

**MINUTES OF MEETING**

**Independent Smallholder – No Deforestation Task Force (IS-NDTF) – 9<sup>th</sup> Meeting**

**Time** : 1930- 2130 (MYT)

**Date** : Tuesday, 11 May 2021

**Venue** : ZOOM Conference Call

**Attendees:**

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Initial</b>	<b>Organisation</b>	<b>Representation Category</b>
1.	Paula den Hartog	PH	Rainforest Alliance	SNGO – Substantive (Co-Chair)
2.	Daniel Uricoechea	DU	Oilsum Group	Smallholder (LATAM) (Co-Chair)
3.	Rob Nicholls	RN	PT. Musim Mas	P&T
4.	Chrissy Durkin	CD	Rainforest Connection	ENGO
5.	Olivia Scholtz	OS	HCVN	Technical Expert
6.	Darren Brown	DB	HCSA	Technical Expert
7.	Daneetha Muniandy	DM	HCSA	Technical Expert
8.	Judy Rodrigues	JR	HCSA	Technical Expert
9.	Marike Leegwater	ML	Solidaridad Network	SHSC, Co- Chair (SNGO)
10.	Lee Kuan Chun	LKC	P&G	SHSC, Co-Chair (CGM)
11.	Aida Greenbury	AG	SPKS	
12.	Mansuetus Darto	MD	SPKS	
13.	Tirza Pandelaki	TP	SPKS	
14.	Julia Majail	JM	RSPO Secretariat	
15.	Krishna Jeyabalan	KJ	RSPO Secretariat	
16.	Tamanjong Victor Yuh	TV	RSPO Secretariat	
17.	Diego Pierrend	DP	RSPO Secretariat	

**Absent with apologies:**

	<b>Name</b>	<b>Initial</b>	<b>Organisation</b>	<b>Representation Category</b>
1.	Angga Prathama Putra	APP	WWF	ENGO
2.	Burhanuddin Ismail	BI	Bunge Loders Croklaan	P&T
3.	Dani Rahadian Hidayat	DH	FORTASBI	Smallholder (Indonesia)
4.	Lesly Vera Gonzales	LV	Solidaridad Network	SNGO– Alternate
5.	J. Cyrus Saygbe	CS	Solidaridad Network	Smallholder (Africa)
6.	Francisco Naranjo	FN	RSPO Secretariat	
7.	Amir Afham	AA	RSPO Secretariat	
8.	Nizar Wicaksono	NW	RSPO Secretariat	

**Agenda:**

Time	Item no	
7:30 – 7:40 pm	1.0	Introductions
7:40 – 7:45 pm	1.1	Adoption of Minutes of Meeting – 8 <sup>th</sup> Meeting
7:45 – 7:55 pm	2.0	Context of the Simplified Combined HCV-HCS Approach

7:55 – 8:05 pm	2.1	Guiding Principles
8:05– 8:25 pm	3.0	Presentation: HCSA Feedback on Simplified Combined HCV-HCS Approach
8:25 – 8:45 pm	3.1	Presentation: Simplified HCS-HCV approach draft v5 (HCSA)
8:45 – 9:15 pm	3.2	Discussion and decision by IS-NDTF
9:15 – 9:25 pm	4.0	Update on Workplan
9:25 – 9:30 pm	4.1	AOB
9:30 pm		Meeting adjourned

### Updates on Action Points from last meeting:

No.	Action Point	Status

No.	Description	Action Points (PIC)	Progress / Remarks
<b>1.0 Introductions</b>			
	<p>The co-chair welcomed all attending members, technical experts and invited guests.</p> <p>Quorum was not achieved. It was proposed and accepted by members of the task force for the meeting to continue with the presentations. However, no decision making will be carried out. Any decision making will be carried out in the next IS-NDTF meeting.</p> <p>Recording of the meeting will be shared with members of the task force who are absent.</p>		
<b>1.1 Adoption of Minutes of Meeting</b>			
	Proposed to be carried out in the next meeting as decision by members are required.		
<b>2.0 Context of the Simplified Combined HCV-HCS Approach</b>			
	<p>An extract of the preamble from the RSPO ISH Standard 2019 was presented to provide context of the development.</p> <p><b>Preamble</b></p>		

<p><b>High Conservation Value (HCV) and High Carbon Stock (HCS) forests</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• This ISH Standard is pursuing the objective of the RSPO Smallholder Strategy to increase smallholder inclusion, prioritise improved practices that also benefit smallholder livelihoods, whilst also upholding the core sustainability requirements.</li> <li>• This includes the protection of areas of HCV and HCS forests. The RSPO has developed a simplified HCV methodology for identifying, protecting and managing HCVs that provides guidance for both existing and new planting.</li> <li>• Aligned with the new HCS requirements in the RSPO P&amp;C 2018, the RSPO, in consultation with the HCSA Steering Group, intends to develop a <b>simplified combined HCV-HCS approach</b> to identify and protect HCS forests. The simplified and combined HCV-HCS approach for independent smallholders will be open to public consultation and will be published no later than November 2020.</li> </ul> <p><b>Feedback:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Clarification was raised by HCSA on adapting of the HCSA toolkit in the RSPO ISH Standard 2019. – The text in the RSPO ISH Standard was shared for the purpose of clarity. The standard does not mention adapting the HCSA toolkit.</li> <li>• The simplified HCSA toolkit was not ready for use when a meeting concerning the RSPO ISH Standard was held. It was agreed to develop an approach whereby HCSA provides input. There was no agreement indicating the HCSA toolkit will be adopted.</li> </ul>		
<p><b>2.1 Guiding Principles</b></p>		
<p>The guiding principles which were adopted by the task force before the development was presented.</p> <p><b>1. Core Sustainability Requirements Are Maintained</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The approach must ensure an adequate level of rigor and not compromise compliance with core sustainability requirements, such as those expressed in <b>Principle 4</b> (Protect, conserve and enhance ecosystems and the environment) of the RSPO ISH Standard. The approach shall also address potential risks as well as safeguards.</li> </ul> <p><b>2. The Assessment Process Is Tailored For an ISH Group Member / GM</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• To address the cost and complexity of the existing Integrated HCV-HCSA Assessment through the development of an approach that is</li> </ul>		

tailored to the ISH context. It should be feasible in all contexts globally and work offline.

**3. Independently Carried out by ISH Group**

- The approach should allow for an ISH GM or Member to use it without prior extensive technical knowledge on HCV and HCS as per the methodology employed by the Simplified HCV Approach.
- An ISH GM or Member may be required to consult for additional material from RSPO. In high risk cases, an assessment by an external technical expert may be required.

**4. Aligned with smallholder strategy (inclusive, step-wise)**

- The approach should be aligned with the RSPO smallholder strategy and the Independent Smallholder Standard aimed at smallholder inclusion and a stepwise approach towards full compliance.

**3.0 Presentation: HCSA Feedback on Simplified Combined HCV-HCS Approach**

For the purpose of flow of discussion, the presentation on the **Simplified HCS-HCV approach draft v5 (HCSA)** was carried out before the feedback presentation.

**Presentation: Simplified HCS-HCV approach draft v5 (HCSA)**

The approach is divided into two sections:

- **Part 1: Guidance** for the Implementation of a Simplified HCS-HCV Approach for Smallholders
- **Part 2: Checklist** For The Implementation of a Simplified HCS-HCV Approach for Smallholders

The stages of HCS-HCV approach implementation for smallholders



**Part 1**

**Stage 1: Preparation**

1. Establish/Confirm independent smallholder group
2. Appoint smallholder lead/team
3. Appoint facilitators, local experts, technical experts
4. Social & Participatory mapping preparation
5. Socialisation materials preparation
6. Indicative HCS-HCV map preparation
7. Initial engagement with village officials and relevant local key stakeholders

**Stage 2: Socialisation and Awareness Raising (First Village Consultation)**

1. Socialization on simplified HCS-HCV approach and its planned activities
2. Defining Area of Interest (AOI)

**Stage 3: Field Check and Identification of HCS forests and HCV areas**

1. Preliminary identification of potential HCS forests and HCVs
2. Participatory land use mapping
3. Field verification

**Stage 4: Management and Monitoring Plan (Second Village Consultation)**

1. Analysis of revised HCS-HCV map based on field verification with community basic needs identified
2. Analysis of livelihood resources utilization and activities in HCS forests and HCVs in proposed ICLUP
3. Simplified HCS Forest Patch Analysis Decision Tree
4. Final Integrated Conservation and Land Use Plan (ICLUP)
5. Resource Management Direction Plan
6. Conflict Resolution Approach/Pathways
7. Management Unit
8. Management & Monitoring Plan

**Part 2**

- Checklist is completed by the smallholder group with the assistance of their support organisation and experts.
- Allows a simple way for smallholders to demonstrate their implementation of the Simplified HCS-HCV Approach.

**Limitation of the scope and adaptation needed**

**1. Other commodities beyond palm oil**

Independent smallholders producing other commodities (e.g., cocoa, coffee, pulp and paper) share similar basic principles but there are different conditions and other common practices in these various commodities. The simplified HCS-HCV approach should be adapted for these different commodities.

**2. Understanding of local/regional legal requirements**

Each country has its own laws and regulations as well as different ecosystems that need to be protected.

**3. A good Map to be used as Indicative Map**

In implementation of this simplified HCSA, Map is important thing to support in determine AOI and analysing risk and management plan

**Support for Smallholders**

- Need support from other parties such as HCSA Steering Group, local NGOs, and/or technical experts.
- HCSA and support partners will aim to work with external partners, parties and donors to provide funding support for the technical assistance and facilitation costs.
- HCSA will provide a base indicative HCS forest/HCV area map & socialisation materials which will be available in multiple languages.
- Part of the HCS-HCV approach implementation with smallholders is to identify and support incentives for the conservation of HCS forests and HCVs and maximise the benefits to communities from the conservation effort.

**Feedback from SPKS outside the HCSA SH presentation:**

- SPKS, as the lead of the HCSA Simplified HCS-HCV Approach for Smallholders development, believes that if RSPO does not implement the HCSA Simplified HCS-HCV Approach for Smallholders it means that RSPO does not implement the 'No-Deforestation' as defined by HCSA.
- SPKS believes that RSPO is focusing on the production side, it is lacking experience in working with farmers who conserve forests. The RSPO certified smallholders to date do not conserve forests.
- The HCSA trials on the HCSA Simplified HCS-HCV Approach for Smallholders are done with independent smallholders in Sanggau and Sekadau in Kalimantan but the SHGC and its implementations are consulted with independent smallholder members of SPKS beyond Sanggau and Sekadau.

**Questions/ Feedback:**

Further information was requested on a general concern faced by smallholders, difficulty in getting technical support, especially in remote locations. – One of the solution that has been mentioned is the usage of indicative maps. There will be ground proofing required, however the idea is for technical tools available to facilitate the identification.

Based on the mention of good maps, a question was posed on the availability for such maps at a global scale. – The plan is for such maps to be available. A mapping working group is also in existance within the HCSA which has carried out trials in various countries around the world to refine

the methodology and mapping framework. Guidance on conducting mapping is also being worked on.

Concerns were raised on when (timelines) smallholders and group managers can adopt such methodologies for use.

**Presentation: HCSA Feedback on Simplified Combined HCV-HCS Approach**

**Note:** Some of the feedback has been addressed in separate meetings between HCSA and RSPO. The simplified FPIC approach is among the items addressed. Further discussion on the feedback will be carried out in the next IS-NDTF Meeting.

**General/high level feedback**

**Feedback based on outline (Flowchart)**

To date only an outline/flow chart of the RSPO approach has been shared - a more detailed technical document is required.

The outline raises a few questions, e.g:

- Who is going to lead the socialisation and field activities with farmers?
- What is meant by the simplified FPIC approach?
- Who designs the precautionary principles - smallholders themselves or are they provided by RSPO?
- How are farmers are expected to define/identify risk areas apart from expectation to fill form (too complex?)

**Terminology**

The term Simplified HCS-HCV Approach for Smallholders is used by HCSA. This is due to HCSA being the broader approach that includes HCV and other aspects and goes a step further to require an Integrated Conservation and Land Use Plan (ICLUP).

**Info sharing**

- RSPO should consider and incorporate the state of play and lessons learned so far from the HCSA trials lead by SPKS and others, which HCSA can provide.
- Independent review commissioned by RSPO in 2020 provided recommendation to include a bare foot identification of HCS forests, methodology for which will be generated. Could HCSA have access to the products of the RSPO tender, and test it in their smallholder HCS-HCV pilots?

**HCSA Feedback and RSPO Guiding Principles**

**1. Core Sustainability Requirements Are Maintained**

- Concerns with risk approach, including HCV probability mapping – indicative HCS mapping more accurate and reliable
- Importance of reviewing HCSA Social Requirements to ensure they are covered, need to clarify RSPO’s ‘simplified FPIC approach’

**2. Independently Carried out by ISH Group**

- Key intent of HCSA’s work. Role of technical expert to simplify work by smallholders. Socialisation is key.
- ISH groups are going to external guidance to get started with this RSPO simplified approach and may need a fair amount of support to follow this process. Unclear what cost implications are, what material support will be available from RSPO.

**Detailed Feedback**

**Concerns with risk approach, incl. HCV probability mapping**

- HCSA does not use a risk assessment framework, in order to be efficient, accurate and practical
- HCV probability mapping found to be inconsistent and inaccurate for identifying HCS forest.

**Proposal: Include indicative mapping of HCS-HCV areas as a prerequisite requirement for both new and existing planting instead of trying to assess risk of presence of HCS forest categories via HCV probability.**

- *RSPO proposal has a land cover identification requirement. Indicative mapping combined with simple field checks is the most efficient and accurate way to achieve this.*
- ***If indicative maps for a landscape do not already exist, RSPO and HCSA to collaborate to ensure they are available.***
- *Once the probability mapping has been replaced by the indicative HCS-HCV mapping, the second half of the process for both can be redesigned to incorporate simple field checks to verify land cover and boundaries.*

**HCSA Social requirements and FPIC**

- HCSA social requirements should be reviewed to ensure they are covered by any proposed simplified approach or elsewhere in RSPO IS standards.
- We don’t have details on the simplified FPIC approach – what is this?

**Participatory decision-making process**

- Not just an assessment – a land-use planning process (conservation, production, other community use)



- Participatory process for decision-making is critical and must be robust. More detail needed to ensure it is inclusive (women, broader community, local governance institutions). Sustainable livelihoods and socio-economic factors must be considered to ensure that the process and agreement of planting and protection (go/no go) is supported by the community.

**Need for socialisation**

- A learning from the HCSA trials was the lack of understanding and awareness around HCS and HCV approaches. Front loading a lot more awareness work is needed. It is difficult to see from the simple flow chart what this involves and how detailed it is.

**Feedback from HCSA:**

- What are the next steps in terms of the feedback provided. – The initial idea was for the feedback to be discussed in the meeting and for members to decide if further actions are required.

**3.2 Discussion and decision by IS-NDTF**

Decision making was not carried out and postponed to the next meeting.

**4.0 Update on Workplan**

**Original Workplan**

Item	Time
Endorsement of ToR for IS-NDTF	July 2020
Establishment of IS-NDTF	July 2020
Development of the simplified combined HCV-HCS approach and tool for ISH (possibility of enhancement of the existing Simplified HCV App to include the HCS element): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Development of TOR</li> <li>• Engagement of vendor to develop the simplified combined HCV-HCS approach and tool for ISH</li> <li>• Development of the simplified combined HCV-HCS approach and tool for ISH including public consultation and/or field testing</li> </ul>	August 2020 - February 2021
Endorsement by SHSC	March 2021
Launching of the new ISH simplified combined HCV-HCS tool	March 2021
Socialization and capacity building	April 2021 - June 2021

**Amended Work Plan as of 10<sup>th</sup> Feb 2021**

- 1. February - March 2021**  
Development of the Additional Component
- 2. April 2021**  
Public Consultation & Field testing

<p><b>3. May 2021</b> Endorsement by Standing Committees Launching of the new ISH simplified combined HCV-HCS tool</p> <p><b>Update on Workplan</b></p> <p><b>1. May – 20<sup>th</sup> July 2021</b> Development of the Additional Component &amp; Field Calibration (Southeast Asia)</p> <p><b>2. August 2021</b> Public Consultation &amp; Field testing</p> <p><b>3. End of Sept 2021</b> Endorsement by Standing Committees Partial launching of the new ISH simplified combined HCV-HCS tool</p> <p><b>4. After October</b> Additional Field Calibrations</p>		
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--	--

**4.1 AOB**

<p>The next steps include the review the feedback by HCSA in the following meeting.</p> <p>A question was raised on the plans for field trials and the barefoot approach from the Ekologika Independent Study</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Two field trials are planned for (One in LATAM or the Western African Region and another trial in either Malaysia or Indonesia). The stakeholders involved will be existing certified ISH (against the RSPO ISH Standard).</li> <li>• The barefoot approach is part of the proposal for the additional components withing the simplified combined HCV-HCS Approach. Further details of the barefoot approach will only be available once the development begins.</li> </ul> <p>A question was also raised on the potential of learning/ information sharing for the field trials on both ends. – This can be carried out an allignment has been achieved.</p> <p>It was mentioned that any raised items (which are mostly technical) should be aimed to be solved within the IS-NDTF before escalation to a higher level is considered.</p>		
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	--	--

**Meeting Adjourned**