

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

15 April 2015 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 4/2015

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

### GENERAL MEETING AGENDA

#### List of Complaint Panel members

Melizel Asuncion (Verite), Henry Barlow (Affiliate Member), Michelle Desilets (Orangutan Land Trust), Matthias Diemer (WWF Switzerland), Bambang Dwilaksono (First Resources), Marieke Leegwater (Solidaridad), Sabarinah Marzuki (Sime Darby), John Payne (Borneo Rhino Alliance), Nina Roth (UBS AG), Olivier Tichit (Sipef), Torben Venning (Borneo Child Aid), Tom Mclaughlin (Woolworths)

#### 3.30pm-4pm

1. Opening Remarks by Chairperson
2. Declaration of Conflict of Interest
3. To confirm and adopt the minutes of the 17 March 2015 Complaints Panel Meeting
4. New Complaints
5. Monthly Update: List of Complaints
6. Any other matter
7. Golden Veroleum Liberia

#### Group 1: 4pm-4.30pm

1. PT Ladang Sawit Mas (LSM) /Bumitama Agri Ltd
2. PT Nabatindo Karya Utama (NKU) / PT Andalan Sukses Makmur (ASMR) /Bumitama Agri Ltd
3. PT Hati Prima Agro - Bumitama a Agri Ltd (BGA)
4. Genting Plantation Bhd (GPB)
5. PT Limpah Sejahtera (First Resources Ltd)
6. PT Borneo Surya Mining Jaya (First Resources Ltd)
7. Orang Dusun Lahad Datu/ FELDA

#### Group 2: 4.30pm-5pm

8. PT Sisirau/Ibris Palm Group
9. PT Permata Hijau Pasaman (PHP) 1 (Wilmar International)
10. Equatorial Palm Oil

#### Group 3: 5.00-5.30pm

11. PT London Sumatra (Lonsum)
12. Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL)
13. PT Kartika Prima Cipta/ Golden Agri Resource (GAR)
14. PT WINA Nabati/ Wilmar
15. PT Barumon Agro Sentosa

# COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

15 April 2015 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 4/2015

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

<p><b>Agenda item</b></p>
<p><b>1. Opening Remarks by Chairperson</b></p> <p>The Chair opened the meeting by welcoming everybody and then invited everyone to scrutinize the minutes of the previous meeting.</p>
<p><b>2. “No Conflict of Interest”</b></p> <p>All the members of the complaints panel declared that they have no conflict of interest for the complaint cases they were reviewing.</p>
<p><b>3. Minutes of the meeting of 17 March 2015</b></p> <p>The minutes of the meeting were adopted and confirmed by the members unanimously.</p>
<p><b>4. New Complaints</b></p> <p><b>1. WALHI/PT Indo Sawit Kekal Cargill – received on 6 April 2015</b></p> <p>The NPP submission, listed a representative of WALHI during the public consultation. But WALHI have complained to RSPO saying that the said representative never represented WALHI at that time and that RSPO was negligent in allowing the publication of the NPP. WALHI says that they are not a RSPO member and by publishing their name in the NPP report, it implies that they are supporting the expansion of oil palm development. This is contrary to their official policy of not supporting oil palm expansion. WALHI is demanding an apology from RSPO.</p> <p>Update: Awaiting confirmation from PT Indo Sawit Kekal Cargill.</p> <p>Status: Box A</p> <p><b>2. PT Gunung Melayu (Asian Agri) – received on 2 March 2015</b></p> <p>In Sumatera: Kelompok Tani/Farmer Group Ujung Masehi alleged that PT Gunung Melayu has taken over their land (68.5 hectares) without compensation in Asahan, North Sumatra. The Secretariat has received clarification from the member, PT Gunung Melayu.</p> <p>Update: Awaiting response from Kelompok Tani/Farm Group Ujung Masehi community.</p> <p>Status: Box A</p> <p><b>3. PT Nubika Jaya (Permata Hijau Group/PHG) –received on 16 February 2015</b></p> <p>In Sumatera: Masyarakat Peduli Lingkungan Hidup Labusel (MPLH) alleged that PT Nubika Jaya has polluted the waters of River Baba in Labuhan Batu Selatan, North Sumatra. The Secretariat is waiting for clarification from the member PHG. Update will be given at the next meeting. A dateline needs to be set regarding when the clarification will be received to make sure it is followed. This case is currently not an official complaint until the official document is received.</p> <p>Update: This case has been resolved bilaterally and is closed.</p> <p>Status: Box H</p> <p><b>4. PT Perkebunan Nusantara III ( PTPN 3) – received on 26 January 2015</b></p> <p>Masyarakat Peduli Lingkungan Hidup Labusel (MPLH), who represent Mr. Busu Rambe made a complaint against PTPN 3, North Sumatra. The complaint is about the planting activity of PTPN 3 which has had a negative effect on the plantation owned by the community member, Pak Busu Rambe (± 280 palm oil trees, 4 years old). PTPN 3 activities are alleged to have caused soil erosion as a result of the company planting on steep slopes. The eroded soil that entered Mr. Busu Rambe’s plantation land area has resulted in him not being able to harvest his crop.</p>

# COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

15 April 2015 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 4/2015

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

Update: Secretariat has received a formal letter from the complainant. This case has been resolved bilaterally and is closed.

Status: Box H

## 5. PT Unggul Lestari (Musim Mas) – received on 23 January 2015

Kelompok Tani/ Community Group Bhakti Karya in Bukit Indah village, sub district Telaga Antang, District (Kabupaten) Kotawaringin Timur, Central Kalimantan Province, has made a complaint against PT Unggul Lestari. The complaint is about a land claim of 685 hectares. Kelompok and Bhakti Karya alleged that PT Unggul Lestari has taken their land and planted on it without their permission.

Update: Secretariat to review all documents that have been submitted by both sides. The member has met the community and met the Secretariat to clarify the issues on 10<sup>th</sup> April 2015.

Status: Box A

## 5. Monthly List of Complaints (Status as of 15 April 2015)

Categories :	Cases Closed		Cases Open
Case closed for monitoring (Box G):	11	Complaint received (Box A):	3
Case closed (Box H):	24	Complaint categorized (Box B):	1
Not resolved (Box Q):	1	Panel Convened (Box C):	2
		Complaint legitimate (Box D):	4
		Reviewing response (Box E):	1
		Action Plan (Box F):	4
		Appeal (Box P)	0
		Non – Cooperation (Box N)	1
<b>Sub - total</b>	<b>36</b>		<b>16</b>
<b>Total: 52</b>			

At this meeting, a total of 15 ongoing and 5 new complaint cases were deliberated.

## 6. Any other matters for the Complaints Panel:

### 6.1 Dates for the next CP Meetings

i. The upcoming CP meeting dates for the 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> Quarter of 2015 are as follows:

May	June	July	August	Sept
26/05/2015	18/06/2015	29/07/2015	19/08/2015	23/09/2015

### 6.2 General Information

- i. The minutes of the 17 March 2015 meeting have been published on the RSPO website.
- ii. The next Advisory Group meeting is on 11<sup>th</sup> of May 2015.

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

15 April 2015 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 4/2015

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

- iii. Lukita Wardani has been chosen to represent grower members in the Advisory Group.
- iv. The link on the suspended or terminated members of RSPO has been sent on 19 March 2015 to all CP members.
- v. An intern has joined the RSPO office in Jakarta on the 14<sup>th</sup> of April 2015.

### 6.3 Complaints System Revamp

- i. Tender on the TOR for the Independent Appeal Mechanism of the RSPO Complaints System was published on RSPO website on 27 March 2015.
- ii. Holly Jonas will be on a retainer for 6 months to address loopholes between related RSPO Components starting April 2015.

### 6.4 Membership of Complaints Panel

- i. Mr Torben Venning has already been appointed and starts as a member of the Complaints Panel from this meeting.
- ii. Tom Mclaughlin of Woolworths South Africa has confirmed as a Complaints Panel member.
- iii. Toushi Itoka from Sime Darby Liberia has been suggested by the Chairman. We have contacted her already.
- iv. Carolina Lopez from Columbia has turned down the invitation to join the CP.
- v. We will continue with the recruitment exercise for the complaints panel.

### 7. Golden Veroleum Liberia

- i. The second meeting on GVL was held on 13 April 2015.
- ii. The draft copy of the minutes have been shared with the respective Complaints Panel members.

# COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

15 April 2015 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 4/2015

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

## DELIBERATION OF COMPLAINTS

Complaint 1	
Member Organization	PT Ladang Sawit Mas (LSM) (a subsidiary of Bumitama Agri Ltd.)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Yayasan IARI, Friends of Borneo
Date filed	8 April 2013
Nature of complaint	Complaint by Friends of Borneo that PT Ladang Sawit Mas is clearing orangutan habitat and is not complying with the RSPO guidelines.
Status	Box G – Closed for monitoring
Decision /Justification	The case is currently closed for monitoring. Secretariat to continue to monitor until final closure.

Complaint 2	
Member Organization	PT Nabatindo Karya Utama (PT NKU)/PT Andalan Sukses Makmur (PT ASMR) – (subsidiaries of Bumitama Agri Ltd)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Centre for Orangutan Protection (COP)/ HUTAN/ JATAN
Date filed	10 March 2013
Nature of complaint	The company is alleged to have breached Principle 5: Environmental responsibility and conservation of natural resources and biodiversity and Principle 7: Responsible development of new plantings, i.e. in the development of the land within the concession.
Status	Box G – Closed for monitoring
Decision /Justification	The case is currently closed for monitoring. Secretariat to continue to monitor until final closure.

Complaint 3	
Member Organization	PT Hati Prima Agro (PT HPA) (a subsidiary of Bumitama Agri Ltd)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Sawit Watch
Date filed	1 July 2012
Nature of complaint	Principle 2 RSPO P&C – Compliance with applicable laws and regulations. Operating a palm oil plantation without the requisite permits.
Status	Box F – Action Plan

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

15 April 2015 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 4/2015

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

Decision /Justification	Since the conditional sales and purchase agreement (CSPA) between BGA and the new owner, PT Langgeng Makmur Sejahtera has been settled, the case is recommended to be closed.
-------------------------	---

Complaint 4	
Member Organization	Genting Plantation Bhd
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Borneo Rhino Alliance (BORA)
Date filed	27 February 2013
Nature of complaint	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Despite being a member of RSPO, GPB has not complied with the RSPO New Planting Procedures.</li> <li>2. Annual report clearly shows expansion in land area planted, but no NPP notification has been submitted to the RSPO during the period.</li> <li>3. No commitment to full certification on a time bound plan.</li> </ol>
Status	Box G – Closed for Monitoring
Decision /Justification	<p>The Secretariat shall continue to monitor the progress report and ultimately lead to final closure at the end of the 12 months monitoring period ending in September 2015.</p> <p>Quarterly report for period Jan – Mac 2015 has been shared with the complainant. Should there be no issues during the remaining monitoring period till September 2015, the case will be finally closed.</p>

Complaint 5	
Member Organization	PT Limpah Sejahtera (a subsidiary of First Resources Ltd (FRI))
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Yayasan International Animal Rescue Indonesia (YIARI)
Date filed	1 May 2010
Nature of complaint	<p>Violation of RSPO P&amp;C 5.2 and P&amp;C 7.3.</p> <p>The company is alleged to have breached:</p> <p>Principle 5: Environmental responsibility and conservation of natural resources and biodiversity</p> <p>Principle 7: Responsible development of new plantings.</p> <p>The company is alleged to have destroyed Orangutan habitats and not to have carried out an HCV assessment before development of the plantation.</p>
Status	Box F – Action Plan

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

15 April 2015 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 4/2015

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

Decision /Justification	LUC Analysis will be completed by the end of April 2015. The WRI report will be shared in the next Complaints Panel meeting. Further action will be discussed in the next meeting.
-------------------------	--

Complaint 6	
Member Organization	PT Borneo Surya Mining Jaya (a subsidiary of First Resources Ltd (FRI))
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA), Aliansi Masyarakat Adat Nusantara (AMAN) and the community of Muara Tae
Date filed	16 October 2012
Nature of complaint	Violation of RSPO New Planting Procedures under Principle 7 of the RSPO Principles and Criteria. The Muara Tae community alleged that FR did not carry out proper FPIC procedure in acquiring their customary land area. There are concurrent claims by Muara Tae and Muara Ponak communities over the same land. Also, the HCV forest was not properly identified nor set aside for conservation.
Status	Box F – Action Plan
Decision /Justification	A formal letter from RSPO to be sent to EIA inviting them to affirm and cooperate with RSPO to seek final resolution. The case will be Closed for Monitoring (Box G) at the next Complaints Panel meeting.

Complaint 7	
Member Organization	FELDA (Federal Land development Authority) FELDA Ventures Bhd.
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Orang Dusun Lahad Datu (Desa Begahak)
Date filed	16 February 2015
Nature of complaint	According to the Enquiry National Hak Tanah document by SUHAKAM, the state government had given 1260 acres of land to the Dusun Begahak community in 1981. At the same time, the same land was alienated to FELDA for development.  The complainant raised the issue that FELDA has no right to develop their land and should return it to the community because the land originally belonged to the community. The complainant also stated that the cemetery area is being developed by FELDA.  Felda encaved 916 acres of the said land and gave it back to the community. The community planted fruits and other crops on the land.

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

15 April 2015 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 4/2015

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

	A police report has been made by the community and that is the source of the complaint.
Status	Box A – Complaint Received
Decision /Justification	The community and FELDA should be allowed to meet and discuss first, to reach a settlement without any intervention by RSPO. FELDA will be arranging a formal meeting between the community and themselves with the RSPO Secretariat as observers.

Complaint 8	
Member Organization	PT Sisirau/Ibris Palm Group
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Sumatran Orangutan Society (SOS)
Date filed	29 October 2012
Nature of complaint	1. Clearing of HCV land containing Orangutan habitats 2. Failing to stop work after the discovery of Orangutans 3. Breach of New Planting Procedures
Status	Box N - Non Cooperation
Decision /Justification	No action taken until LUC Analysis report is sent to RSPO. The member has confirmed that the LUC will be sent on 18 April 2015.

Complaint 9	
Member Organization	PT Permata Hijau Pasaman (PHP) 1 –Wilmar International
Membership category	Palm Oil Processors and/or Traders
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	S.H Gampo Alam, <i>Pucuak Adat Nagari Kapa</i> (indigenous leader of Nagari Kapa) as well as Head of <i>Kerapatan Adat Nagari Kapa</i> (KAN – a village/nagari-level customary institution in Minangkabau which maintains and preserves the Minangkabau customs and culture). Supported by Forest People Programme (FPP) and HuMa (Association for Community and Ecology-Based Law Reform)
Date filed	30 October 2014
Nature of complaint	1. Complainant seeks clarity of the extent of PT. PHP 1's nucleus estate in Nagari Kapa. 2. Complainant rejects PT. PHP 1's application to the National Land Agency for a Hak Guna Usaha (HGU) certificate over the customary ( <i>ulayat</i> ) land of Nagari Kapa. 3. Violation of RSPO Principles & Criteria 6.2 – community did not participate in decision making on the areas to set aside as HCV areas.



## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

15 April 2015 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 4/2015

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

	4. Complainant seeks clarification to whom will the land be reverted at the end of the HGU period?
Status	Box D – Complaint Legitimate
Decision /Justification	Await the outcome of the meeting to be organized between Wilmar, the local government and the community with RSPO as an observer, before Complaints Panel makes a final decision.

Complaint 10	
Member Organization	Equatorial Palm Oil PLC
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Liberia
Complainant	Sustainable Development Institute
Date filed	25 September 2013
Nature of complaint	<p>It is alleged that the company has cleared and planted on land that is the customary land of the community in New Cess, Grand Bassa County, Liberia; and is seeking to expand the plantation without the free, prior and informed consent of the communities.</p> <p>The community is also objecting to the company carrying out a re-survey of the existing concession area.</p> <p>The company is alleged to have breached Principle 2.2 &amp; 2.3 of FPIC and Principle 7: Responsible development of new plantings.</p> <p>No NPP notification posted to RSPO.</p>
Status	Box D – Complaint Legitimate
Decision /Justification	<p>The parties to the complaint met on 4<sup>th</sup> April 2015 to discuss the issues and will be sending an update to the Secretariat.</p> <p>The case can be closed for monitoring in the next Complaints Panel meeting, upon confirmation by complainant.</p>

Complaint 11	
Member Organization	PT London Sumatra (Lonsum)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Community of Desa Pergulaan via Sawit Watch
Date filed	7 April 2009
Nature of complaint	<p>The following points were raised by the community of Desa Pergulaan:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Legality of the extension of the concession and demands for return of land totalling 165.6 ha.</li> <li>2. The status of the law suit filed by 5 of the residents which is 'out-of-time' (compensation paid in 1971).</li> <li>3. The legality of the security drain to prevent access.</li> </ol>

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

15 April 2015 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 4/2015

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

	<p>4. Prohibiting cattle herding in the plantation.</p> <p>5. The non-employment of residents of Desa Pergulaan in the plantation.</p> <p>6. Failure by Lonsum to carry out Corporate Social Responsibility programs as promised.</p> <p>7. No complaint letters have been addressed to Lonsum directly.</p> <p>8. Status of residents on the Police 'Wanted List'.</p>
Status	Box D – Complaint Legitimate
Decision /Justification	Awaiting for the meeting among related parties and the implementation of the action plan.

Complaint 12	
Member Organization	Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Liberia, Africa
Complainant	<p>Local communities in towns and villages identified within the proposed Golden Veroleum project, which according to the Environmental and Social Impact Assessment (ESIA) covers about thirty three thousand hectares (33,000 ha) of land located in Greenville, Butaw and Kpanyan Districts of Sinoe County, Republic of Liberia encompassing several towns and villages, including: Plusunnie, Pynes Town, Kilo Town, Dejila, Solo Village, Bukrah, Saklaboh, Bloh, Pluoh, Farley town, Soweh, Jaryenneh, Tuoh, Teah Town, Klay Tow, Butaw Compound, Otis Village. Represented by Alfred Brownell of Green Advocates (GA), Kulu United Development Association (KUDA), Save My Future Foundation (SAMFU), Forest People Programme (FPP), Social Entrepreneurs for Sustainable Development (SesDev).</p>
Date filed	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Green Advocates – 3 Oct 2012</li> <li>2. Forest People Programme – 26 July 2013</li> <li>3. Sustainable Development Institute/SesDev Liberia - 2 October 2013</li> <li>4. Joint statement by FPP, SAMFU, SDI and GA – 1 November 2013</li> <li>5. Kulu United Development Association (KUDA) - 14 November 2013</li> <li>6. Sustainable Development Institute(SDI) and Social Entrepreneurs for Sustainable Development (SesDev) Liberia – 21 November 2013</li> <li>7. Social Entrepreneurs for Sustainable Development (SeSDev) - 7th February 2014</li> <li>8. On behalf of KUDA by Green Advocates - 17th February 2014</li> <li>9. Green Advocates on behalf of the GBlebo clan - 7th March 2014</li> </ol>
Nature of complaint	<p>Violation of the RSPO Principles and Criteria and New Plantings Procedure by:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Not providing public notification for a 30 day period consistent with the New Planting Procedures,</li> <li>2) By commencing land preparation for new planting and infrastructure development prior to the expiry of the minimum 30-days consultation period.</li> </ol>

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

15 April 2015 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 4/2015

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

	<p>3) By not conducting a comprehensive and participatory independent social and environmental impact assessment(s) of the area concerned and incorporating the results into relevant action plans (see RSPO criteria 5.1, 6.1, 7.1 &amp; 7.4) including the identification of: (a) all primary forest, (b) any area required to maintain or enhance one or more High Conservation Values (HCVs), and (d) local peoples' land.</p> <p>4) Grabbing lands without respecting local customary rights and without the free, prior and informed consent (FPIC) of the customary land owners as represented through representative organizations of their choice (RSPO C2.2, C2.3, C7.5 and C7.6).</p> <p>5) Forcibly evicting the people from their lands (RSPO C7.5 and C7.6).</p>
Status	Box G (Monitoring progress of action plan for Complaint 1 by Green Advocates) Box C – Panel convened for Complaint 2 through 9
Decision /Justification	On 22 April 2015.

Complaint 13	
Member Organization	PT Kartika Prima Cipta/ Golden Agri Resource (GAR)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Forest People Programme (FPP) and Transformasi untuk Keadilan (TUK) Indonesia
Date filed	14 October 2014
Nature of complaint	<p>Points raised :</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. PT. KPC is in persistent violation of the RSPO P&amp;C pertaining to HCV assessment, the recognition of customary land rights and free, prior, and informed consent (FPIC). Lack of FPIC of the local Dayak and Malay people during the acquisition of the land.</li> <li>2. Land was acquired without a land tenure study and participatory mapping.</li> <li>3. Late HCV assessment which was done by Institute Pertanian Bogor, final consultation was on May 2014.</li> <li>4. Dissatisfaction among smallholders and resentment because of reduced land set aside for plasma compared to HCV areas.</li> <li>5. Land has been set aside as HCS area that made no provision for customary land uses and tenure and local peoples' livelihood.</li> <li>6. GAR as the parent company of all 18 subsidiaries listed is acting in violation of the New Planting Procedures (NPP) by submitting information which it knows is false. No HGU exists in 16 of the 18 concessions where NPP was submitted.</li> <li>7. The assessors who have endorsed GAR's HCV assessment, ESIA's and social engagement actions, are in violation of their responsibility to provide impartial assessment of company compliance with RSPO P&amp;C.</li> </ol>
Status	Box D – Complaint Legitimate

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

15 April 2015 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 4/2015

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

Decision /Justification	A final decision was made and the Secretariat will draft the letter to GAR, which will be circulated to CP members prior to despatch. If there is a need to discuss, a quick meeting will be held with the Complaints Panel.
-------------------------	--

Complaint 14	
Member Organization	PT Wina Nabati Indonesia / Wilmar
Membership category	Oil Palm Traders
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Friends of Borneo, Siesfund and Stanislaus Lhota
Date filed	6 February 2013
Nature of complaint	<p>In respect Principles and Criteria of the Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil (RSPO) in Kelurahan Kariangau, Kota Madya Balikpapan, East Kalimantan, where it is building a CPO processing unit.</p> <p>The company has reclaimed land and cleared mangrove swamps in the area to build a jetty in the Balikpapan Bay and it is deemed a sensitive area for biodiversity. The Complainants claim that the clearing of areas includes approximately 18-20 hectares of mangrove forest, which is classified as Kawasan Lindung, according to the local spatial plan (tata ruang kota madya). Besides the spatial plan, opening coastal mangroves violates several national laws: (1) Surat Keputusan Bersama Menteri Pertanian dan Menteri Kehutanan No. KB.550/264/Kpts/4/1984, which defines the zone of protected mangroves to be 200 m; (2) Surat Edaran No. 507/IV-BPHH/1990, which defines the protected green belt to be 200 m along the coast and 50 m along rivers; (3) Keputusan presiden No. 32 tahun 1990 tentang Pengelolaan Kawasan Lindung,</p>
Status	Box G – Closed For Monitoring
Decision /Justification	<p>The member has notified RSPO that the local government has revoked their Ijin Lokasi for the larger area because of their refusal to develop HCV areas. As such, they will only develop the original area of less than 50 ha only.</p> <p>No further action needed. Recommend to be closed after receiving the full report from Wilmar.</p>

Complaint 15	
Member Organization	PT Barumun Agro Sentosa/ PT BAS (was PT First Mujur Plantation)
Membership category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Mr. Hepli Harahap (Gerakan Pemuda Untuk Keadilan Rakyat/GPUKR) on behalf of himself and Haji Soleh Hasibuan
Date filed	19 January 2015
Nature of complaint	I. FPIC related issues (C2.3, C6.4, C7.6)

## COMPLAINTS PANEL MEETING MINUTES

15 April 2015 | 3.30pm – 5.30pm | Meeting No. 4/2015

Meeting location: *RSPO Secretariat Office, 37 Floor, Menara UOA, Bangsar, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia*

	<p>Complainant alleged PT BAS has not compensated the land owned by Haji Soleh Hasibuan, 25 hectares in Village Labuhan Jurung/ Ujung Batu Julu. About 7700 rubber trees were planted on the land.</p> <p>II. Principle 2 Breach of Law No. 40/ 2007 on Perseroan Terbatas (PT/Corporate) and Law No. 47/2012 on Corporate Social and Environment Responsibility. Lack of Corporate Social Responsibility/CSR.</p> <p>III. Criteria 5.3 PT BAS has polluted Danau Meluak.</p>
Status	Box A – Complaint Received
Decision /Justification	PT BAS will be asked to submit their SOP for FPIC process and the Secretariat will speak to the member on the need to preserve the integrity of the system by refraining from putting pressure on complainants.