOB

3.9.1. RT15 will be w/c 27 November 2017 in Bali

3.9.2. Smallholder Platform: part of new smallholder strategy. It is a platform to advertise ongoing projects that are in the process to becoming certified and that need support from upstream members

3.9.3. T&T approved ToR, waiting for BoG approvals

3.9.4. RSPO RED – in renewal process

3.9.5. PalmTrace – Credits trading on & offline. Physical sales have gone up. BoG asked T&T to develop system to monitor volumes along the supply chain. Very difficult to produce reliable analysis on trends based on data available.

3.9.6. Mid-September Meeting – Thursday 14th September, London. 10:30am start

3.9.7. JM – something needs to be addressed about move to 'no palm oil'

DM: perhaps we need a discussion paper. To discuss in next meeting.

3.9.8. P&C Review outreach required from all please.

Summary of Actions

Section 1

(2.3) RSPO/SS to follow up on grower membership for the C&C SC.

Section 2

(2.3) RSPO/SS to follow up on country listings on ACOP form. Serbia is missing as an option.

(2.9) SS will share Complaints Panel decision letters to Woolworths and Coles with C&C once they are public.

(2.9) Trademark Usage

RSPO/IVDS to revisit with CBs on use of trademark as part of their training

RSPO/SS to communicate to members after ACOP which claims rules apply to them based on purchased supply

(2.10) SS to review proposal for claims rules for merchandise which does not contain PO but makes 'support CSPO' claim.

Actions Section 3

(3.4) RSPO/DM to coordinate an action plan for Polish outreach with JM, EE, EK, CS.

(3.7) JH and DM to strategize next steps post EU Palm Oil resolution and coordinate embassy visits.

THANKS & ENDS