

COMPLAINTS PANEL

MINUTES OF MEETING

For Website

24 March 2021 | 5.00pm - 7.50pm | Meeting No. 03/2021

Meeting location: Jakarta Conference Room, RSPO Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia & via Zoom Link

List of					
Complaints	1. Henry Barlow (Chair - CCP)	7. Peter van der Werf (PVDW)			
Panel Member	2. Lim Sian Choo (LSC - Co Chair)	8. José den Toom (JDT)			
	3. Michelle Desilets (MD)	9. Robert Kruger (RK)			
	4. Matthias Diemer (MDM)	10. Priya Gopalan (PG)			
	5. Marieke Leegwater (ML)	11. Fakri Karim (FK)			
	6. Lanash Thanda (LT)				
Agenda	General Agenda:5.00pm to 5.40p	om			
	Opening Remarks by Chairperson				
	2. Declaration of Conflict of Interest				
	3. To confirm and adopt the minutes of 24 February 2021 during the CP Meeting				
	4. New Allegations:-				
	4.1 RSPO/2021/03/LSL - Nestlé	S.A.			
	4.2 RSPO/2021/04/EN - First R				
	Bukit U	Estate & PT Damai Nusa Sekawan - Sosa & Udang Estate (a subsidiary of Permata Hijau			
	Group 4.4 RSPO/2021/06/SW - PT Ine	cda (a subsidiary of S&G Biofuel Pte. Ltd)			
	4.5 RSPO/2021/07/SW - PT. Mit	cra Karya Sentosa (a subsidiary of First			
	5. Complaints Case Statistics.				
	6. Complaints Panel meeting Dates6.1 Dates for CP monthly me6.2 Dates for CP Physical Mee6.3 Expansion of the Complain	etings			

Minutes of the Complaints Panel Meeting 24 March 2021



- 7. Collaboration with the Investigation & Monitoring Unit (IMU)
 - 7.1 FELDA Global Venture (Article by The Wall Street Journal)
 - 7.2 PT Temila Agro Abadi subsidiary of FGV (Article by Chain Reaction Research)
 - 7.3 Poligrow Colombia SAS
 - 7.4 PT Permata Hijau Sawit Kebun Papaso (subsidiary of Permata Hijau Group)
- 8. Dispute Settlement Facility (DSF)
- 9. Commitment of Financial Institutions.
- 10. GA Resolution GA15-6d: Discouraging RSPO members subject to complaints from avoiding their obligations by divesting or withdrawing their membership.
- 11. Any Other Matters





12. Complaints for deliberation:-

Group 1:- 5.40pm to 6.20pm

- 1. FELDA vs Orang Dusun Lahad Datu (Desa Begahak/Robin Balud)
- 2. Hap Seng Plantations Holdings Bhd vs Sia Yi Chin
- 3. PT. Mitra Austral Sejahtera (PT. MAS) subsidiary of Sime Darby vs Transformasi untuk Keadilan (TuK-NGO)
- 4. Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL) vs. Green Advocate for the Butaw Community & Forest Peoples Programme & SDI & SESDev & A-Bloteh
- 5. HSA Group (Pacific Inter Link, Pacific Oils & Fats Industries Sdn Bhd, PT Pacific Indopalm Industries, PT. Pacific Medan Industri, PT. Pacific Palmindo Industri) vs Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA) & Greenpeace
- 6. Pacific Inter-Link (Papuan Concessions) vs Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA) & Greenpeace
- 7. PT Buana Wira Lestari vs requested for confidentiality
- 8. PT Wahana Prima Sejati (subsidiary of First Resources) vs requested for confidentiality
- 9. PT Nabire Baru and PT Sariwana Adi Perkasa (subsidiary Goodhope Asia Holdings Ltd) vs Awasmifee, Greenpeace & FPP





Group 2:- 6.25pm to 7.15pm

- 1. Extractora La Gloria S.A.S. vs ASOCOL & ASOCADAR
- 2. PT. Hati Prima Agro (PT. HPA) subsidiary of Bumitama vs Sawit Watch
- 3. Golden Agri Resources (GAR) vs Forest Peoples Programme & TuK Indonesia
- 4. Presco PLC Nigeria (SIAT SA) vs requested for confidentiality
- 5. PT. Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO) vs Koalisi Organisasi Serikat Pekerja dan Lembaga Swadaya Masyarakat Kabupaten Labuhan Batu, FSMI. TIPAN-RI
- 6. PT. Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO) vs requested for confidentiality
- 7. PT. Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO) vs Federasi Serikat Pekerja Metal Indonesia (FSPMI)
- 8. PT Musim Mas Holding Pte Ltd vs requested for confidentiality
- 9. Palmaceite S.A.vs requested for confidentiality
- 10. Agroaceite S.A. vs requested for confidentiality
- 11. Pabrik Kelapa Sawit Batang Kulim POM & Pabrik Kelapa Sawit Pangkalan Lesung POM (subsidiary of PT Musim Mas) vs KC FSPMI
- 12. PT Agro Kati Lama subsidiary of SIPEF group vs requested for confidentiality
- 13. PT Agrowiratama (a subsidiary of Musim Mas Holdings Pte. Ltd.) vs Tim Advokasi Dewan Pengurus Pusat Komite Nasional Pemuda Indonesia (DPP KNPI) on behalf of 4 Datuak (Batuah, Bonsu, Sati, and Malenggang) of customary community in Muara Kiawai, Pasaman Barat.





Group 3:- 7.15pm to 7.50pm

- 1. PT. Kartika Prima Cipta (PT. KPC) subsidiary of Golden Agri Resources (GAR) vs Forest Peoples Programme & TuK Indonesia
- 2. Goodhope Asia Holdings Ltd vs RSPO Secretariat
- 3. IOI Pelita subsidiary of IOI Group vs Community of Long Teran Kanan
- 4. Primatama Mulia Jaya vs Masyarakat Adat Luhak Saparampek Simpang Tigo
- 5. Oleaginosas Del Peru S.A. (OLPESA) vs requested for confidentiality
- 6. Golden Agri Resources (GAR) vs Forest Peoples Programme & Elk Hills Foundation
- 7. Aceites Y Derivados Sociedad Anonima (ACEYDESA) vs requested for confidentiality
- 8. Benso Oil Palm Plantation (subsidiary of Wilmar International Limited) vs Mrs. Joseph Yankey & Mr Solomon Asante-Sefa
- 9. IOI Plantation Mekassar Estate (subsidiary of IOI Corporation Berhad) vs requested for confidentiality
- 10. PT Nubika Jaya (subsidiary of Permata Hijau Group) vs LSM-Baris Labuhanbatu Selatan
- 11. Palmas y Trabajo S.A.S; Progreso Palmero S.A.S and Oleaginosas de Yuma S.A.S (Daabon Group) vs Puerto Wilches Section Sintrainagro Deputy Director's Office





DETAILS OF THE AGENDA:

Agenda
Opening Remarks from Chairperson
Opening speech by CCP.
Declaration of "No Conflict of Interest"
No further conflict of interest declared at this time of the meeting.
To confirm and adopt the minutes of 24 February 2021 during the Complaints Panel Meeting.
Minutes of 24 February 2021 adopted.





4. New allegation submitted

4.1

RSPO/2021/03/LSL	Nestlé S.A.	
Complainant	Malaysian Palm Oil Association	
Complaint received	3 February 2021	
Location	Switzerland	
Allegations	"no palm oil" claim on label	

Discussion from 24 February 2021 (CP Meeting):-

- 1. Both parties have reached an amicable and satisfactory resolution through an engagement process between Nestle Malaysia, Nestle Global and MPOA.
- 2. The Secretariat will be writing to the parties to inform the outcome of the CP's directive following the "letter of withdrawal" made by the Complainant in view of the abovementioned amicable resolution.
- 3. This Complaint will not be processed further and is to be removed from the agenda moving forward.

4.2

RSPO/2021/04/EN	First Resources Limited	
Complainant	requested for confidentiality	
Complaint received	8 March 2021	
Location	Indonesia	
Allegations	 The Respondent has formal ownership relation, control and influence of Fangiono Agro Plantation (FAP) Agri; The Respondent has formal ownership relation, control and influence of Ciliandry Anky Abadi (CAA) - a business entity under Sima Capital registered in the British Virgin Islands; The Respondent should be held accountable for the violation of the RSPO principles and criteria committed by FAP and CAA; The Respondent is violating its own NDPE Commitments and the RSPO Code of Conduct and the RSPO membership rules. 	





Discussion from 24 March 2021 (CP Meeting):-

1. The Initial Diagnosis is in progress.

4.3

RSPO/2021/05/SW	Papaso Estate & PT Damai Nusa Sekawan - Sosa & Bukit Udang Estate (a subsidiary of Permata Hijau Group)		
Complainant	requested for confidentiality		
Complaint received	19 March 2021		
Location	Indonesia		
Allegations	 The Respondent prohibits the workers to conduct union activities; The Respondent deducts the workers' payment due to their activities in the union; The Respondent has employed some of the workers as daily casual workers for more than 3 (three) years; and The Respondent did not socialise Company Regulations (Peraturan Perusahaan) to the workers. 		

Discussion from 24 March 2021 (CP Meeting):-

1. The Initial Diagnosis is in progress.

4.4

RSPO/2021/06/SW	PT Inecda (a subsidiary of S&G Biofuel Pte. Ltd)		
Complainant	requested for confidentiality		
Complaint received	19 March 2021		
Location	Indonesia		
Allegations	 The Respondent used a community's land without consent from the local community; The Respondent never conduct Corporate Social Responsibility activities to the local community; The Respondent did not develop the plasma plantations as agreed 		





	•	upon with the community; The Respondent does not have an effective internal grievance mechanism that is accessible to the Community, therefore the Complainant has no information regarding the way to send any complaint to the Respondent; and The Respondent has never resolved disputes and never conducted any participatory mapping on the disputed land.
--	---	---

Discussion from 24 March 2021 (CP Meeting):-

1. The Initial Diagnosis is in progress.

4.5

RSPO/2021/07/SW	PT. Mitra Karya Sentosa (a subsidiary of First Resources Limited)		
Complainant	requested for confidentiality		
Complaint received	19 March 2021		
Location	Indonesia		
Allegations	 The Respondent did not pay the full land compensation to the six (6) individuals; The Respondent unilaterally marking up the cost of plasma development and did not refer to the relevant regulations in deciding the cost of plasma development; The Respondent did not pay the land compensation for the land identified as HCV and HCS area; and The Respondent did not provide the complete map along with its coordinates for the land that has been handed over by the six (6) individuals. 		

Discussion from 24 March 2021 (CP Meeting):-

1. The Initial Diagnosis is in progress.





5. Complaints Cases Statistics

Total Cases in 2020

	Jan-2020	Feb-2020	Mar-2020	Apr-2020
Complaints received	2	1	3	1
Status	Open (0) Rejected (1) Closed (1)	Open (1)	Open (2) Closed (1)	Open (1)
Country	Malaysia (1) Indonesia (1)	Indonesia (1)	Indonesia (2) Colombia (1)	Honduras (1)
Case Category	-Invasion of main access road (1) -Wage, safety (1)	- Land fires - River Pollution - Planting onPeat	- Illegal permit (1) - convicted for Bribery (1) - Water Pollution(2) - Breached CoC (1)	

	May 2020	Jun 2020	Jul 2020	Aug 2020
Complaints received	0	3	2	2
Status	-	Open (0) Rejected (2) Closed (1)	Open (2)	Open (2) Rejected (1)
Country	-	Indonesia (3)	Guatemala (1) Indonesia (1)	Indonesia (2)
Case Category	-	-Workers unjustifiably dismissed -Social Benefits -Infringement of copyright - no adequate health,housing facilities	- River Pollution - Deforestation) -endangered wildlife -Breach of P&C	-Unfair dismissal /termination - no adequate health,housing facilities - illegal control and use of land





	Sept-2020	Oct-2020	Nov-2020	Dec-2020
Complaints received	2	2	1	-
Status	Open (2)	Open (1) Rejected (1)	Open (1)	-
Country	Colombia (1) Indonesia (1)	Colombia (1) Malaysia (1)	Indonesia (1)	-
Case Category	-Occupational hazard (1) - NPP (1)	-Breach of CoC -Human Rights violation -Fake pay slip	-Water pollution -Processing FFB from non-RSPO certified plantations	-

Total Cases in 2021

	Jan-2021	Feb-2021	Mar-2021	Apr-2021
Complaints received	2	1	4	-
Status	Open (2)	Open (1)	Open (4)	-
Country	Indonesia (2)	Switzerland (1)	Indonesia (4)	-
Case Category	-Operating without having a HGU -Labour Issues	-"no palm oil" claim	-prohibits the workers to conduct union activities -FPIC -HCV and HCS area	-

Total Active Cases by Country and Year (as of 19.03.2021)

Country	Active Cases	Year	Active Cases





Indonesia	23
Malaysia	4
Colombia	3
Nigeria	1
Peru	1
Brazil	1
Liberia	1
Guatemala	1
Ghana	1
Cayman Island	1
Honduras	1
Switzerland	1
TOTAL	38

2010	1
2012	1
2014	1
2015	3
2017	3
2018	5
2019	5
2020	12
2021	7
TOTAL	38

- 6. Complaints Panel Meeting Dates
- 6.1 Dates for Complaints Panel monthly meetings





Discussion fro	m 24 March	2021	(CP Mee	ting):-
-----------------------	------------	------	---------	---------

1. The Secretariat has proposed the new dates for the upcoming CP meetings, (July 2021 up to December 2021).

6.2 Dates for Complaints Panel Physical Meetings in 2020

Discussion from 24 March 2021 (CP Meeting):-

1. The CP quarterly meeting has been scheduled for 29.03.2021 from 3pm to 5.30 pm.

6.3 Expansion of Complaints Panel

Discussion from 24 March 2021 (CP Meeting):-

1. Pending response from the proposed candidate.

7. Collaboration with the Investigation & Monitoring Unit (IMU)

7.1 FELDA Global Venture - (Article by The Wall Street Journal)

Discussion from 24 February 2021 (CP Meeting):

1. The final part of the audit process will take place at the end of the month in Sabah and the Secretariat's representative will witness the audit.

7.2

PT Temila Agro Abadi - subsidiary of FGV - (Article by Chain Reaction Research)

Discussion from 24 March 2021 (CP Meeting):-

1. The GIS and Climate Change teams are currently reviewing the remediation plan submitted by FGV.

7.3 Poligrow Colombia SAS





Discussion from 24 March 2021 (CP Meeting):-

- 1. The Grievance Unit has reached out to the Compliance unit on the requirement of the CP's decision in terms of the Certification process.
- 2. The Compliance Unit shall communicate the requirements of the CP's directive to the Certification Body which the Respondent's action plans and the management plans are to be reviewed during the next surveillance audit.

7.4 PT Permata Hijau Sawit Kebun Papaso (subsidiary of Permata Hijau Group)

Discussion from 24 March 2021 (CP Meeting):-

1. The IMU had coordinated with the Respondent requesting additional supporting evidence.

8. Dispute Settlement Facility (DSF)

Discussion from 24 March 2021 (CP Meeting):-

1. The series of DSF webinars are ongoing.

9. Commitments of Financial Institution(s)

Discussion from 24 March 2021 (CP Meeting):-

- 1. The 1st FI group meeting was held early 2021.
- 10. GA Resolution GA15-6d Discouraging RSPO members subject to complaints from avoiding their obligations by divesting or withdrawing their membership





Discussion from 24 March 2021 (CP Meeting)	D	iscussion	from 2	24	March	2021	(CP Meeting)
--	---	-----------	--------	----	-------	------	--------------

1. Status quo and no further updates.

12. Any Other Matters

a) ASC-CP MEETING

Discussion from 24 March 2021 (CP Meeting):-

1. The ASC-CP meeting has been tentatively scheduled to be on 20.4.2021

COMPLAINTS FOR DELIBERATION: GROUP 1

Complaint 1.1 FELDA vs Orang Dusun Lahad Datu (Desa Begahak/Robin Balud)





Case Reference	PreCAP/2015/05/PR		
Date Filed	16 February 2015		
Respondent	FELDA (Federal Land Development Authority) (Felda Ventures Bhd)		
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower		
Country	Malaysia		
Complainant	Orang Dusun Lahad Datu (Desa Begahak/Robin Balud)		
Nature of Complaint	 According to the Enquiry National Hak Tanah Malaysia document, the state government had given 1260 acres of land to the Dusun Begahak community in 1981. At the same time, the same land was alienated to FELDA for development. The complainant raised the issue that FELDA has no right to develop their land and should return it to the community because the land originally belonged to the community. The complainant also stated that the cemetery area is being developed by FELDA. FELDA enclaved 916 acres of the said land and gave it back to the community. The community planted fruits and other crops on the land. A police report has been made by the community and that is the source of the complaint. 		
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation		
Decision / Justification	 Status quo. Pending outcome of the appeal before the Sabah Lands and Surveys Department (SLSD). The Secretariat will reach out with the Respondent on this matter. 		

Complaint 1.2 Hap	Seng Plantations Holdings Bhd vs Sia Yi Chin
Case Reference	PreCAP/2015/36/PR





Date Filed	24 November 2015
Respondent	Hap Seng Plantations Holdings Bhd
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Sia Yi Chin of Lahad Datu, Sabah
Complaint description	 The complainant is claiming that Hap Seng Plantations Bhd is illegally occupying his property (River Estates) of 6,454 acres in Lahad Datu, Sabah. He says that he is the beneficial owner of the said land and the land office in Kota Kinabalu has confirmed that the said land is still in his name as beneficial owner. He has filed a civil suit against Hap Seng; originating summons: BKI-24-127/5 of 2012 filed on 30.07.2015.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	 Case adjourned. Pending outcome of the Court process. Interim Briefing Note has been furnished to the CP. Pending deliberation and endorsement from the CP members.

Complaint 1.3 PT. Mitra Austral Sejahtera (Sime Darby) vs NGO TuK	
Case Reference	PreCAP/2012/06/PR
Date Filed	31 October 2012 (Under DSF) 9 June 2017 (Transferred to the CP)





Respondent	PT Mitra Austral Sejahtera (Sime Darby subsidiary)		
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower		
Country	Indonesia		
Complainant	Transformasi untuk Keadilan (TuK)		
Complaint description	 The communities of Sanggau have alleged that the company PT Mitra Austral Sejahtera is operating without: Lack of Transparency on land status and partnership agreements; Lack of compliance to our customary land rights; The absence of (documented) compensation; Lack of compliance to local regulations; In acting so they are alleged to have breached RSPO Principles and Criteria specifically on: Principle 1 on Transparency, Principle 2 on Compliance with applicable laws and Principle 6 Responsible consideration of employees and individuals and communities affected by growers and mills. 		
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation		
Decision / Justification	1. Briefing Note in process.		

Complaint 1.4 Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL) vs. Green Advocate for the Butaw Community; FPP; SDI; SESDev; A-Bloteh	
Case Reference	PreCAP/2012/09/PR
Date Filed	3 October 2012
Respondent	Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL)





Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Liberia
Complainant	Green Advocate for the Butaw Community; FPP; SDI; SESDev; A-Bloteh
Complaint description	 Golden Veroleum Liberia: has not provided public notification for a 30 day period consistent with the New Planting Procedures; commencing land preparation new planting and infrastructure development prior to the expiry of the minimum 30-day period; By not conducting a comprehensive and participatory independent social and environmental impact assessment(s) of the area concerned and incorporate the results into relevant action plans (see RSPO criteria 5.1, 6.1, 7.1 & 7.4) including the identification of: (a) all primary forest, (b) any area required to maintain or enhance one or more High Conservation Values (HCVs), and (d) local peoples' land; Clearing land without the free, prior and informed consent of the customary land owners as represented through representative organizations of their choice (P&C 2.2, 2.3, 7.5 and 7.6).
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	 Tarjuowon Area The participatory mapping process which is ongoing as part of the implementation of the CP's decision. Other Areas Secretariat is to write to the Parties on the selection of candidates.

Complaint 1.5	HSA Group (Pacific Inter-Link, Pacific Oils & Fats Industries Sdn Bhd, PT. Pacific Indopalm Industries, PT. Pacific Medan Industri, PT. Pacific Palmindo Industri) vs Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA) & Greenpeace
Case Reference	RSPO/2018/18/RB
Date Filed	15 October 2018





Respondent	HSA Group (Pacific Inter-Link, Pacific Oils & Fats Industries Sdn Bhd, PT. Pacific Indopalm Industries, PT. Pacific Medan Industri, PT. Pacific Palmindo Industri)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Cayman Island
Complainant	Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA) & Greenpeace
Complaint description	Breach of Code of Conduct - violation of the RSPO Group Membership rules. All the companies (stated above) are alleged to be part of the Hayel Saeed Anam (HSA) Group, but still registered as separate RSPO members.
Status	(I) Appeals deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The Appeal process is ongoing.

	acific Inter-Link (Papuan Concessions) vs Environmental Investigation gency (EIA) & Greenpeace
Case Reference	RSPO/2018/19/RB
Date Filed	15 October 2018
Respondent	Pacific Inter-Link (Papuan Concessions)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower





Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA) & Greenpeace
Complaint description	Violation of the RSPO Code of Conduct because of their alleged involvement in the control/ownership and operational development of four palm oil plantation companies in Papua.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	 The membership unit has commenced their due diligence and furnished the initial findings. Pending receipt of the due diligence process full report.

Complaint 1.7 PT Buana Wira Lestari vs requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2019/21/SW
Date Filed	29 October 2019
Respondent	PT Buana Wira Lestari
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower





Country	Indonesia
Complainant	requested for confidentiality
Complaint description	 The Respondent planted oil palm trees outside the HGU and planted oil palm trees at the edge of the river which resulted in damage to the watershed. The Respondent is polluting the river water and also the surrounding community settlement caused by the liquid waste from the palm oil mills. The Respondent never watered the road traversed by its FFB and CPO transport trucks which affected the health of the community of two villages due to dust pollution. The Respondent mill's chimney emits black smoke and causes air pollution. The Respondent did not provide proper social assistance to the local community.
Status	(G) Decision delivered with period to appeal (60 WD)
Decision / Justification	1. Pending expiry of the appeals period on 20 April 2021.

Complaint 1.8	PT Wahana Prima Sejati (subsidiary of First Resources Limited) vs requested for confidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2020/12/EN
Date Filed	14 July 2020
Respondent	PT Wahana Prima Sejati (subsidiary of First Resources Limited)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower





Country	Indonesia
Complainant	requested for confidentiality
Complaint description	 Deforestation and land clearing including in the High Conservation Value Forest within the Respondent's concession for construction; Development of road cutting across one of the major wildlife corridors connecting two river systems – Berenga and Tempadung Rivers; and Development of a jetty, which includes reclamation of the sea floor as long as 590 meters
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The Secretariat will furnish CP with revised interim measures for endorsement.

Complaint 1.9	PT Nabire Baru and PT Adi Perkasa (subsidiary of Goodhope Asia Holdings Ltd) vs Awasmifee, Greenpeace and Forest Peoples Programme - (Indonesia)
Case Reference	RSPO/2020/17/SW
Date Filed	18 September 2020
Respondent	PT Nabire Baru and PT Sariwana Adi Perkasa (subsidiary of Goodhope Asia Holdings Ltd)





Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Awasmifee, Greenpeace & FPP
Complaint description	The Complaint was lodged as a result of the comments that have been given by the Complainant during the Respondent's NPP consultation period have not been resolved. The allegations as below: "that the Respondent withheld two important documents which should have been made available to stakeholders under the RSPO principle on transparency. The documents are the original draft of the 2011 HCV assessment and the Respondent's legal review commissioned by the RSPO Secretariat."
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	The Secretariat is in the midst of collating the responses from both parties to be submitted to the CP for a directive.

GROUP 2

Complaint 2.1 Extractora de La Gloria SAS vs ASOCOL, ASOCADAR	
Case Reference	PreCAP/2015/35/PR
Date Filed	19 November 2015
Respondent	Extractora de la Gloria SAS
Membership	Oil Palm Grower





Category	
Country	Colombia
Complainant	Fredy Antonio Corrales, representative of the Colombian Association for Displaced Peoples' Prospects (ASOCOL), Adelfo Segundo Rodríguez, representative of the Association of Returning Displaced Farmers (ASOCADAR), Senator Iván Cepeda, Senator Alberto Castilla, and Representative Alirio Uribe
Complaint description	Extractora La Gloria SAS, in planting palm oil in the former Hacienda Bellacruztoday Hacienda La Gloria- occupies 9,000 hectares in the municipalities of La Gloria, Pelaya and Tamalameque, in the southern Cesar Department without following RSPO rules. It does not comply with the following RSPO principles: Principle 1.1. Given that it does not provide clear and sufficient information regarding the Business Group. Principle 2.1. The Business Group has not declared itself to Colombian authorities and the crops were planted without an Environmental Management Plan for the Forest Reserve, which goes against national business and environmental regulations. Principle 2.2. Property ownership claims in the areas where Extractora La Gloria grows the majority of its crops have been called into question at national and international judicial bodies. Farming communities have demanded the formalization of their customary land rights, which were violently denied by paramilitary groups. Principle 2.3. Business operations have not recognized the rights of farmers who are also displacement victims, in contravention of businesses' duty to guarantee free, prior and informed consent regarding land use. Principle 4.4. While installing and processing palm crops, Extractora La Gloria affected the Caño Alonso Forest Reserve Buffer Zone and the Singararé, El Carmen and Simaña streams. Principle 5.2. The company has not avoided damaging the Caño Alonso Forest Reserve Buffer Zone, a specially protected habitat such as installing palm crops over the Reserve's environmental buffer zone. Principle 6.4. The company has neglected the claimants, despite the fact that they have been the most affected by its business activities. The company has also refused to create negotiation platforms. Principle 6.13. The company has benefited from grave human rights violations of vulnerable farmers, who were also forcefully displaced by illegal armed actors. The company has not publicly rejected the threats and intimidations against the claimants. It
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The draft decision letter will be furnished to the CP.





Complaint 2.2 PT. Hati Prima Agro (PT.HPA - Bumitama) vs Sawit Watch	
Case Reference	RSPO/2017/06/SW
Date Filed	13 October 2017
Respondent	PT Hati Prima Agro (subsidiary of Bumitama)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Sawit Watch
Complaint description	 A complaint was initially lodged in 2012 on allegations related to land matters. It was dismissed in April 2015 when Bumitama said that they were planning to divest the property and no longer had management control. However, in this request for reopening of the complaint, the complainant (Sawit Watch, EIA, and Greenpeace) has made allegations that although Bumitama claimed to have divested the property they continued to have management control. Further, in July 2016 Bumitama had repurchased the concession unit. Thus, the request for reopening is on the basis that Bumitama allegedly made deceptive claims before the Complaints Panel. The Complainants further claim that Bumitama had not submitted NPP despite the land clearance.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	 The draft chronology is still being finalised and will be furnished to the CP members.

Complaint 2.3 Golden Agri Resources vs Forest Peoples Programme (FPP) & TuK	
Case Reference	RSPO/2018/14/IR
Date Filed	22 August 2018
Respondent	Golden Agri Resources
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia





Complainant	Forest Peoples Programme (FPP) and Tuk- Indonesia
Complaint description	GAR's shadow companies are actively clearing lands.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	The Secretariat is to draft a response to the Respondent.

Complaint 2.4 Presco PLC Nigeria (SIAT SA) vs requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2018/17/PR
Date Filed	17 September 2018
Respondent	Presco PLC Nigeria (SIAT SA)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Nigeria





Complainant	requested for confidentiality
Complaint description	• For the past five years, PRESCO, in conjunction with the Edo State Government, through its Ministry of Agriculture and Natural Resources; the Police in Benin City, Edo State; and the Nigeria Army's 4th Brigade (also located in Benin City, Edo State), has been forcefully encroaching into ancestral and customarily owned indigenous farm lands, including Oruarivie-Abraka ancestral farm lands, situated in Delta State (a neighbouring State to Edo State, where PRESCO's Head Office is located), and forcefully evicting local farmers from these ancestral and customarily owned indigenous farm lands measuring approximately three thousand hectares (well beyond the Edo State boundaries), and forcefully and illegally grabbing same for its palm oil plantation expansionist activities.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	 The Secretariat takes note that the Mediator has fallen ill and that has halted the progress of the Mediation. The Secretariat will be seeking updates from the parties so as to enable the CP to decide on the next directive.

Complaint 2.5	PT Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO) vs Koalisi Organisasi Serikat Pekerja dan Lembaga Swadaya Masyarakat Kabupaten Labuhan Batu, FSMI. TIPAN-RIPT
Case Reference	RSPO/2019/07/IR
Date Filed	10 April 2019
Respondent	PT Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	North Sumatera, Indonesia





Complainant	Koalisi Organisasi Serikat Pekerja dan Lembaga Swadaya Masyarakat Kabupaten Labuhan Batu, FSMI. TIPAN-RI
Complaint description	 Lack of adequate health and safety equipment; Worker died due to lack of safety equipment; and No festive holidays for temporary workers.
Status	(D) Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	The Secretariat has received the feedback from the CB and midst of reviewing the report.

Complaint 2.6 PT Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO) vs requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2019/11/IR
Date Filed	23 April 2019
Respondent	PT Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	North Sumatera, Indonesia
Complainant	requested for confidentiality





Complaint description	 Temporary workers contract and wages issues; Intimidation of workers
Status	(D) Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	The Secretariat has received the feedback from the CB and midst of reviewing the report.

•	T Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO) vs Federasi Serikat Pekerja Metal Indonesia (FSPMI)
Case Reference	RSPO/2019/12/IR
Date Filed	6 May 2019
Respondent	PT Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	North Sumatra, Indonesia
Complainant	Federasi Serikat Pekerja Metal Indonesia (FSPMI)
Complaint description	 Alleged fraud of wages for 7 workers, No festive holidays and bonus for temporary workers
Status	(D) Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	 The Secretariat has received the feedback from the CB and midst of reviewing the report.

Complaint 2.8 PT Musim Mas Holdings Pte Ltd vs requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2020/03/EN
Date Filed	11 February 2020
Respondent	PT Musim Mas Holding Pte Ltd
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	requested for confidentiality





24 March 2021

Complaint description	 Land fires occurred in the conservation area within the PT MusimMas HGU covering an area of 12 hectares; Damaging the river by damming the river flow; Community owned plantation and public cemetery are not enclaved; Planting on peatland and in protected areas of river banks.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. Pending receipt of the special audit report from the CB.

Complaint 2.9 Palmaceite S.A vs requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2020/05/HN
Date Filed	24 March 2020
Respondent	Palmaceite S.A.
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Colombia
Complainant	requested for confidentiality





Complaint description	• The Respondent has allegedly failed to fulfill the agreement with the Complainant to implement and monitor the operations of the Complainant's plantation which led to the collapse of the production within the plantation.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	 The CB is compiling the investigation findings into a report and will furnish to the Secretariat in due course.

Complaint 2.10 Agroaceite S.A. vs requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2020/11/HN
Date Filed	6 July 2020
Respondent	Agroaceite, S.A.
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Guatemala
Complainant	requested for confidentiality





Complaint Description	 The Complainant alleges that the Respondent has destroyed the biodiversity of the Manchón Guamuchal nature reserve, a coastal-marine wetland, located along the Pacific coast of Guatemala in the San Marcos and Retalhuleu department; The Respondent allegedly discharged immense quantities of toxic chemicals and hazardous waste which affected the local marine species, the mangrove's ecosystem and the local community.
Status	(D) Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	 Pending receipt of the special audit report from the CB. The Secretariat has sent reminder emails to the CB on 01.03.2021, 12.03.2021 and 18.03.2021.

•	Pabrik Kelapa Sawit Batang Kulim POM & Pabrik Kelapa Sawit POM (subsidiary of PT Musim Mas) vs KC FSPMI - Indonesia
Case Reference	RSPO/2020/13/EN
Date Filed	5 August 2020
Respondent	Pabrik Kelapa Sawit Batang Kulim POM & Pabrik Kelapa Sawit Pangkalan Lesung POM (subsidiary of PT. Musim Mas)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia





Complainant	KC FSPMI
Complaint Description	 Unauthorised Company Regulations; Flat rate overtime premium; Copy of the Collective Bargaining Agreement is not furnished to the workers; Workers working night shift is not provided with extra food; Inadequate and unsanitary worker's housing; Daily casual workers are not provided with a written employment agreement; Daily casual workers are not provided with Employment security (BPJS Ketenagakerjaan) cards; Complicated healthcare insurance (BPJS Kesehatan) and paid sick day processes; Unfair dismissal/termination for unjustified reason such as participating in union activities; Limitation of worker's right to organize outside the established independent/non-affiliated trade union.
Status	(D) Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. Pending receipt of the special audit report from the CB.

Complaint 2.12 PT Agro Kati Lama (subsidiary of SIPEF group) vs requested for confidentiality - Indonesia	
Case Reference	RSPO/2021/01/EN
Date Filed	22 January 2021
Respondent	PT Agro Kati Lama (subsidiary of SIPEF group)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	requested for confidentiality





Complaint Description	 The daily casual workers are paid below the minimum wage set out by the Musi Rawas District Government; The daily casual workers are not protected and no remedy available for work accidents; The daily casual workers are not equipped with personal protection equipment [PPE] and are not equipped with working tools; The daily casual workers did not receive festive allowance in accordance with the regulation; The daily casual workers, who are hired through the third party, do not get a pay slip. The amount written in the payment receipt is without formal stamp and without the name of the party who rendered the payment.
Status	(D) Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	 The Secretariat received a request from the Complainant for an extension of time to respond to the formal acceptance of the letter. The Respondent is agreeable on either Bilateral Engagement or DSF mediation process.

Complaint 2.13 PT Agrowiratama (a subsidiary of Musim Mas Holdings Pte. Ltd) vs Tim Advokasi DPPKNPI - Indonesia	
Case Reference	RSPO/2021/02/SW
Date Filed	27 January 2021
Respondent	PT Agrowiratama (a subsidiary of Musim Mas Holdings Pte. Ltd.)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Tim Advokasi Dewan Pengurus Pusat Komite Nasional Pemuda Indonesia (DPP KNPI) on behalf of 4 Datuak (Batuah, Bonsu, Sati, and Malenggang) of customary





	community in Muara Kiawai, Pasaman Barat.
Complaint Description	 Operating in the protected forest area without having a license from the Ministry of Forestry; Operating without having a HGU; and Did not develop plasma plantations for the community as agreed
Status	(D) Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	 The Complaint is accepted as a formal complaint and both parties have been informed of the same. The Respondent has requested for an extension of time to respond to the allegations. Both parties to respond by 06.04.2021 whether they intend to opt for the BE or the DSF mediation process.

GROUP 3

Complaint 3.1 PT. Kartika Prima Cipta (GAR) vs Forest Peoples Programme & TuK	
Case Reference	PreCAP/2014/03/IR
Date Filed	13 October 2014
Respondent	PT. Kartika Prima Cipta (PT.KPC) - Golden Agri Resources (GAR)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia – Kapuas Hulu, West Kalimantan
Complainant	Forest Peoples Programme (FPP) and (Transformasi untuk Keadilan) TuK Indonesia
Complaint	Points raised:-





description	 PT KPC is in persistent violation of the RSPO P&C pertaining HCV assessment, the recognition of customary land rights and free, prior, and informed consent (FPIC). Lack of FPIC of the local Dayak and Malay people in the process of land take over. Land takeover was done without land tenure study and participatory mapping. Late HCV assessment which was done by IPB, final consultation was in May 2014. Dissatisfaction by smallholders and resentment because of reduced post facto set aside for HCV rather than getting plasma scheme (20%). Set aside land as HCS area that made no provision for customary land uses and tenure and local people livelihood. GAR as the parent company of all 18 subsidiaries listed in acting in violation of the New Planting Procedure (NPP) by submitting information which is known as false. No HGU in 16 of 18 NPP. The assessors which have endorsed GAR's HCV assessment, ESIAs and social engagement actions, are in violation of their responsibility to provide impartial assessment of company compliance with RSPO P&C.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	 Complaints Panel deliberated on matters presented. Secretariat to continue working on the remaining phases.

Complaint 3.2 Goodhope Asia Holdings vs RSPO Secretariat	
Case Reference	PreCAP/2017/06/SW
Date Filed	19 April 2017
Respondent	Goodhope Asia Holdings
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	RSPO Secretariat (Following Joint Comment by FPP, Greenpeace, EIA and PUSAKA on the NPP Posting of PT Nabire Baru / Goodhope)





Complaint description	 Note: FPP and the other NGOs also sent a complaint to the BoG on the fact that Goodhope had insisted that their NPP be posted for public consultation despite the Secretariat's finding that the HCV Assessment was not satisfactory. They had also questioned the role of the Secretariat in acting in accordance to GA 12 Resolution 6(H).
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The Secretariat is preparing the Briefing Note for CP's final decision.

Complaint 3.3 IOI Pelita (IOI Group) vs Community of Long Teran Kanan	
Case Reference	PreCAP/2010/01/PR
Date Filed	15 March 2010 Transferred back from DSF to Complaints Panel on 17 January 2017
Respondent	IOI Pelita (IOI Group)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Sarawak, Malaysia
Complainant	Community of Long Teran Kanan
Complaint	Infringement of P&C No.2.2 – the right to land use disputed.





description	
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	 The Respondent has agreed to excise approximately 5000 ha of land. The first round of negotiations with the communities will take place in April 2021 and has extended an invitation to the Secretariat to send a representative to be physically present at the negotiation stage or witness via zoom.

Complaint 3.4 PT. Primatama Mulia Jaya v Masyarakat Adat Luhak	
Case Reference	RSPO/2018/12/SW
Date Filed	12 July 2018
Respondent	PT Primatama Mulia Jaya (subsidiary of Wilmar International)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Masyarakat Adat Luhak Saparampek Simpang Tigo
Complaint description	The issuance of Right of Utilization of the Respondent issued without prior information to the Complainant





Status	(G) Decision delivered with period to appeal (60 WD)
Decision / Justification	 The CP's decision letter was furnished to both parties. Pending expiry of the appeals period on 4 June 2021.

Complaint 3.5 Oleaginosas Del Peru S.A (OLPESA) vs requested for confidentiality	
Case Reference	RSPO/2019/05/PR
Date Filed	22 March 2019
Respondent	Oleaginosas Del Peru S.A. (OLPESA)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Peru
Complainant	requested for confidentiality
Complaint description	 Sourcing FFB from unsustainable origin. Failure to conduct SIA.
Status	(G) Decision delivered with period to appeal (60 WD)





Decision / Justification	1. Pending expiry of appeals period on 28.05.2021.	
-----------------------------	--	--

•	Golden Agri Resources (GAR) vs Forest Peoples Programme & Elk Hills Foundation
Case Reference	RSPO/2020/04/IR
Date Filed	2 March 2020
Respondent	Golden Agri Resource (GAR)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Forest Peoples Programme & Elk Hills Foundation
Complaint description	 The Respondent, through its subsidiaries located in Central Kalimantan, operate its plantations with permits which never had the force of law; The Respondent, through its employees have been involved in the payment of bribes to provincial officials in Central Kalimantan.





Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	 The draft ToR for the review has been shared with both the Complainants and Respondent. The Complainant has reverted back with their comments and is currently being reviewed by the Secretariat. Pending response from the Respondent's comments.

•	ceites Y Derivados Sociedad Anonima (ACEYDESA) vs requested for onfidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2020/07/LSL
Date Filed	6 April 2020
Respondent	Aceites Y Derivados Sociedad Anonima (ACEYDESA)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Honduras
Complainant	requested for confidentiality
Complaint description	Modification of property deeds to remove areas identified by the government as environmental protection zone;





24 March 2021

	 Employees not paid minimum wage; not provided with equipment; and not given workers' benefits; Non-compliance with labour laws; Threatening of workers to suppress information from auditors; Bribing workers and government agencies; Manipulation of scale systems; Falsification of data; Operating without an environmental license.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. Pending receipt of the special audit report from the CB.

Complaint 3.8	Benso Oil Palm Plantations (subsidiary of Wilmar International Limited) vs Mrs Joseph Yankey & Mr Solomon Asante-Sefa
Case Reference	RSPO/2020/15/LSL
Date Filed	25 August 2020
Respondent	Benso Oil Palm Plantation (subsidiary of Wilmar International Limited)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Ghana
Complainant	Mrs. Joseph Yankey & Mr Solomon Asante-Sefa
Complaint description	 The Respondent has acquired land to develop oil palm in Ghana; The Respondent has destroyed farmers' rubber plantation; The Respondent is not willing to pay for the damages caused to the rubber





	 farmers; The Respondent is still cutting down rubber farms to plant oil palm; The remaining uncultivated lands have been taken over for the Respondent's project; The Respondent has shown no interest in resolving these issues despite several Complaints made to the Respondent by the Complainants.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	 The Bilateral Engagement process is ongoing with a deadline expiring on 01.04.2021. The Secretariat will be writing to both parties if an extension of time is required to complete the Bilateral Engagement process.

•	OI Plantation Mekassar Estate (subsidiary of IOI Corporation Berhad) vs requested for confidentiality
Case Reference	RSPO/2020/19/IR
Date Filed	5 October 2020
Respondent	IOI Plantation Mekassar Estate (subsidiary of IOI Corporation Berhad)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	requested for confidentiality
Complaint	Unilateral pay cut by the Respondent





description	 Poor living conditions for the labourers Intimidation of workers Forced labour Lack of transparent grievance system
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. CP to come to a decision on the involvement of CB.

•	PT Nubika Jaya (subsidiary of Permata Hijau Group) vs LSM-Baris abuhanbatu Selatan - Indonesia
Case Reference	RSPO/2020/20/SW
Date Filed	12 November 2020
Respondent	PT Nubika Jaya (subsidiary of Permata Hijau Group)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	LSM-Baris Labuhanbatu Selatan
Complaint description	 No Domestic Wastewater Treatment Plant; The Oleochemical equalization pool was not built with concrete; Sludge from the Oleochemical Wastewater Treatment Plant has never been





	 transported to a designated waste processing agency. Dispose of liquid waste without permit; Inconsistency on the volume of Hazardous Waste transported to a designated waste processing agency; A sparring equipment has yet installed at the Wastewater Treatment Plant; No certified Wastewater Treatment Operational Responsible and Water Pollution Control Officer onsite; Processing fresh fruit bunches from non-RSPO certified plantations.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. Bilateral Engagement process is ongoing between both parties.

Complaint 3.11 Palmas y Trabajo S.A.S; Progreso Palmero S.A.S and Oleaginosas de Yuma S.A.S (Subsidiary of Daabon Group) - Colombia - (Adjourned)	
Case Reference	RSPO/2020/16/LSL
Date Filed	10 September 2020
Respondent	Palmas y Trabajo S.A.S; Progreso Palmero S.A.S and Oleaginosas de Yuma S.A.S (subsidiary of Daabon Group)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Colombia
Complainant	Puerto Wilches Section Sintrainagro Deputy Director's Office
Complaint description	 Non-compliance with labour rights/laws; Anti-union practices; and Employees not provided sufficient protection equipment.



Minutes of the Complaints Panel Meeting 24 March 2021



Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. This Complaint is adjourned pending the outcome of the proceedings before the Ministry of Labour.