

COMPLAINTS PANEL

MINUTES OF MEETING

For Website

26 February 2020 | 6.00pm - 8.00 pm | Meeting No. 02/2020

Meeting location: Jakarta Conference Room, RSPO Kuala Lumpur - Malaysia & via Zoom Link

List of Complaints Panel Member	 Henry Barlow (Chair - CCP) Lim Sian Choo (LSC - Co Chair) Michelle Desilets (MD) Matthias Diemer (MDM) Marieke Leegwater (ML) Lanash Thanda (LT) Suzanne Hall (SH) Peter van der Werf (PVDW) José den Toom (JDT) Pieter Van Dessel (PVD)
Agenda	General Agenda: 6.00 pm to 6.05pm
	 Opening Remarks by Chairperson Declaration of Conflict of Interest To confirm and adopt the minutes of 29 January 2020 during the CP Meeting New Allegations:- RSPO/2020/01/IR - Kwantas Corporation Berhad RSPO/2020/02/SW - PT Permata Hijau Sawit Kebun Papaso - (subsidiary of Permata Hijau Group)
	 c. RSPO/2020/02/SW - PT Musim Mas Holding Pte Ltd 5. Complaints Statistics 6. Any other matters:- a. Dates for Complaints Panel meetings in 2020 b. Expansion of the Complaints Panel c. Collaboration with the Investigation & Monitoring Unit (IMU) d. DSF Updates e. 'Watchmen 2' Report and proposed meeting with authors
	 Waterimen 2 Report and proposed meeting with authors Amnesty International report on Wilmar International - a media enquiry by Sydney Morning Herald.
	8. Research Report, "Palming Off Responsibility: Labour rights violations in the Indonesian palm oil sector by SOMO and CNV International (PT Aneka Int Persada - Sime Darby; and PT Murini Sam Sam – Wilmar).
	 Commitment of Financial Institutions. GA Resolution - GA15-6d: Discouraging RSPO members subject to complaints

from avoiding their obligations by divesting or withdrawing their membership.



11. Complaints for deliberation:-

Group 1: 6.05pm - 7.30 pm

- 1. FELDA vs Orang Dusun Lahad Datu (Desa Begahak/Robin Balud)
- 2. Agropalma S.A vs José Maria Tabaranã da Costa and Aida Raimunda Maia da Costa
- 3. Hap Seng Plantations Holdings Bhd vs Sia Yi Chin
- 4. PT. Pusaka Agro Lestari (PT. PAL) subsidiary of Noble Plantation vs RSPO Secretariat
- 5. PT. Mitra Austral Sejahtera (PT. MAS) subsidiary of Sime Darby vs Transformasi untuk Keadilan (TuK-NGO)
- 6. Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL) vs. Green Advocate for the Butaw Community & Forest Peoples Programme & SDI & SESDev & A-Bloteh
- 7. PT. Harapan Sawit Lestari (PT. HSL) subsidiary of Cargill vs Link-AR Borneo
- 8. AMP Plantation a subsidiary of Wilmar vs KUD Dasra (represented by lawyer)
- 9. HSA Group (Pacific Inter Link, Pacific Oils & Fats Industries Sdn Bhd, PT Pacific Indopalm Industries, PT. Pacific Medan Industri, PT. Pacific Palmindo Industri) vs Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA) & Greenpeace
- 10. Pacific Inter-Link (Papuan Concessions) vs Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA) & Greenpeace
- 11. PT. Berkat Sawit Sejati (subsidiary of Musim Mas) vs Hutan Kita Institute (HaKI)
- 12. Nacional Agro Industrial, S. A. (subsidiary of KH Regional Group Inc.) vs Consejo Nacional de Desplazados de Guatemala CONDEG
- 13. PT Buana Wira Lestari vs (requested for confidentiality)

Group 2: 7.35pm - 7.45pm

- 1. Extractora La Gloria S.A.S. vs ASOCOL & ASOCADAR
- 2. PT. Bumitama Gunajaya Abadi (PT. BGA) subsidiary of Bumitama vs Sawit Watch
- 3. PT. Hati Prima Agro (PT. HPA) subsidiary of Bumitama vs Sawit Watch
- 4. Palmas Del Espino S.A. vs FREDEIALBA
- 5. FELDA Global Ventures Holding Berhad (FGV) vs RSPO Secretariat (on the basis of an article by Chain Reaction Research)
- 6. Golden Agri Resources (GAR) vs Forest Peoples Programme & TuK Indonesia
- 7. Presco PLC Nigeria (SIAT SA) vs Indigenous People of Oruarivie-Abraka Kingdom
- 8. PT. Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO) vs Koalisi Organisasi Serikat Pekerja dan Lembaga Swadaya Masyarakat Kabupaten Labuhan Batu, FSMI. TIPAN-RI
- 9. PT. Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO) vs requested for confidentiality
- 10. PT. Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO) vs Federasi Serikat Pekerja Metal Indonesia (FSPMI)
- 11. PT. Bilah Platindo (MP Evans) vs Federasi Serikat Pekerja Metal Indonesia (FSPMI)
- 12. PRESCO PLC (a subsidiary of SIAT SA) vs Delta Agricultural Stakeholders Farmers Union
- 13. PT Socfin Indonesia (subsidiary of Socfin SA) vs Lembaga Swadaya Masyarakat Team Investigation Penyelamat Asset Negara Republik Indonesia
- 14. Presco Plc vs Ovre Eku Community



Group 3: 7.50pm-8.00pm

- 1. PT. Kartika Prima Cipta (PT. KPC) subsidiary of Golden Agri Resources (GAR) vs Forest Peoples Programme & TuK Indonesia
- 2. Poligrow vs Video by Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA)
- 3. Goodhope Asia Holdings Ltd vs RSPO Secretariat
- 4. IOI Pelita subsidiary of IOI Group vs Community of Long Teran Kanan
- 5. Primatama Mulia Jaya vs Masyarakat Adat Luhak Saparampek Simpang Tigo
- 6. PT. Agro Lestari Mandiri (PT. ALM) subsidiary of Sinarmas vs Serikat Buruh Sejahtera Indonesia Kabupaten Ketapang
- 7. PT. Perkebunan Nusantara III (PT. PN) vs Pemimpinan Cabang Federasi Serikat Pekerja Metal Indonesia
- 8. PT. SMART Tbk subsidiary of Golden Agri Resources (GAR) vs Masyarakat Dusun I/II/III Belongkut
- 9. Oleaginosas Del Peru S.A. (OLPESA) vs Community of Santa Clara de Uchunya.
- 10. Unico Desa Palm Oil Mill (IOI Corporation Berhad) vs Leap Spiral on behalf of Kampung Sri Ganda
- 11. PT. PHP/AMP Plantation (subsidiary of Wilmar) vs Represented by Lawyer on behalf local community
- 12. Boustead Rimba Nilai (subsidiary of Boustead Plantations Berhad) vs Mr Sauddin Che Lamin
- 13. Norpalm Ghana Limited vs Landowners of Ewusiejoe





DETAILS OF THE AGENDA:

No.	Agenda
1.	Opening Remarks from Chairperson
	Opening speech by CCP.
2.	Declaration of "No Conflict of Interest"
	No conflict of interest declared
3.	To confirm and adopt the minutes of 29 January 2020 during the Complaints Panel Meeting.
	Minutes of 29 January 2020 adopted unanimously with minor edits.



4. New allegation submitted

a. RSPO/2020/01/IR Kwantas Corporation Berhad

Complainant :- Boustead Emastulin Sdn Bhd (subsidiary of Boustead Plantations Berhad)

Complaint received :- 9 January 2020 Location :- Lahad Datu, Sabah

Allegations :- Invasion of Boustead Plantations Berhad's main access road by

Kwantas Corporation Berhad.

Discussion from 26 February 2020 (CP Meeting):-

1. Secretariat to obtain further information from parties following the discussion on Initial Diagnosis.

b. RSPO/2020/02/SW PT Permata Hijau Sawit Kebun Papaso

(subsidiary of Permata Hijau Group)

Complainant :- (requested for confidentiality)

Complaint received :- 14 January 2020

Location :- North Sumatera, Indonesia

Allegations :- The workers were not issued payslips;

No adequate health facilities and no adequate housing facilities

provided for the workers;

The workers were not given the freedom to join the unions; workers are Imposed working hours that are not in accordance

with the provisions;

Contract workers were employed for the main job;

The Respondent does not have the company regulations as

required by law.

Discussion from 26 February 2020 (CP Meeting):-

1. Initial Diagnosis is in progress

c. RSPO/2020/03/SW PT Musim Mas Holding Pte Ltd

Complainant :- (requested for confidentiality)

Complaint received :- 11 February 2020 Location :- Riau, Indonesia

Allegations :- Land fires occurred in the conservation area within the PT Musim

Mas HGU covering an area of 12 hectares; Damaging the river by damming the river flow;

Planting on peatland and in protected areas of riverbank

Discussion from 26 February 2020 (CP Meeting):-

1. Initial Diagnosis is in progress



5. Complaints Cases Statistics

Total Cases in 2018:

	May-2018	June-2018	July-2018	Aug-2018
Complaints received	4	0	1	3
Status	Open (1) Closed (3)	-	Open (1)	Open (2) Closed (1)
Certified	-	-	-	-
Country	Indonesia (4)	-	Indonesia (1)	Indonesia (2) Singapore (1)
Case Category	-FPIC (2) -HCV (2)	-	-FPIC (1)	-Breach of Code of Conduct (2) -Minimum Wage (1)

	Sept-2018	Oct-2018	Nov-2018	Dec-2018
Complaints received	2	6	0	0
Status	Open (1) Closed (1)	Open (2) Closed (4)	-	-
Certified	-	-	-	-
Country	Indonesia (1) Nigeria (1)	Indonesia (3) Nigeria (1) Liberia (1) Others (1)	-	-
Case Category	-Occupational Hazard (1) -FPIC (1)	-Breach of Code of Conduct (2) -FPIC (2) -Compensation (1) -Wage (1)	-	-



Total Cases in 2019:

	Jan-2019	Feb-2019	Mar-2019	Apr-2019
Complaints received	2	1	3	4
Status	Open (1) Closed (1)	Rejected (1)	Open (2) Rejected (1)	Open (2) Rejected (1) Closed (1)
Certified	-	-	-	-
Country	Indonesia (2)	Malaysia(1)	Indonesia (1) Peru (2)	Indonesia (3) Nigeria (1)
Case Category	-Occupational Hazard (1) -FPIC (1)	- FPIC (1)	-Deforestation (3) - FPIC (2)	-Occupational Hazard (1) -No Festive Holidays (3) - Infringement of copyright (1)

	May 2019	Jun 2019	July 2019	Aug 2019
Complaints received	2	3	1	1
Status	Open (2)	Open (3)	Open (1)	Open (1)
Certified	-		-	
Country	Indonesia (1) Malaysia (1)	Indonesia (1) Guatemala (1) Nigeria (1)	Indonesia (1)	Malaysia(1)
Case Category	- Wages (1) -No Festive Holidays (1) -conservation area for water (1)	-Workers unjustifiably dismissed (1) - Social Benefits (1) -Customary rights (1)	-Customary rights (1)	Terminated based on mental health discrimination (1)



	Sept-2019	Oct-2019	Nov-2019	Dec-2019
Complaints received	0	3	0	1
Status	-	Open (3)	-	Open (1)
Certified	-	-	-	-
Country	-	Indonesia (1) Ghana (1) Nigeria (1)	-	Sierra Leone (1)
Case Category	-	Breach of Code of Conduct (1) Compensation (1) Pollution (1)	0	1

Total Cases in 2020

	Jan-2020	Feb-2020	Mar-2020	Apr-2020
Complaints received	2	1	-	-
Status	Open (2)	Open (1)	-	-
Certified	-	-	-	-
Country	Malaysia (1) Indonesia (1)	Indonesia (1)	-	-
Case Category	-Invasion of main access road (1) -Wage, safety (1)	- Land fires - River Pollution - Planting onPeat	-	-



Total Active Cases by Country and Year (as of 26.02.2020)

Country	Active Cases
Indonesia	25
Malaysia	6
Colombia	2
Nigeria	3
Singapore	0
Peru	2
Brazil	1
Liberia	1
Guatemala	1
Ghana	1
Sierra Leone	0
Cayman Island	1
TOTAL	43

Year	Active Cases
2009	0
2010	1
2011	0
2012	1
2013	0
2014	1
2015	6
2016	0
2017	6
2018	10
2019	15
2020	3
TOTAL	43

Discussion from 26 February 2020 (CP Meeting):-

- 1. ASC and CP meeting to proceed as scheduled. The Secretariat is currently waiting for feedback from the Co-Chairs of the ASC on the topics for discussion.
- 2. A formal invitation is to be issued to the Co-Chairs of the ASC for the physical meeting.



6. Any other matter

a. Dates for Complaints Panel Physical Meeting in 2020:

Discussion from 26 February 2020 (CP Meeting):-

- 1. CP Physical meeting to proceed as scheduled.
- 2. Request to bring the CP meeting forward in May (in light of the Eid Festival) is granted by the CP.
- b. Expansion of Complaints Panel

Discussion from 26 February 2020 (CP Meeting):-

- 1. An application has been submitted by an individual for the position as CP member. The Secretariat is currently reviewing the supporting documents before proceeding to convene the Selection Committee.
- c. Collaboration with the Investigation and Monitoring Unit

Discussion from 26 February 2020 (CP Meeting):-

- i) PT Limpah Sejahtera:-
 - 1. The Secretariat has released the decision letter to First Resources on 18.02.2020. The Secretariat has proposed that this be removed from the agenda moving forward.
- ii) PT Permata Hijau Pasaman:-
 - 1. Pending Briefing Note from IMU on this matter.
- iii) FGV :-
 - 1. Secretariat to draft a response with respect to the Complaint's Panel response to FGV's letter.



d. DSF Updates:

Discussion from 26 February 2020 (CP Meeting):-

- 1. A new Consultant has been identified and has agreed to take on the role as DSF Consultant.
- 2. The Secretariat will be proceeding with procurement and engagement.
- e. 'Watchmen 2' Report and proposed meeting with authors

Discussion from 26 February 2020 (CP Meeting):-

- 1. Internal analysis on the report submitted to CP for the CP's review.
- 7. Media Inquiry: Amnesty International Investigation report on Wilmar International Sydney Morning Herald on 28 November 2016

"Amnesty International interviewed 120 workers working on palm plantations owned by two Wilmar subsidiaries and three Wilmar suppliers in Kalimantan and Sumatra in Indonesia. The investigation exposed a wide range of abuses including:

- a. Women were forced to work long hours under the threat of having their pay cut, paid below minimum wage and kept in insecure employment without pensions or health insurance;
- b. Children as young as eight doing hazardous, hard physical work, sometimes dropping out of school to help their parents on the plantation;
- c. Workers suffering severe injuries from paraquat, an acutely toxic chemical banned by the EU and by Wilmar itself;
- d. Workers being made to work outdoors without adequate safety;
- e. Workers having to work long hours to meet ridiculously high targets, some of which involve highly physically demanding tasks".

Discussion from 26 February 2020 (CP Meeting):-

1. The letter of transfer is being drafted and will be sent to the CP once completed.



8. Research Report, "Palming Off Responsibility: Labour rights violations in the Indonesian Palm Oil Sector, by SMO and CNV International (PT Aneka Inti Persada - Sime Darby; and PT Murini Sam Sam - Wilmar)

13 June 2017 – SOMO/CNV International published their report on labour violations at PT Murini Sam Sam and PT Aneka Inti Persada. The report was also forwarded to RSPO.

The following violations were noted in the report:

- 1. PT Murini Sam Sam
 - Temporary workers and contract issues
 - Wages and overwork
 - Child labour
 - Health and safety
 - Gender equality mainly hired as plantation maintenance workers and as such employed on a seasonal basis. Day workers are denied their 3 months of paid maternity leave.
 - Freedom of association
- 2. PT Aneka Inti Persada:
 - Temporary workers and contract issues
 - Wages and workload
 - Child labour
 - Health and safety
 - Gender equality
 - Freedom of association

Discussion from 26 February 2020 (CP Meeting):-

- 1. The Briefing Note is being finalised.
- 9. Commitments of Financial Institution(s)

Discussion from 26 February 2020 (CP Meeting):-

- 1. Issue on Central Banks previously raised for discussion is held in abeyance pending finalisation of the Secretariat's internal matters.
- 10. GA Resolution GA15-6d Discouraging RSPO members subject to complaints from avoiding their obligations by divesting or withdrawing their membership

Discussion from 26 February 2020 (CP Meeting):-

1. The Secretariat is working on the first draft and the same is expected to be ready for public consultation in mid March 2020.





COMPLAINTS FOR DELIBERATION: GROUP 1

Complaint 1.1 FEL	Complaint 1.1 FELDA vs Orang Dusun Lahad Datu (Desa Begahak/Robin Balud)			
Date Filed	16 February 2015			
Respondent	FELDA (Federal Land Development Authority) (Felda Ventures Bhd)			
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower			
Country	Malaysia			
Complainant	Orang Dusun Lahad Datu (Desa Begahak/Robin Balud)			
Nature of Complaint	According to the Enquiry National Hak Tanah Malaysia document, the state government had given 1260 acres of land to the Dusun Begahak community in 1981. At the same time, the same land was alienated to FELDA for development. The complainant raised the issue that FELDA has no right to develop their land and should return it to the community because the land originally belonged to the community. The complainant also stated that the cemetery area is being developed by FELDA. FELDA enclaved 916 acres of the said land and gave it back to the community. The community planted fruits and other crops on the land. A police report has been made by the community and that is the source of the complaint.			
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation			
Decision / Justification	 Status quo. Pending outcome of the appeal before the Sabah Lands and Surveys Department. 			



Complaint 1.2 Agropalma S.A. vs José Maria Tabaranã da Costa and Aida Raimunda Maia da Costa		
Date Filed	13 August 2015	
Respondent	Agropalma SA	
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower	
Country	Brazil	
Complainant	José Maria Tabaranã da Costa and Aida Raimunda Maia da Costa.	
Complaint description	That Agropalma has acquired land and planted oil palm in violation of the RSPO Principles and Criteria.	
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation	
Decision / Justification	1. Status Quo. Pending outcome of the Court's process.	





Complaint 1.3 Hap Seng Plantations Holdings Bhd vs Sia Yi Chin	
Date Filed	11 November 2015
Respondent	Hap Seng Plantations Holdings Bhd
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Sia Yi Chin of Lahad Datu, Sabah
Complaint description	The complainant is claiming that Hap Seng Plantations Bhd is illegally occupying his property (River Estates) of 6,454 acres in Lahad Datu, Sabah. He says that he is the beneficial owner of the said land and the land office in Kota Kinabalu has confirmed that the said land is still in his name as beneficial owner. He has filed a civil suit against Hap Seng; originating summons: BKI-24-127/5 of 2012 filed on 30.07.2015
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	 Status Quo. Pending outcome of the Court's process. The next trial date is end of March 2020.



Complaint 1.4 PT. Pusaka Agro Lestari (PT. PAL - Noble Plantation) vs RSPO Secretariat	
Date Filed	20 June 2017
Respondent	PT Pusaka Agro Lestari
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	RSPO Secretariat
Complaint description	 Potential risk on Clearance a large areas of Primary Forest in Papua; Official Complaint against one of HCV Assessors – Nyoto Susanto.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. Secretariat to draft a letter of warning to the Respondent.



Complaint 1.5 PT. Mitra Austral Sejahtera (Sime Darby) vs NGO TuK	
Date Filed	31 October 2012 (Under DSF) 9 June 2017 (Transferred to the CP)
Respondent	PT Mitra Austral Sejahtera (Sime Darby subsidiary)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Transformasi untuk Keadilan (TuK)
Complaint description	The communities of Sanggau have alleged that the company PT Mitra Austral Sejahtera is operating without: 1. Lack of Transparency on land status and partnership agreements 2. Lack of compliance to our customary land rights 3. The absence of (documented) compensation 4. Lack of compliance to local regulations In acting so they are alleged to have breached RSPO Principles and Criteria specifically on: Principle 1 on Transparency, Principle 2 on Compliance with applicable laws and Principle 6 Responsible consideration of employees and individuals and communities affected by growers and mills.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	Secretariat to release the finalised independent legal review to both parties for their records.







Complaint 1.6 Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL) vs. Green Advocate for the Butaw Community; FPP; SDI; SESDev; A-Bloteh		
Date Filed	2 October 2012	
Respondent	Golden Veroleum Liberia (GVL)	
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower	
Country	Liberia	
Complainant	Green Advocate for the Butaw Community; FPP; SDI; SESDev; A-Bloteh	
Complaint description	 a. has not provided public notification for a 30 day period consistent with the New Planting Procedures; b. commencing land preparation new planting and infrastructure development prior to the expiry of the minimum 30-day period; c. By not conducting a comprehensive and participatory independent social and environmental impact assessment(s) of the area concerned and incorporate the results into relevant action plans (see RSPO criteria 5.1, 6.1, 7.1 & 7.4) including the identification of: (a) all primary forest, (b) any area required to maintain or enhance one or more High Conservation Values (HCVs), and (d) local peoples' land; d. Clearing land without the free, prior and informed consent of the customary land owners as represented through representative organizations of their choice (P&C 2.2, 2.3, 7.5 and 7.6). 	
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation	
Decision / Justification	 CP and Secretariat's observation trip to Liberia held in abeyance in light of Covid-19 outbreak which led to recalling of visas by the local authorities. Implementation of CP's decision in the Tarjuowon area is progressing with the independent facilitator's trip to Liberia tentatively scheduled for the 2nd week of March 2020. 	



Complaint 1.7 PT. Harapan Sawit Lestari (Cargill) vs Link-AR Borneo	
Date Filed	25 May 2018
Respondent	PT Harapan Sawit Lestari (Cargill)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Link-AR Borneo
Complaint description	PT Harapan Sawit Lestari allegedly commenced the re-planting activities without proper consent from the local community of Asam Besar in West Kalimantan.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The Briefing Note is in progress.

Complaint 1.8 AMP Plantation (Wilmar) vs KUD Dasra (represented by lawyer)	
Date Filed	30 April 2018
Respondent	AMP Plantation (Wilmar)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Represented by lawyer on behalf of KUD Dasra
Complaint description	Dispute regarding plasma cooperation with KUD Dasra.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The Briefing Note is in progress.



Complaint

description

Decision /

Justification

Status



Complaint 1.9 HSA Group (Pacific Inter-Link, Pacific Oils & Fats Industries Sdn Bhd, PT. Pacific Indopalm Industries, PT. Pacific Medan Industri, PT. Pacific Palmindo Industri) vs Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA) & Greenpeace **Date Filed** 15 October 2018 Respondent HSA Group (Pacific Inter-Link, Pacific Oils & Fats Industries Sdn Bhd, PT. Pacific Indopalm Industries, PT. Pacific Medan Industri, PT. Pacific Palmindo Industri) Membership Oil Palm Grower Category Country Malaysia / Cayman Island Complainant Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA) & Greenpeace Breach of Code of Conduct - violation of the RSPO Group Membership rules. All the

Group, but still registered as separate RSPO members.

(C) CP constituted

companies (stated above) are alleged to be part of the Hayel Saeed Anam (HSA)

1. Briefing Note is drafted. Pending internal review before submission.



Complaint 1.10 Pacific Inter-Link (Papuan Concessions) vs Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA) & Greenpeace	
Date Filed	15 October 2018
Respondent	Pacific Inter-Link (Papuan Concessions)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Environmental Investigation Agency (EIA) & Greenpeace
Complaint description	Violation of the RSPO Code of Conduct because of their alleged involvement in the control/ownership and operational development of four palm oil plantation companies in Papua.
Status	(C) CP constituted
Decision / Justification	1. Briefing Note is drafted. Pending internal review before submission.



Complaint 1.11 PT Berkat Sawit Sejati (subsidiary of Musim Mas) vs Hutan Kita Institute (HaKI)		
Date Filed	12 March 2019	
Respondent	PT Berkat Sawit Sejati (subsidiary of Musim Mas)	
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower	
Country	Indonesia	
Complainant	Hutan Kita Institute (HaKI)(Indonesia)	
Complaint description	Allegations: 1. indicated using the area of Dangku Wildlife Reserve (SM) approximately 2,600 Ha and production forest area (HP) of approximately 3,200 Ha.	
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation	
Decision / Justification	1. The Briefing Note is in progress.	



Complaint 1.12 Nacional Agro Industrial, S.A. (subsidiary of KH Regional Group Inc.) vs Consejo Nacional de Desplazados de Guatemala - CONDEG -(Guatemala) **Date Filed** 8 June 2019 Respondent Nacional Agro Industrial, S. A. (subsidiary of KH Regional Group Inc.) Membership Oil Palm Grower Category Country Guatemala Complainant Consejo Nacional de Desplazados de Guatemala - CONDEG Complaint Allegations: description 1. Unjustifiably dismissed 50 workers. 2. Naisa violates the code of ethical conduct through their contractor companies, 1) Hidrogen y oxigeno, SA. (2) Labores y Servicious, SA, (3) Sevicious Agricolas del Peten, SA. (D) Investigation / deliberation **Status** Decision / 1. The auditors have concluded the Special Audit. **Justification** Pending receipt of the Special Audit report from the Certification Body.



Complaint 1.13 PT Buana Wira Lestari vs requested for confidentiality		
Date Filed	29 October 2019	
Respondent	PT Buana Wira Lestari	
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower	
Country	Indonesia	
Complainant	requested for confidentiality	
Complaint description	 The Respondent planted oil palm trees outside the HGU and planted oil palm trees at the edge of the river which resulted in damage to the watershed. The Respondent is polluting the river water and also the surrounding community settlement caused by the liquid waste from the palm oil mills. The Respondent never watered the road traversed by its FFB and CPO transport trucks which affected the health of the community of two villages due to dust pollution. The Respondent mill's chimney emits black smoke and causes air pollution. The Respondent did not provide proper social assistance to the local community. 	
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation	
Decision / Justification	 The Complainant has agreed to attempt to resolve the complaint by way of Bilateral Engagement. The deadline of the process is on 30 April 2020. 	



GROUP 2

Complaint 2.1 Ext	Complaint 2.1 Extractora de La Gloria SAS vs ASOCOL, ASOCADAR	
Date Filed	19 November 2015	
Respondent	Extractora de la Gloria SAS	
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower	
Country	Colombia	
Complainant	Fredy Antonio Corrales, representative of the Colombian Association for Displaced Peoples' Prospects (ASOCOL), Adelfo Segundo Rodríguez, representative of the Association of Returning Displaced Farmers (ASOCADAR), Senator Iván Cepeda, Senator Alberto Castilla, and Representative Alirio Uribe	
Complaint description	Fredy Antonio Corrales, representative of the Colombian Association for Displaced Peoples' Prospects (ASOCOL), Adelfo Segundo Rodríguez, representative of the Association of Returning Displaced Farmers (ASOCADAR), Senator Iván Cepeda,	



		RSPO
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation	
Decision / Justification	1. The Briefing Note is in progress.	

Complaint 2.2 PT. Bumitama Gunajaya Abadi (PT.BGA - Bumitama) vs Sawit Watch		
Date Filed	13 November 2015	
Respondent	PT Bumitama Gunajaya Abadi	
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower	
Country	Indonesia	
Complainant	Sawit Watch	
Complaint description	 The allegations are:- Destroying graves and planting trees surrounding the graves; Dispute on plasma scheme mechanism; Termination of labourers and the status of labourer i.e. are they casual or permanent? Compensation not paid directly to the land owner; Loss of land certification and using the land of migrants which is still under control of the owner. 	
Status	(F) Complaints Panel Decision	
Decision / Justification	1. The Decision letter is in progress.	



Complaint 2.3 PT. Hati Prima Agro (PT.HPA - Bumitama) vs Sawit Watch	
Date Filed	13 October 2017
Respondent	PT Hati Prima Agro (Bumitama)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Sawit Watch
Complaint description	A complaint was initially lodged in 2012 on allegations related to land matters. It was dismissed in April 2015 when Bumitama said that they were planning to divest the property and no longer had management control. However, in this request for reopening of the complaint, the complainant (Sawit Watch, EIA, and Greenpeace) has made allegations that although Bumitama claimed to have divested the property they continued to have management control. Further, in July 2016 Bumitama had repurchased the concession unit. Thus, the request for reopening is on the basis that Bumitama allegedly made deceptive claims before the Complaints Panel. The Complainants further claim that Bumitama had not submitted NPP despite the land clearance.
Status	(F) Complaints Panel Decision
Decision / Justification	1. The Draft Letter to the legal reviewer is being finalised.



Decision /

Justification



Agenda moving forward.

1. Decision delivered and Complaint closed. To be removed from the



Complaint 2.5 Felda Global Ventures Holding Berhad vs RSPO Secretariat	
Date Filed	19 April 2017
Respondent	Felda Global Ventures Holding Berhad
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	RSPO Secretariat (on the basis of Article by Chain Reaction Research)
Complaint description	There was a report issued by Chain Reaction which reported the fact that FGV in their Kalimantan concession had cleared 1600 Ha peat forest. On 25th April 2017 Secretariat had a meeting with FGV and they claimed that they only planted on less than 100 Ha of shallow peat. We had requested them to give an update. The update on an independent audit done by Aksenta showed that there was no deforestation. At the moment, we are still waiting for written clarification from FGV and their further actions.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. Pending endorsement of CP's letter to the Respondent



Complaint 2.6 Golden Agri Resources vs Forest Peoples Programme (FPP) & TuK	
Date Filed	22 August 2018
Respondent	Golden Agri Resources
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Forest Peoples Programme (FPP) and Tuk- Indonesia
Complaint description	GAR's shadow companies are actively clearing lands.
Status	(C) CP constituted
Decision / Justification	 The Secretariat has identified a law firm agreeing to conduct the due diligence against the Respondent. Procurement ongoing.



Complaint 2.7 Presco PLC Nigeria (SIAT SA) vs Indigenous People of Oruarivie-Abraka Kingdom	
Date Filed	17 September 2018
Respondent	Presco PLC Nigeria (SIAT SA)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Nigeria
Complainant	Indigenous People of Oruarivie-Abraka Kingdom
Complaint description	For the past five years, PRESCO, in conjunction with the Edo State Government, through its Ministry of Agriculture and Natural Resources; the Police in Benin City, Edo State; and the Nigeria Army's 4th Brigade (also located in Benin City, Edo State), has been forcefully encroaching into ancestral and customarily owned indigenous farm lands, including Oruarivie-Abraka ancestral farm lands, situated in Delta State (a neighbouring State to Edo State, where PRESCO's Head Office is located), and forcefully evicting local farmers from these ancestral and customarily owned indigenous farm lands measuring approximately three thousand hectares (well beyond the Edo State boundaries), and forcefully and illegally grabbing same for its palm oil plantation expansionist activities.
Status	(C) CP constituted
Decision / Justification	Pending receipt of an update from the Respondent on the mediation process.



Complaint 2.8 PT Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO) vs Koalisi Organisasi Serikat Pekerja dan Lembaga Swadaya Masyarakat Kabupaten Labuhan Batu, FSMI. TIPAN-RIPT

Date Filed	10 April 2019
Respondent	PT Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	North Sumatera, Indonesia
Complainant	Koalisi Organisasi Serikat Pekerja dan Lembaga Swadaya Masyarakat Kabupaten Labuhan Batu, FSMI. TIPAN-RI
Complaint description	 Lack of adequate health and safety equipment; Worker died due to lack of safety equipment; and No festive holidays for temporary workers.
Status	(D) Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	The Secretariat is reviewing the Special Audit report obtained by the Assurance Team and will update the CP members on the progress.

Complaint 2.9 PT Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO) vs requested for confidentiality	
Date Filed	29 April 2019
Respondent	PT Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	North Sumatera, Indonesia
Complainant	(requested for confidentiality)
Complaint description	 Temporary workers contract and wages issues Intimidation of workers
Status	(D) Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The Briefing Note is in progress.



Complaint 2.10 PT Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO) vs Federasi Serikat Pekerja Metal Indonesia (FSPMI)	
Date Filed	6 May 2019
Respondent	PT Perkebunan Nusantara IV (PERSERO)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	North Sumatra, Indonesia
Complainant	Federasi Serikat Pekerja Metal Indonesia (FSPMI)
Complaint description	 Alleged fraud of wages for 7 workers, No festive holidays and bonus for temporary workers
Status	(D) Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The Briefing Note is in progress.



Complaint 2.11 PT Bilah Platindo (subsidiary of MP Evans) vs Federasi Serikat Pekerja Metal Indonesia (FSPMI) - (Indonesia)	
Date Filed	24 June 2019
Respondent	PT Bilah Platindo (subsidiary of MP Evans)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Federasi Serikat Pekerja Metal Indonesia (FSPMI)
Complaint description	 2 daily workers died due to an accident happened on 23 February 2018. Victims were not registered with Indonesia's social insurance scheme and were not covered during the accident.
Status	(D) Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The Briefing Note is in progress.



Complaint 2.12 Presco PLC Nigeria (SIAT SA) vs Delta Agricultural Stakeholders Farmers Union - Nigeria	
Date Filed	24 June 2019
Respondent	Presco PLC Nigeria (SIAT SA)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Nigeria
Complainant	Delta Agricultural Stakeholders Farmers Union
Complaint description	There have been major unlawful invasion and forceful takeover of local farm lands by the Respondent.
Status	(D) Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. Decision delivered. Pending expiry of the appeals period on 20.04.2020.



Complaint 2.13 PT. Socfin Indonesia (subsidiary of Socfin SA) vs Lembaga Swadaya Masyarakat Team Investigation Penyelamat Asset Negara Republik Indonesia (LSM.TIPAN-RI) (Indonesia)

Date Filed	26 July 2019
Respondent	PT Socfin Indonesia (subsidiary of Socfin SA)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Lembaga Swadaya Masyarakat Team Investigation Penyelamat Asset Negara Republik Indonesia (LSM.TIPAN-RI)
Complaint description	PT Socfin Indonesia used the land of 13 community members of Desa Negeri Lama Seberang without their express consent for the PT Socfin Indonesia water pipeline which is approximately 900 meters in length. The water pipeline extends from the Bilah River to the PT Socfin Indonesia palm oil mill.
Status	(D) Investigation/Deliberation
Decision / Justification	 The Complainant sent a formal letter to the Secretariat stating their wishes to withdraw the Complaint. The Complaints Panel has directed the Secretariat to obtain confirmation from the community on the status of the withdrawal.





Complaint 2.14 Presco Plc vs Ovre Eku Community (Nigeria)	
Date Filed	28 October 2029
Respondent	Presco Plc
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Nigeria
Complainant	Ovre Eku Community
Complaint description	Invasion forcible entry to Ovre-Eku Land by Presco Plc.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The Briefing Note is now in progress.



GROUP 3

Complaint 3.1 PT. Kartika Prima Cipta (GAR) vs Forest Peoples Programme & TuK	
Date Filed	14 October 2014
Respondent	Golden Agri Resources (GAR) – PT Kartika Prima Cipta (KPC)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia – Kapuas Hulu, West Kalimantan
Complainant	Forest Peoples Programme (FPP) and (Transformasi untuk Keadilan) TuK Indonesia
Complaint description	 Points raised:- PT KPC is in persistent violation of the RSPO P&C pertaining HCV assessment, the recognition of customary land rights and free, prior, and informed consent (FPIC). Lack of FPIC of the local Dayak and Malay people in the process of land take over. Land takeover was done without land tenure study and participatory mapping. Late HCV assessment which was done by IPB, final consultation was in May 2014. Dissatisfaction by smallholders and resentment because of reduced post facto set aside for HCV rather than getting plasma scheme (20%). Set aside land as HCS area that made no provision for customary land uses and tenure and local people livelihood. GAR as the parent company of all 18 subsidiaries listed in acting in violation of the New Planting Procedure (NPP) by submitting information which is known as false. No HGU in 16 of 18 NPP. The assessors which have endorsed GAR's HCV assessment, ESIAs and social engagement actions, are in violation of their responsibility to provide impartial assessment of company compliance with RSPO P&C.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The HCV review will be concluded by the end of March 2020.





Complaint 3.2 Poligrow vs Video by Environmental Investigation Agency	
Date Filed	13 August 2015
Respondent	Poligrow Colombia
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Colombia
Complainant	Environmental Investigation Agency
Complaint description	ElA's video, "Between Water and Oil Palm," is a collaboration with Colombian group La ComisiónIntereclesial de Justicia y Paz (Justicia y Paz) and has documented how investments have come at the expense of indigenous rights in Mapiripán, Meta, Colombia. One company, the Italian-owned Poligrow Ltd, has prohibited the Jiw and Sikuani indigenous communities from using traditional hunting and fishing lands, and prevented access to a culturally revered site, Las Toninas—a lake considered sacred and home to pink dolphins. The Jiw report that no free, prior, or informed consultation has taken place regarding Poligrow's operations and that the company's expansion limits their right to freedom of movement. The video above alleged abuses by RSPO Italian member in Colombia.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	 The decision has been delivered and this is now pending expiry of the appeals period on 27.02.2020.





Complaint 3.3 Goodhope Asia Holdings vs RSPO Secretariat	
Date Filed	19 April 2017
Respondent	Goodhope Asia Holdings
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	RSPO Secretariat (Following Joint Comment by FPP, Greenpeace, EIA and PUSAKA on the NPP Posting of PT Nabire Baru / Goodhope)
Complaint description	Note: FPP and the other NGOs also sent a complaint to the BoG on the fact that Goodhope had insisted that their NPP be posted for public consultation despite the Secretariat's finding that the HCV Assessment was not satisfactory. They had also questioned the role of the Secretariat in acting in accordance to GA 12 Resolution 6(H).
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. Pending response from the Respondent on the LUCA review process.



Complaint 3.4 IOI Pelita (IOI Group) vs Community of Long Teran Kanan	
Date Filed	10 March 2010 Transferred back from DSF to Complaints Panel on 17 January 2017
Respondent	IOI Pelita (IOI Group)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Sarawak, Malaysia
Complainant	Community of Long Teran Kanan
Complaint description	Infringement of P&C No.2.2 – the right to land use disputed
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	Phase two of the Respondent's resolution process ongoing with only three more longhouses left for the participatory mapping process.



Complaint 3.5 PT. Primatama Mulia Jaya v Masyarakat Adat Luhak	
Date Filed	12 July 2018
Respondent	PT Primatama Mulia Jaya [subsidiary of Wilmar International]
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Masyarakat Adat Luhak Saparampek Simpang Tigo and Forest People Programme (FPP)
Complaint description	The issuance of Right of Utilization of the Respondent issued without prior information to the Complainant
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	The Complaints Unit is still in communications with the Certification Unit within the Secretariat on the Special Audit report.



Complaint 3.6 PT. Agro Lestari Mandiri (Sinar Mas) vs Serikat Buruh Sejahtera Indonesia Kabupaten Ketapang	
Date Filed	30 August 2018
Respondent	PT Agro Lestari Mandiri (Sinar Mas)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Serikat Buruh Sejahtera Indonesia Kabupaten Ketapang
Complaint description	PT Agro Lestari Mandiri allegedly terminated workers in violation of the Indonesian Employment Law.
Status	(C) CP constituted
Decision / Justification	This Complaint is adjourned until the decision by the Supreme Court is delivered.



Complaint 3.7 PT. Perkebunan Nusantara III vs Pemimpinan Cabang Federasi Serikat Pekerja Metal Indonesia	
Date Filed	18 January 2019
Respondent	PT Perkebunan Nusantara III
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Pemimpinan Cabang Federasi Serikat Pekerja Metal Indonesia
Complaint description	Minimum wage Wage withholding/Deduction Occupational Hazard, Unsafe working conditions, exposure to chemicals.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. Decision letter is being finalised.



Complaint 3.8 PT Smart Tbk - subsidiary of Golden Agri Resources (GAR) vs Masyarakat Dusun I/II/III Belongkut	
Date Filed	18 October 2018
Respondent	PT Smart Tbk - subsidiary of Golden Agri Resources
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Indonesia
Complainant	Masyarakat Dusun I/II/III Belongkut
Complaint description	The termination of employment by PT Smart Tbk Kebun Adi Pati without severance payment
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The Briefing Note is in progress.

Complaint 3.9 Oleaginosas Del Peru S.A (OLPESA) vs Community of Santa Clara de Uchunya	
Date Filed	22 March 2019
Respondent	Oleaginosas Del Peru S.A. (OLPESA)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Peru
Complainant	Community of Santa Clara de Uchunya
Complaint description	 Sourcing FFB from unsustainable origin. Failure to conduct SIA.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The Internal review is ongoing for the preparation of the Briefing Note.

Complaint 3.10 Unico Desa Palm Oil Mill (subsidiary of IOI Corporation Berhad) vs Leap Spiral on behalf of Kampung Sri Ganda	
Date Filed	6 May 2019
Respondent	Unico Desa Palm Oil Mill (IOI Corporation Berhad)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Lahad Datu, Sabah, Malaysia
Complainant	Leap Spiral on behalf of Kampung Sri Ganda
Complaint description	Alleged utilisation of an area demarcated as a conservation area to address water issues in the village.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	Decision is delivered and the Complaint is closed and will be removed from the agenda moving forward.



Complaint 3.11 PT. PHP/AMP Plantation (subsidiary of Wilmar) vs Represented by Lawyer on behalf of Local Community - (Indonesia)		
Date Filed	20 August 2018	
Respondent	PT. PHP/AMP Plantation (subsidiary of Wilmar)	
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower	
Country	Indonesia	
Complainant	Represented by Lawyer on behalf of local community	
Complaint description	Dispute regarding plasma cooperation with local community	
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation	
Decision / Justification	1. The Briefing Note is in progress.	

Complaint 3.12 Boustead Rimba Nilai (subsidiary of Boustead Plantations Berhad) vs Mr	
Sauddin Che Lamin - (Malaysia)	
Date Filed	12 August 2019
Respondent	Boustead Rimba Nilai (subsidiary of Boustead Plantations Berhad)
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower
Country	Malaysia
Complainant	Mr Sauddin Che Lamin
Complaint description	Complainant was terminated on 2 July 2019 via letter without salary for 3 consecutive months based on mental health discrimination.
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation
Decision / Justification	1. The Briefing Note is in progress.

Complaint 3.13 Norpalm Ghana Limited vs Landowners of Ewusiejoe (Ghana)		
Date Filed	29 October 2019	
Respondent	Norpalm Ghana Limited	
Membership Category	Oil Palm Grower	
Country	Ghana	
Complainant	Landowners of Ewusiejoe	
Complaint description	 Non Transparency to landowners of Ewusiejoe. No minutes provided after meeting with Norpalm management. No information to Landowners on the arrival of the Inspectorate team from RSPO to enable them to participate and express their concerns. No information to Landowners on the demarcation made by Norpalm Ghana Ltd and no documents provided to the Complainant. Payments of monies to Landowners have not been fully made. 	
Status	(D) Investigation / deliberation	
Decision / Justification	 The Secretariat is waiting for the response from the Certification Body with regard to the comments made by the Complainant in the Special Audit report. 	