

Minutes of Meeting

RSPO Communications & Claims Standing Committee (C&C SC)

Date: April 20, 2016

Venue: WebEx Meeting

Time: CET 10:30 am – 1:00 pm

ATTENDANCE LIST

Stakeholder Group	Members	Organization
Consumer Goods Manufacturer	Jan Kees Vis (JKV)	Unilever
Association member	Eddy Esselink (EE)	MVO
Environmental NGO	Carrie Svingen (CK)	WWF International
Retailer	Laura Jungmann (LJ)	Ahold
Trader	Judith Murdoch (JM)	AAK
Refiner/Trader	Marie Lavialle- Piot (MLP)	Cargill
Bank	Jose den Toom (JDT)	Rabobank
Service provider	Andy Green (AG)	BM TRADA
Service provider	Bob Norman (BN)	Green Palm
RSPO Secretariat	Stefano Savi (SS)	RSPO Secretariat
RSPO Secretariat	Danielle Morley (DM)	RSPO Secretariat
RSPO Secretariat	Fay Richards (FR)	RSPO Secretariat
Consultant	Giovanni Colombo (GC)	H+K Strategies

- DM introduces new member of the team in London in Fay Richards
- Apologies from Marinella and Emma who are unable to attend. Judith also sends her apologies, as she will join late.

Action Points

- SS to share social media policy with panel
- SS to make contact with Tropical Forest Alliance platform re. RSPO NEXT

- JM to update on labelling issue for AAK and advise if this was taken through T&T committee.
- DM to share further update on retailer engagement in Europe
- Update on smallholder reciprocal visit

Opening

1. JKV reminded members of the RSPO Antitrust rules. There would be no discussions on process, premiums, and contracts of individual suppliers or individual customers.
2. Approval of minutes of last meeting (20 January 2016):

2.1 JKV: are the action points group together by section? DM explains how we will run through action points by section. JKV asks for contributions/comments as we go.

2.2 JKV ref action points from previous minutes. On p.2 there is mention that SS will have a call with IVDS and ENI technical departments, has this happened? SS: the prerequisite of the call was for ENI to send a document with their questions. We have chased ENI but this has not happened so we have not been able to have the call yet.

2.3 JKV: has the Secretariat monitored the interest in renewal of the RSPO-RED module? SS: yes there seems to be interest but no real commitment from interested members.

2.4 JKV: what is the action point regarding Conservation International (CI) in reference to? SS: clarifies a report was shared prior to this call. DM, Summary of Policy on Deforestation.

2.5 JKV: do we have the report of RT13? SS: yes.

2.6 SS: will update on BoG, transition of green palm to new system, and relationship with Indonesian Govt. in the Global Update

2.7 JKV has introduced SS to Jonathon Atwood, Unilever US. SS chased a number of times – will be possible to have a meeting but nothing confirmed. No response to confirm a meeting. JKV will mention in early May meeting.

2.8 Social media policy will be sent by SS in email

2.9 JKV: is there any update on RSPO WG? SS: there is no further update. SS to have meeting 9th May with Yohanes and Liza Murphy. The ToR is not ready for the WG yet

2.10 Update on claims guidelines? Is there a plan to redo the communications? SS, yes we have a ToR that will be ready this week. We will have three diff proposals for how to go through claims. These will be circulated with a survey to our members. The members will select a preferred option. This will be reviewed and inserted into the claims advice document which is going to go through public consultation. Needs to be ready by November. Final proposal by June so we can have the version by July for public consultation.

2.11 Market database – JM is in touch with the PCC. Wait for further update from JM

2.12 Has RSPO NEXT been shared and compared with other schemes? SS not many discussions so far with other standards. Work has been done on deforestation and arable stock. HDS is seeking alignment. Report from ISEAL.

2.13 SS: confusion about whether IUCN or UCS was to comment on the biodiversity. No comments received from IUCN, flagged with Dir. of Special Projects, Yohanes. He will try to reach out to them again to better understand their position and if they have any comments on the new standards/criteria.

2.14 SS: We holding workshops with stakeholders in RSPO NEXT.

CS: POIG is preparing a document that compares RSPO NEXT and POIG. They will be distributing copies at EU RT 2016.

2.15 JKV confirms that Seabright is the CSO at Unilever

Action Points:

- JKV to chase Unilever US team
- SS to send social media policy to committee

3. ToR

JKV: changes to ToR from EB to BoG across the document. The title just needs amending. SS will submit to BoG for approval.

4. Global Updates

SS

China

- We have a new member – Sinograin, second largest importer of palm oil in China. They have approx. 400k metric tonnes of import per year. First largest importer, Julong, is already a member. Important new member as they have strong links with the Chinese government. They play a fundamental role in the Chinese Government food security plan. Their application has been approved. It will go live on the RSPO website within a week. This has been achieved by our new Outreach & Engagement Manager, Yun, and his work in the past few months.
- Starting Social Media activation in China via WeChat platform. However we need a business account and must submit paperwork for a business license. Hope to start by June.
- China had a retailer roundtable. Collaboration with CFNA on this. Discussed participation in the Sustainable Consumption Week – held at the end of August. It is very important for us to be there because awareness of palm oil is very low. Starting engagement will lead to good future developments.
- China Certification and Accreditation Institute (CCAI) preliminary meetings. Research institution linked to govt. which will enable us to obtain the approval of certification standards with CNCA (Certification and Accreditation Administration) – approving

international standards and licensing agency. The step will help legalise the RSPO in China – one of the main reasons for opening the office and starting this work.

- Very good updates and good momentum.

JM has joined the call

DM: there is a delegation of Chinese delegates led by CFNA to come to the EU RT in June. We will organise meetings and dialogue sessions. Going to visit some of the national alliances within Europe; Italy, Netherlands and UK. DM will share back more details and sure they will want to meet leaders.

EE: visiting on 10th June and they also want to visit MVO. Plan to have a visit to The Hague.

India

- More difficult to create momentum in India. We have looked into ways to better engage, focusing on moving members in a one by one basis and partnering with associations. We will have a workshop in collaboration with Solvent extractors' Association of India on 16th May focusing on RPSO membership, RSPO supply chains, RSPO NEXT and new frontiers for RSPO.
- Useful to enlarge membership base but also useful to have active members showcase their commitment in the future.
- Trying to find stars or leaders in our membership. We have created a better bond with a member, Galaxy Surfactants who have been very active in the past. This has led to some good developments such as first product in the Indian market to carry an RSPO TM label on pack.

Malaysia

- New Outreach and Engagement Manager, Gaya, starting 5th May.

Singapore

- Working with WWF in Singapore we have some good developments.
- We've had the first preliminary meetings for a national commitment. There are four companies pledging to take part in the commitment for CSPO.
- SS has received a draft from WWF of ToR with a proposed uptake of 100% CSPO by 2020. First national commitment outside Europe to actually materialise.

Indonesia

- We are working on a messaging framework based on the results of the consumer study. Planning to have framework work to start in May. This will work to activate campaign with fellow members e.g. WWF. We will speak to NGOs and consumer groups and also push communications on RSPO high in the market.

USA

- Stefano was in NY last week to recruit new O&E Manager, there was a good group of candidates and we will be short listing this week. Hope to finalise an offer to the selected

candidate within 2 weeks and then to have someone on board within the next 1 – 2 months. They will improve the outreach and engagement in the US – a second tier market, very influential in the debate.

- We will launch the social campaign on 7th May - Good and Bad Palm Oil. This will include three short videos which depicts three different foods containing palm oil. The user will be directed to a microsite. Consumer will be asked to share the campaign and then linked to the Guardian Palm Oil debate. We would appreciate any support from members, their networks, companies and their links online.

BoG Update

- RT will be in from w/c 7th November. Same venue as initially chosen for RT 2015, Shangri Lah Bangkok. This was moved to Kuala Lumpur in 2015 due to bombings in Bangkok.
 - Looking for a corporate events manager to be based in KL – general assembly organisation and will also help future RTs and potentially with the EU RT
- Key Items discussed at last BoG meeting:
- Minimum prices for trading of RSPO certificates. Concerns on conflicting opinion from the lawyers who have been engaged to push this concern forward. T&T will advise how to move forward on the minimum pricing. Divert back to board by May.
 - Update on Indonesian-Malaysian resolution – status is that we have engaged with a number of ministries. Trying to get written response on transparency on plantations.

JKV: have you been discussing this with WRI?

SS: yes we have been discussing with them. Director of WRI Indonesia is a key player and has been very helpful with interaction with anti-corruption commission. WRI very much in touch

JKV: Would the Tropical Forest Alliance platform be of help?

Action Point - SS will advise RSPO Special Projects Director to make contact with Tropical Forest Alliance on RSPO NEXT.

- Smallholders - RSPO now has 160k independent small holders certified. Despite the efforts of small holders working group we are seeing difficulty on reaching small holders at scale. BoG requested that we have a revised smallholder strategy. SS due to meet with Director of Special Projects, Yohanes, about how O&E Dept. can support.
- HR Progress and financial updates, everything is on track.

RSPO NEXT

We have launched the RSPO NEXT. There has been a lot of media updates and interest in Europe and Asia. It has been covered by specialist and mainstream media.

- 26 publications and 29 articles in Southeast Asia
- 47 publications, 60 news articles in Europe
- 12 publications, over 80 articles in other nations.

There is a meeting on the 9th May to discuss the next steps. Yohanes is working on outreach to current members and there will be a briefing and update session in Jakarta and Melaka. A session is also planned for EU RT 2016 and then a road show in Latin America in August. We have plans to communicate to members that we will have first members verified certification by quarter 3 this year.

AG: What exactly is the WG meant to be looking into?

SS: ToR which is not yet drafter for this group but would answer the question

AG: The website announces how it is going to work publically yet there is working group to look into how it going to work.

SS: The layout is there as you say but the details are not covered. For example, one of the issues that have not been covered is the minimum pricing and also the claims. We have more information when the ToR has been finalised.

JM: To add, there are a lot people who think this is a physical supply chain. Suppliers will be disappointed that it is a certificate based platform. Well received as a concept. You may have a backfire on this.

SS: WG will discuss but unlikely to change

JM: I agree, but it is key how we communicate this over the next few weeks and months

DM: French Alliance feedback on RSPO NEXT, when are we going to know if a producer is going to be supplying RSPO NEXT?

RSPO 'Credits'

We are finalising with the trademark department. ToR to be sent out to the agencies to propose three options on how to proceed on the book and claims work, members to give us comments via an online survey. Work finalised by July so that we can have a final draft of the negotiation and claims doc. We will put this out for public consultation and close this by November

Aim to have one public consultation for new C&C document including NEXT, credits and general claims amendment together.

JM: I've been doing some work on behalf of AAK on wholesale market regarding issue of the RPSO logo. They would like it on packs but under current rule would need to be certification. Question, is this a desktop exercise as with retailers? They have five own label products they would like to use the logo on. Can they be included under Comms & Claims rules as a retailer is?

AG: The reason that wholesalers and retailers are different in supply chain because retailers are outside the certification scoping. They are fundamentally different. If they are wholesaling finished products, they fall under category of retailers and they can then apply for a retailer's license.

JM: Product is specifically frying oils. We just need to be clearer, we can take offline if this too detailed for the committee. Can we make more detailed in the claims.

LJ: From a retailer's perspective, it would open up a huge discussion with all our suppliers about manipulation of ingredients. I would be really careful about this.

AG: Wholesalers are not currently certified. License controlled solely by RSPO and it comes to discussion about whether they are distributors or not. Whether wholesalers can have a license to have a logo as well? I would not agree with that. They need to be certified to use the logo.

JM: Wholesalers distributors should be certified. Happy to go with AG's suggestion. My view is that this is a constant argument in the market and clarity is all that is needed.

JKV: Are we having the same discussion as the T&T?

JM: This issue has not been raised in T&T. It was mentioned a year ago.

AG: In general principal, they do not have the license to use the trademark on pack. Rules are clear if they read them in more detail.

JM: Agreed.

JKV: Should be raised within the T&T SC first

JM: Complex market and individual case

SS: If it is going to be a more generic problem then it should be with T&T desk. Raise with Inke.

Action point: Take offline and take through T&T

DM: Action to bring back to the next C&C meeting to conclude.

Traceability

We are going to have an announcement on EURT 2016 to plan the communications about e-trace system.

ACOP

ACOP submissions closed on 15th April. We have made tremendous progress in the past few years. This has been led by suspensions and terminations that were issued in last two years in view of failure to submit to ACOP.

- 75% of required to submit have submitted ACOP compared to 68% in 2015
- Total including voluntary submissions is 1138 members, whereas it was 753 last year
- A few years prior it was just a 30-40% submission rate from members

We are really pleased with this. We have started working on this data and will share the ACOP report to our members at EU RT 2016. We want to share this data more with members and stakeholders. We want members to take advantage on the ACOP as much as they can. Planning is in progress.

5. Europe Updates

DM

RSPO EU RT 2016 - Milan

- EU RT was launched last week, 2 months ahead of the conference. It is in Milan on 9th June and hosted at the conference venue of a big media outlet. Focus on how we achieve our 100% CSPO uptake because it's a climate change imperative and 6 months after COP21. RSPO NEXT initiative to bring to this discussion, connect us to climate change, economic imperatives, sustainable livelihoods and small holders.
- Preparatory meetings be held on the 8th including the China Dialogue hosted by CFNA China delegates. Agenda itself is framed. We will be adding more speakers to the session.
- We have opted for more plenary sessions which we felt was working better at our global RT
- I have invited the President of IFAD Rome which focuses on agriculture and development. President speaks very eloquently however it has been very difficult to get a firm commitment. Indicated interest but they cannot confirm. President of WFO is an alternative speaker we could approach – very interesting perspective on sustainable climate change. She has been highly recommended.
- We have also discussed inviting the Unilever CSO but in discussion with Italy advisors think it would be interesting to bring institutional and farmers' perspective into the debate. This would particularly build on the expo in Milan.
- Offline JKV and DM to discuss reaching out to Seabright at Unilever.
- Re-engaged Peter Knight to lead plenary
- Made efforts to ensure panels are multi-stakeholder and also trying to bring in more Italian stakeholders. Ferrero invited and will be represented Laurent Cremona, they are firm advocates of the POIG group.
- We have also invited Cecile Bessou from Cirad, French Agricultural research agency, together with WRI, Rosenbaug and Olam.

JKV: What is the language going to be?

DM: Simultaneous translation in Spanish, Italian and Bahasa.

- DM & SS will give RSPO updates including the commissioning of LMC market study report. Phase 1 will be ready just before the event. We will be working hard to bring some of this data to the conference.
- Leonard Becchetti, economist that developed the Happiness Index – consumer attitudes toward spending. It will be very interesting to hear from him

AG: No mention of RSPO NEXT in the main event?

DM: This was intentional; the debate will bring in RSPO NEXT and what it brings to the table.

SS: I think it's good. It is right that we focus on the P&C

DM: I met Greenpeace in Rome, they are unable to attend. But we Legambiente President is willing to engage and would like to attend/speak. They are influential to Italian government who turn to them for environmental advice.

EU Level

- January to March has been very busy time. At the Brussels level there has been increasing activity around progressing deforestation policy action plans. They are launching a commission feasibility study; mapping existing study which assesses policy options. Ultimately this will come together in a stakeholder consultation in September this year. They realise they may also need to commission a study benchmarking standards on palm oil. I am following up with the team at the commission. It will need to be benchmarked against ISPO and other standards at least.
- European Parliament hearing - there is a political track which is gently bubbling away which began with public hearing on Palm Oil and Deforestation in March. DM attended and heard similar rhetoric and misinformed about palm oil. Please with assistance of H+K Brussels that I could meet with leading MEP Katerina Kocecna. In parallel there is a similar debate in the Czech Republic. She is leading charge in EU Parliament. Met with NGO who had been mobilising CR public. Sit down face to face – way to go. MEPs may decide on their political track, research and report to get the commission to do something. Following up with emails and helping them with some their misinformation. Stakeholders are also following closely.
- We are working with Eddie to see if we can get the Italian Govt. to sign up to the Amsterdam Commitment and use EU RT as a public showcase of commitment.

ES: The idea is that there are other governments are now signing up behind the Amsterdam Declaration – more are willing to show commitment to a sustainable palm oil supply chain. Italy is one of them and therefore we thought it would be a good opportunity to have Italy as the leading example

24th June there will be a moment where other member states will sign in front of parliamentarians in Brussels. Danielle and I had a discussion about how we can frame these

conversations. We thought it would be good to start the discussion on the 9th June at the EU RT which is then continued in Brussels on 24th June.

Czech Republic

We were alerted to a social media campaign about the palm oil debate. Political lobbying and consumers writing to retailers has continued but the social media activity has dipped right back down. There is an interest and commitment with the public to embark on a CSPO. We are continuing to engage as this is a good opportunity.

Italy

Over the last few months we had the Italian Union for Sustainable Palm Oil launched a public facing advertising campaign. I have visited the union meeting with key people. RSPO NEXT was a good opportunity and we have good coverage - 35 articles in total including an interview with Stefano on TV. Our advisors see campaign as a threat as they think the campaign has backfired because 5Star has replicated website for the union to negative effect. There is an increasing trend in 'palm oil free' labelling at the same time as the campaign. For our event in Milan we need to get the media messaging and framework right, securing good interviews to counter some of this negativity.

France

Keeping us busy with the parliamentary debates on the biodiversity bill. There is still another reading in the senate next month. CSPO will be exempt from the tax. We were not involved in the lobbying at all to be clear. French Alliance advised us to stay in the background as we represent producers and wholesalers. It was good timing with RSPO NEXT launch; we put our efforts into media work. French Alliance used in their engagement and therefore parliamentarians referenced this in their debates.

Next steps, will it get past second reading? Process of clarifying what is sustainable palm oil. We will ramp up our communications and engagement. We are now starting our engagement with media and stakeholder mapping. The French Alliance's commitment is for the 2020 segregated deforestation palm oil commitment. There is a new report on their standards and uptake – I need to find out more here as it isn't clear.

GC: We have attending the hearing in EU Parliament, many members wanted stronger action. There is a risk that French initiative might inspire other countries to adopt a similar approach, we are seeing it become a political theme. The work done in France is important when influencing other countries or at an EU level to make sure that any new initiatives need to be as much in line with RSPO standard rather than divergent.

DM: Nordics debate bubbling on, I do plan to reengage and check in with the Nordics. Need to improve our engagement with retailers as they feel isolated. We now have more capacity to expand into these countries with Fay and Ashwin on hand.

EU RT 2016 - Emphasis on Deforestation in Messaging Framework

We have two options on our messaging framework which I have been working with H+K. Is the key challenge for discussion to talk about market transformation and the barriers to certification or, is it emphasise climate change and the EU responsibility for deforestation and the need for us to pull together in response how we reconcile this with CSPO development?

This messaging framework is used across external communications, media engagement and to brief the keynote speakers. This will be our conceptual framework.

GC: I should stress these options are completely exclusive. Typical challenges of RSPO Europe are still valid and important to discuss. Nevertheless option 2 reflects the role of discussion about deforestation in the market - how do we reconcile the economic development in the countries where it is grown. There is a lot of attention to this point across the market and media. *(GC cut off...)*

JKV: I do not like option 2. I think this is messaging we are trying to move away from. Option 2 frames RSPO as responsible for deforestation and finding a solution to end it.

DM: I also prefer option 1 however I wanted to do a sense check

JM: A lot of people talk/argument about deforestation and its definition. Back to uptake in Europe, what does RSPO offer to European audience? Option 2 is close to RSPO NEXT; from my concern is it not deliverable right now. This is my point of view.

GC: *Apologies for lost connection.*

CS: Agree option 2 will open up a can of worms because POIG will state they are stronger in this area than RSPO NEXT even if it were deliverable. It is not helpful right now.

JKV: The European audience can help to transform the market. We still have a resource struggle and the consumers will not understand that.

DM: Okay. We are going to go with option 1

GC: I will take the liberty to challenge. It needs to be a stakeholder conversation and the B2B audiences are already aware of the deforestation issue. It is a visible issue and we see it in the media in Europe. It is concern for the growers and the brands who want to protect their reputation and do the right thing. It is not separate from market transformation. How can they be tackled together? In line with the RSPO approach to the big question; how do we continue the market transformation work whilst also exploring the standard for deforestation? We need to acknowledge the debate.

JKV: Option 1 positions as RSPO as facilitator of market transformation. Option 2 frames RSPO as responsible for delivering no deforestation. I think we should stop positioning RSPO as responsible. Deforestation is a much bigger issue than palm oil. Not suggesting we ignore,

just that the key message should be around market transformation to deliver against the issues.

JDT: I agree JKV, it is a single issue and it is not a good route to go down.

GC: I agree it shouldn't be on the deforestation. I think we need to think about the message about market transformation as well as deforestation. We cannot be silent about it and shape the message accordingly.

DM: Just to pull this in. We have unpacked the issues across the conference agenda. We will reformulate in our messaging framework but with a clear emphasis on option 1. Is that okay?

ES: We do have a lot of meetings from end of June where deforestation is on the agenda. We could put it on a broader perspective; there are possibilities to continue this conversation on 24th June in Brussels.

DM: Potentially we could do this.

DM: We are keen to get more Italian stakeholders to the event to interest Italian media.

Future priorities – for discussion and input

- Interesting call with a retailer with a global commitment in Eastern and South Eastern Europe about how we bring together end manufacturers in Greece with refiners in Rotterdam. The retailer is struggling to get certified products. This is just the beginnings of a conversation.
- We're also looking at a journalist tour to source countries with French and Italian media to educate them about CSPO.
- We are also investigating the concept for a reciprocal visit for small holders to visit refineries in Europe. Explore the market etc.

Action Points

- DM to share further update on retailers engagement in Europe
- Update on small holder reciprocal visit

6. AOB & Dates of next Meeting

JM: requests face to face in Milan

AG and JKV unable to attend

Action Point

- DM will circulate Doodle Poll for Milan meeting or an alternative date in June, along with the minutes