



Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil

### **Minutes of Meeting:**

### **RSPO Communications & Claims Standing Committee (C&C SC)**

**Date** : 25 April 2012  
**Venue** : Conference Call  
**Starting time** : 9.00am to 12.00noon CET (3 hours)

### **ATTENDANCE LIST (IN ALPHABETICAL ORDER)**

<b>Stakeholder Group</b>	<b>Members</b>	<b>Organization</b>
Consumer Goods Manufacturer	Jan Kees Vis – Chair	Unilever
Environmental NGO	Carrie Svingen	WWF
Grower	Adam Thomas	New Britain Oils
Processors & Traders	Karlijn van Lierop	Product Board MVO
Processors & Traders	Yves Augrandjean	IOI
Retailer	Hugo Byrnes	Ahold
Retailer	Agathe Grossmith	Carrefour
Retailer	Agnès Pondaven	Carrefour
Social NGO	Sabina Voogd	Oxfam
RSPO Secretariat	Bremen Yong	RSPO Secretariat
Service provider	Bob Norman	GreenPalm
Service provider	Andy Green	BM Trada
Service provider	Simo Honkanen	Neste Oil
Service provider	Giovanni Colombo	H+K Strategies
Service provider	Pamela Bons	H+K Strategies
Service provider	Marion Birnstill	H+K Strategies
Service provider	Tanno Massar	H+K Strategies Amsterdam
Service provider	Peter Headden	H+K Strategies China
Service provider	Arneeta Vasudeva	H+K Strategies India
Service provider	Tursianna Setyohapsari	Golin Harris Indonesia
Service provider	Johnny Salleh	Golin Harris Indonesia

### **UNABLE TO ATTEND (substantive members only)**

<b>Stakeholder Group</b>	<b>Members</b>	<b>Organization</b>
Bank	Dr Olaf Brugman	Rabobank
Social NGO	Sandra Seeboldt (alternate present)	Oxfam International
Processors & Traders	Caroline Sikking	Cargill
RSPO Secretariat	Anne Gabriel	RSPO Secretariat

## 1. OPENING:

- 1.1 *The Chair (Jan Kees Vis) opened the conference call and welcomed all participants.*
- 1.2 *The committee reviewed and approved the minutes of last meeting on 16 February 2012. One comment the action point 6.2.1 at page 4: H+K needs to provide a note on the possible transfer of the helpdesk to India. One comment on the action point 7.3.4 at page 6: H+K to get in touch with Caroline Sikking and Hidde Van Kersen to collect feed-back on their participation on the MPOC event in Berlin.*

## 2. TERMS OF REFERENCE (ToR):

### 2.1 Discussion:

- 2.1.1 *Yves made one comment on point 4.1/vi at p.3: "Safeguard the reliability of claims used on the basis of agreed rules and guidelines". He said that C&C members were not aligned in the understanding of this point. Jan Kees replied that members, who want to make claims via their corporate communication materials or via product labels, should make sure that such claims are always in line with the guidelines approved by the RSPO. RSPO does not have the capacity to check all claims in the market. However, if a C&C member identifies a claim which does not respect the RSPO guidelines, he or she should notify it to the Secretariat. The Secretariat shall bring it to the attention of the SC C&C, who will decide on possible actions.*

### 2.2 Decisions:

- 2.2.1 *This is the final version of the ToR.*

### 2.3 Action Points:

- 2.3.1 *The finalized ToR shall be sent to the EB for approval by Jan Kees. Once approved by the EB, Bremen will put in on the RSPO website, Anne/H&K will circulate it to members via the Newsflash (eGazette).*

## 3. REGIONAL CLUSTERS:

### 3.1 Discussion:

- 3.1.1 *Jan Kees opened the discussion by stressing the importance to diversify the focus of the C&C SC, which currently is rather Eurocentric, in order to support RSPO's activities in different regions around the world. The next EB meeting will discuss the possibility to establish a RSPO presence in different regions (Latin America, Africa, India, China, Europe and US) and the possibility to appoint a RSPO representative in each of them. We need to look at:*
  - *What is the best way to organize this?*
  - *Where the representatives would be based? Would they be hosted by friendly organization such as WWF?*
  - *What are the budget implications?**The most pressing needs are in Latin America and Africa.*
- 3.1.2 *Yves agreed that C&C members lack some understanding of the market dynamics in India, China and Indonesia, for instance, and have limited capacity to contribute to progress in non-European markets. He welcomed the proposal.*
- 3.1.3 *Carrie stated that in China it would be useful to have a regular forum where WWF and H+K could meet with stakeholders and discuss local situation. She also pointed out that communications is a different but overlapping function than business engagement/member relations/new member recruitment. H+K are already handling the communications function at the moment, but it might be better if there was a dedicated RSPO representative leading the business engagement activities.*
- 3.1.4 *Giovanni advised that each regional presence should include three different functions: 1) a decision-making function to lead local outreach and engagement; 2) a representation function to make sure that RSPO has as an ambassador/spokesperson available in each market, who would be able to build his/her own network of contacts and relations; 3) a coordination function, to make sure that that members, local representation, Secretariat and consultants are well connected and move forward according to a coherent strategy.*

### **3.2 Decisions:**

3.2.1 No decision at this stage.

### **3.3 Action Points:**

3.3.1. H+K will draft a briefing paper on the most pressing needs in India and China. The paper should be circulated to Carrie and Anne for further input and comments and then sent to C&C members for review.

## **4. INDONESIA – GAME PLAN BY TURSIANNA SETYOHAPSARI**

### **4.1 Discussion:**

- 4.1.1 Tursianna presented the milestones activities in Indonesia during Q1 2012, in particular the media roundtable with RSPO Advisor Prof. Bungaran Saragih, to discuss details of GIN 2011 and outcome of GA8 on 21 March. Prof. Saragih is very effective and useful spokesperson, also in face to face engagements with media.
- 4.1.2 Regarding the dissemination of press releases, Tursianna commented that the global news which have been communicated by RSPO in Indonesia lack relevance for the local market.
- 4.1.3 In Q2 the plan is to proactively engage with the government and leverage Prof. Saragih with media and other stakeholders. Considering the rising negativity among the Indonesian government that is triggered by the overall misconceptions of RSPO's missions and misleading insights fed by GAPKI, it is important for RSPO to take proactive mode in government relations. RSPO will engage with the key target ministries: Ministry of Agriculture, Ministry of Trade, Ministry of Industry and Coordinating Ministry of Economy.
- 4.1.4 GH will also consult with WWF regarding ISPO since closer coordination with WWF Indonesia on this matter would be very useful.
- 4.1.5 In May GH will support RSPO on the organisation of a member gathering and will organise media briefings around the event.
- 4.1.6 Agnese communicated that Carrefour Indonesia is working on a partnership with small holders and it will also hold an event to showcase its support on small holders' sustainability, in cooperation with WWF, on May 2. The Ministry of Agriculture will join the meeting.
- 4.1.7 Carrefour will organise a TM event in Indonesia on 19 June, and it hopes to be ready with a product carrying the TM (cooking oil) by then.
- 4.1.8 UNDP is setting up a platform in Indonesia with the Government. UNDP plans to use this platform to focus on ISPO and would like to involve RSPO as well. Potential speaking opportunities for RSPO. It would be good if Desi Kusumadewi could attend. Unilever will try to attend and it would be good to have Carrefour there as well.

### **4.2 Action Points:**

- 4.2.1 GH to consult with WWF Indonesia on ISPO
- 4.2.2 Unielver and Carrefour to confirm their presence at the UNDP platform.

## **5. CHINA – GAME PLAN PRESENTED BY JOHN HOLDEN AND PETER HEADDEN OF H&K CHINA:**

### **5.1 Discussion:**

- 5.1.1 H+K is in touch with Lu Hongyan, Founder of the Sustainability Research and Education Centre at Sichuan University, to discuss possible research topics to engage with stakeholders in China. H+K is planning to hold a workshop with five leading companies in China to discuss CSPO and present research on sustainable palm oil.
- 5.1.2 H+K proposes to see if any available research from RSPO could be used to this end.
- 5.1.3 H+K is also working on a messaging framework tailored to China, based on the global messaging developed by the H+K Brussels team. A draft will be finalised by the end of April and it will be then circulated for comments to the SC C&C.

- 5.1.4 H+K is also working with Gavin Neath and Consumer Good Forum (CGF) to secure RSPO presence at the CFNA oil industry summit on 17 July. RSPO is on the agenda, and the current plan is to have a specific session of the summit dedicated to it. H+K is working with Gavin on the format of this session and possible invitee list. Agathe said that Carrefour has been asked to bring someone to the event as a member of CGF's committee on sustainability.
- 5.1.5 Carrie communicated that CFNA and WWF agreed to have another separate meeting on sustainable palm oil, the "China sustainable palm oil forum". There is a risk however that the two meetings might compete. It is not clear at this stage how the two meetings could be differentiated. Participants agreed that it would be desirable to merge the two meetings. She also mentioned that she had understood that there was another membership application submitted (and approved) by a Chinese company -- China SINO Light Chemical Corporation-- A Chinese Surfactant and Detergents Manufacturer. Apparently they are a state-owned company, so bodes well for other China state-owned companies joining. Can RSPO confirm this new membership?

### **5.3 Action Points:**

- 5.3.1 Jan Kees will get in touch with Gavin and H+K to discuss the event on July 17.
- 5.3.2 Anne to update C&C SC on COFCO membership (as mentioned in the presentation).

## **6. INDIA – GAME PLAN PRESENTED BY ARNEETA VASUDEVA OF H&K INDIA:**

### **6.1 Discussion:**

- 6.1.1 Arneeta and Amandeep have presented the latest insight from the stakeholder audit. Greenpeace feels that there is a lack of momentum, and the general view is that the industry should take the lead instead of waiting for the government to act.
- 6.1.2 The member meet has provided useful insight on the position of local players. Industry leaders have acknowledged the fact that there is need for sustainable palm oil, and Hindustan Unilever and Kamani Oil Industries have already shown their interest and commitment to drive the demand. The price premium is not that significant.
- 6.1.3 The member meet was followed by stakeholder meetings. With TERI the discussion focused on a potential partnership on capacity building in India. The meeting with FICCI was aimed at building mutual trust and understanding. The dialogue will resume in Q2. Darrel met also Godrej's managing director. The meeting with HUL addressed the issue of procurement. HUL is happy to support RSPO and recognises the importance of its role in pushing the industry and convincing the government. Adani does not want to be seen as a front runner and prefer that others take the lead. Ruchi is interested in developing domestic production.
- 6.1.4 Jan Kees recommended to look into possible help from the Solidaridad programme for support on local production of CSPO and other sustainable commodities. Jan Kees will put H+K in touch with the Solidaridad office in India to check if they have any activity on palm oil in India.
- 6.1.5 Next steps in India include a number of media engagements and the organisation of a coalition meet in collaboration with WWF, in May or June. Media engagements will focus on presenting the contribution of thought leaders such as HUL and RSPO to key journalists to prepare the ground for a possible media roundtable in Q3.
- 6.1.6 With TERI the plan is to work on a common outreach programme and also to look at possible RSPO participation in the Sustainable Development Summit of 2013 (highly recommended by H+K). With FICCI H+K will work on an outreach to key retailers in India, with the potential organisation of a retailer roundtable in June or Q3. H+K is also looking at potential partnership with CII, which is the main industry federation in the country.

### **6.2 Action Points:**

- 6.2.1 Jan Kees to put H+K in touch with Solidaridad in India.
- 6.2.2 Anne to review proposal for partnership with TERI submitted by H+K.
- 6.2.3 H+K to work on a note regarding the possible move of the RSPO helpdesk to India.

## 7. EUROPE– GAME PLAN PRESENTED BY GIOVANNI COLOMBO & TEAM OF H+K BRUSSELS:

### 7.1. Discussion:

- 7.1.1 *Giovanni: After a quick Q1 Update, H+K presented the European media tracker emphasising on the recent media coverage given to alleged land grabbing case in Liberia (BBC) and the announcement of Unilever objective to slowly phase out Greenpalm certificates beyond 2012 (Financial Times).*
- 7.1.2 *Marion Birnstill: on the UNGC agreement, H+K Brussels will liaise with H+K China to explore opportunities to organise a similar partnership with WTO China, which plans to translate the website into Chinese.*
- 7.1.3 *Pamela: the e-Gazette has been reinstated to ensure a consistent information flow to RSPO members and interested parties (see point 9.1.1 below for additional elements).*
- 7.1.4 *Adam: there is a need to conduct a satisfaction survey for the Helpdesk. Received complaints about the quality of answers to Membership related questions.  
Giovanni: helpdesk is not part of Q2 activities due to budget constraints. The helpdesk survey will be proposed in the activity plan for Q3.*
- 7.1.5 *Pamela: Salahudin has spoken at the World Biofuels Markets in Rotterdam to present the RSPO-RED scheme. His presence at WBM was complemented by meetings with several stakeholders in the Netherlands (IDH, Bonsucro) and Germany (GIZ, BLE).*
- 7.1.6 *Pamela Bons: we welcome your feedback on the RSPO-RED communications strategy by May 2<sup>nd</sup>.  
Sabina: Oxfam has reservation on the push of palm oil as biofuel, based on competition with food and the increased pressure on land. We have also seen new research that shows that palm oil generates higher GHG emissions than gasoline and diesel on the basis of fossil fuels. Oxfam would like to see limited attention given to the approval of the RSPO-RED scheme by the EC and generally is against promoting RSPO as a sustainable biofuel scheme. We fear that once RSPO palm oil can be used as a bio fuel under RED it will not be possible to produce the volumes that will be demanded in a sustainable way. We would like to tone down RSPO-RED communications materials.  
Carrie Svingen: WWF has a different position on palm oil as a source for biofuel. WWF believes that biofuels can be part of the equation for a sustainable future for the planet provided the commodity in question, in this case palm oil, is produced in accordance with broadly agreed criteria for sustainable production and the life cycle of the commodity has a significantly positive GHG balance (including GHG emissions associated with land clearing and land use changes to establish the crop fields). The expansion in the production and processing of biofuels must be managed with great care, taking into account wider environmental concerns, including biodiversity, water, soil, landscapes, and social aspects. It makes sense for the RSPO to announce its acceptance by the EU RED, but WWF has concerns on RSPO over promoting palm oil as a biofuel crop, and it would like RSPO to re-assess the allocation of resources devoted to communication on the RED approval. If the RSPO does decide to aggressively promote the acceptance by EU RED, it should be well prepared for an NGO backlash, and have a plan on how to effectively deal with such a backlash from a comms perspective should it occur.  
There was general agreement on this point. However for Adam Thomas, Michelle Morton should be consulted on this issue to better understand the rules with regards to peatland and Biofuels.*
- 7.1.7 *Other priorities for Q2 are the TM anniversary and dialogue with retailers. On the TM anniversary H+K intends to pitch a story on the TM coming to shelves to selected media, and organize interviews with both retail and grower representatives.*
- 7.1.8 *Hugo Byrnes: On the suggestion to get RSPO involved in the EU Retail Forum on Sustainability, several members raised the importance of involving retailers at an early stage (i.e when opening the discussion with the European Commission). H+K will organize a conference call with RSPO retailer representatives to discuss next steps on the EU Retail Forum, general retailers outreach in Europe and possible activities around the TM anniversary. In addition, members have raised the importance of the European Food Sustainable Consumption and Production Roundtable. While reaching out the roundtable was initially planned after RSPO involvement with the Retail Forum on Sustainability, H+K will explore the benefits of running both activities simultaneously.*

7.1.8 *National commitments: the question has been raised whether RSPO was planning to leverage and advocate for a national commitment in France. Giovanni highlighted that, given the current presidential elections, any activities targeting France would be delayed to Q3 or Q4. Agathe: offered to send the press documents of a recent press event that was organised by Carrefour on the topic of sustainable palm oil.*

*Karlijn van Lierop: these are the contact details of Daniel May. He works for GTZ and is in charge of the German Forum, an initiative similar to the Dutch Task Force Sustainable. He has been travelling for a while but should be back in the office by now. GTZ made a proposal to the German government for setting up a secretariat and provide funding.*

*Daniel May*

*Project Director*

*Sustainable Palm Oil Production for BioEnergy*

*T: +66 2661 9273*

*M: +66 81 844 9805*

*E: daniel.may@giz.de*

*I: www.gtz.de/sustainablepalmoil*

7.1.9 *Cosmetic sector: Marion presented the outcome of a call with members from cosmetic industry, in which the main challenge identified was the need to clarify technical issues related to supply chain, e.g. definitions of various terms (fractions and derivatives), to empower members and potential members to use CSPO.*

## **7.2 Decisions:**

7.2.1 *Tone down outreach campaign on RSPO–RED approval and keep a low profile on this issue.*

7.2.2 *Organize a call with retailers and other interested C&C members to discuss how to engage with retail sector in Europe.*

## **7.3 Action Points:**

7.3.1 *H&K: to liaise with RSPO members from the retail sector to discuss next steps*

7.3.2 *H&K: to liaise with RSPO secretariat and Standing Committee on Trace and Traceability to discuss the questions raised by members from the cosmetic sector*

7.3.3 *RSPO members: To send their feedback on the RSPO RED communication tools.*

7.3.4 *Agathe Grossmith: to send through the documents of the French press conference on sustainable palm oil.*

7.3.5 *Simo: to align with Michelle Morton on the use of peatland for biofuel production.*

## **9. UPDATES on other business:**

9.1.1 *E-Gazette: Yves would like to have a clear division of regional initiatives by continent to facilitate the reading of the e-Gazette, and he would like to see a monthly update on main CSPO figures. Tanno and Karlijn explained the importance of having also a tool dedicate to industry, in particular smaller companies, on how to go about certification, supply chain options, volumes and availability in Europe. This would be useful for the Dutch market but also for food manufacturers in Belgium and Germany. Jan Kees is not in favour of adding an additional extra tool translated in Dutch.*

9.1.2 *Taskforce on how to lower barriers for SMEs to join RSPO: RSPO needs to identify a volunteer. C&C SC members should communicate their interest in this role within two weeks, i.e. by 9 May.*

9.1.3 *GIN Report: Simo expressed his concern over the fact that the GIN report gives more visibility to the Green Palm/book & claim system, and there is no mention of the UTZ system. Participants agreed that all communications should promote all systems in the same way.*

9.1.4 *Bremen communicated that new RSPO website will be launched on May 2.*

9.1.5 *RT10 logo: Jan Kees would like the RT10 logo to be clearly recognisable as a RSPO logo. RT10 will be held on 29 October in Singapore.*

## **9.2 Action Points:**

9.2.1 *Anne/H+K to add regional division to the news in the e-Gazette (when applicable).*

- 9.2.2 *C&C SC Members to communicate interest in the SMEs Task force by 9 May.*
- 9.2.3 *Anne will circulate a new version of the logo.*

## **10. NEXT MEETING:**

- 10.1 *Date for the next meeting: 10<sup>th</sup> of July in Brussels from 10 am to 4pm*

### **Prepared by:**

*Giovanni Colombo, Hill+Knowlton Strategies*

*Pamela Bons, Hill+Knowlton Strategies*

*Marion Birnstill, Hill+Knowlton Strategies*