

<b>19<sup>th</sup> Meeting of RSPO Biodiversity and HCV Working Group (BHCV WG)</b>			
<b>Date</b>	29 Nov 2012		
<b>Venue</b>	Hotel Istana, Kuala Lumpur		
	Henry Barlow (HB)	SimeDaby	Co-chair
	Anders Lindhe (AL)	WWF International	Member
	Norazam Hameed (NH)	Felda	Member
	Calley Beamish (CB)	MPOA	Member (alternate)
	Catherine Cassagne (CC)	IFC	Member
	Michal Zurst (MZ)	ZSL	Member
	Sophia Gnych (SG)	ZSL	Member (alternate)
	Oliver Tichit (OT)	Sipef Group	Member
	Glen Reynolds (GR)	Royal Society SEARRP	Invited
	John Payne (JP)	BORA	Invited
	Abdul Hamid Ahmad	BORA	Invited
	Peter Heng (PH)	GAR	Invited
	Richard Kan (RK)	GAR	Invited
	Subrabaniam Rasappan	GAR	Invited
	Haskarlianus Pasang (HP)	GAR	Invited
	Junaidi Piliang (JP)	GAR	Invited
	Williem Cahyadi (WC)	GAR	Invited
	Tang Men Kon (TMK)	Sime Darby	Invited
	Lee Swee Yin (LSY)	Sime Darby	Invited
	Anne Rosenbarger (AR)	WRI	Invited
	Salahudin Yaacob (SY)	RSPO	Secretariat
	Audrey Lee Mei Fong (ALMF)	RSPO	Secretariat
<b>Agenda</b>	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Welcoming remarks from chairperson</li> <li>2. Review previous minutes</li> <li>3. SDP's remediation proposal</li> <li>4. Follow up on HCV assessment and development plan for Sungai Kawan Batu Area</li> <li>5. ZSL's website</li> <li>6. GAR's historical HCV assessment and compensation proposal</li> <li>7. SEARRP's Study on Certification Impacts</li> <li>8. AOB                             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- P&amp;C review TF request on HCV guidance</li> <li>- HCV reporting format</li> <li>- Joint co-chair for BHCV and CTF</li> <li>- 2013 work plan for BHCV WG</li> </ul> </li> </ol>		

**1. Welcoming remarks from co-chair**

HB welcomed all participants.

**2. Review on previous minutes**

RSPO reported invitation to Social NGOs (SNGOs). Solidaridad gave positive feedback and will inform RSPO on their representative.

The working group suggested that the secretariat prepare a budget to be tabled at the next meeting for discussion.

AL mentioned he will provide input on hazardous chemicals and procedures to handle these chemicals through the P&C review process.

**3. Sime Darby Plantation's (SDP) remediation proposal**

TMK updated on the progress of negotiation with the local community and restoration. It will be updated in the stage six report to the EB. SDP has completed stage four and is implementing recommended actions during stage five i.e. acquisition of 14 ha mixed rubber plantation and restoration of river riparian. The Sungai Kawan Batu initiative is not feasible for implementation. SDP is collecting empirical data as part of their monitoring and will be submitted in later reports.

AL asked on the alternative for golden triangle initiative i.e. Sungai Kawan Batu Proposal. He highlighted the importance to record lessons learnt although this proposal is not adopted. In response to AL on alternative for golden triangle initiative, TMK proposed to duplicate the size of the riparian as part of the in-situ remediation. GR further questioned the impact of this in-situ remediation. TMK justified that conservation of larger area of riparian will provide better connectivity.

CB suggested contributing in other protected area surrounding this concession i.e. Sepanggar, Tanjung Putih, Malua as an alternative. TMK replied that SDP is interested in exploring this possibility and will obtain more information from CB.

PH made a reference to the earlier minutes on HCV assessment in Batu Kawan area. He informed the group that it is being translated and the executive summary will be circulated to the WG. He also clarified that the 500 ha Sungai Batu Kawan area falls within the ijin lokasi of GAR but belongs to the community.

HB proposed SDP to develop a lesson learnt paper to outline efforts taken and outcome so far. AL seconded this proposal. JP added that the quality of the concession map often creates confusion of landuse. He also suggested that SDP should look into other issues and advice to avoid this situation.

JP suggested the WG should inform local government in Sampit on these latest developments.

ALMF reported on an upcoming compensation case involving First Resources and Rea Kaltim. OT also informed the WG that Sipef will be submitting their compensation case to RSPO soon. The WG agreed that companies should be encouraged to submit their compensation proposal voluntarily although the compensation document is yet to be finalised. The WG is also in favour of members investing in off-site conservation work as part of the compensation proposal. These expenditure and outcome of the compensation project should also be monitored.

#### 4. **Follow up on HCV assessment and development plan for Sungai Kawan Batu Area**

Executive summary of the HCV assessment report will be translated into English and circulated to the BHCV WG. This 500 ha of land is owned by the local community. It is under IUP (*Izin Usaha Perkebunan; Plantation Permit*) and HGU (*Hak Guna Usaha; Rights to Exploit*) of GAR. The community is interested to develop this area under the plasma programme and it will fall under the Time Bound Plan (TBP) of the company to achieve certification. Areas identified as HCV will not be developed.

**Action:** RSPO to circulate executive summary in English.

#### 5. **ZSL's website**

SG presented the ZSL's sustainable palm oil website. There were several comments from members on listing other certification schemes, such as ISPO, under this website. AL added that this website should provide clarification on selection criteria of different schemes and governance structure of certification scheme to promote critical thinking. He proposed to consider ISEAL's endorsement as one of the criteria for credible certification scheme.

In terms of scientific paper, AL suggested to provide abstract rather than summary to avoid misinterpretation. Information should be prioritised for different stakeholders group. CC highlighted that relevance of information often affects the acceptance of any website and that a survey be conducted to determine stakeholders' interest. SG responded that a survey was conducted during the initial development of this website.

**Action:** ZSL will review the website based on comments from the BHCV WG.

#### 6. **GAR's historical HCV assessment and compensation proposal**

PH and his team presented the remediation plan which covers 10 GAR subsidiaries. He pointed out that 8 out of 42 mills under GAR are certified, 460,000 ha of plantation has been established and new planting will be covered by a separate TBP .

In response to RSPO's Grievance Request, GAR has conducted a Historical HCV Assessment (HHA) by IPB. The report assessed that approximately 41,000ha of land was developed without HCV assessment from Nov 2005 to Dec 2010.

IPB also found that an additional 3,467ha of peat lands was developed without HCV assessment. GAR reinstated their policy not to develop any peat land regardless the depth of peat.

GAR has developed an eight stage remediation process, and it is currently under implementing Phase (phase 3). Phase 3 is a pilot test of the remediation process in 258.42 ha of area (24% of the total area 1,069ha).

Members requested a summary of the HHA and remediation proposal to facilitate the next discussion. In terms of riparian restoration, Wilmar has published a related study. CB suggested GAR considers other methodology such as frond cutting in line with restoration of economical tree species.

Members also suggested GAR refer to the "RSPO Manual on Best Management Practices (BMPs) on Existing Oil Palm Cultivation on Peat". Besides the BMPs, there is also a manual for management and rehabilitation of natural vegetation and associated with oil palm cultivation on peat.

Erosion bridge and erosion markers will be introduced to monitor effectiveness of the remediation actions.

**Action:** Circulate Executive Summary of HHA and remediation plan to the BHCV WG. GAR will review remediation plan based on comments made by BHCV WG.

## 7. SEARRP's Study on Certification Impacts

GR gave a briefing on the Royal Society SEARRP scoping study. RSPO has funded on gaps analysis and development of the research proposal on principles 4, 5, 6 and 7.

Based on the findings on the gaps analysis, a further research study was developed to provide an independent scientific analysis on certification impacts covering five main topics i.e. soil and water, GHG and air quality, biodiversity, livelihood, participatory processes and rights.

The project will be coordinated by the Royal Society SEARRP together with other senior researchers. Outputs of this study will provide recommendations to improve sustainability standards. Research papers will be translated into policy paper for different stakeholders. It is expected that the first delivery of output will be available 18 months after commencement of

project. The indication of total funding request is about £10 million pound. SEARRP decided not to source fund from RSPO and grower members.

HB highlighted on three issues related to study on livelihood and ILO compliance. 1) Employers are holding identity passport of workers for safekeeping but it is define as slavery under ILO convention, 2) contracts are not written in the local languages, 3) establishment of formal grievance procedure.

AL said the research should not only look at the water quality but also role of riparian for biodiversity and connectivity. GR explained that SAFE project has a comprehensive study on sedimentation, width of riparian and impact on the biodiversity and landscape conservation. AL also added that this research outcome will be made available for next P&C review.

Members discussed on the implication of accepting funding from RSPO members. CC proposed to source funding from GEF and collaborate with CIRAD. In terms of in kind contribution, SEARRP is hoping for accommodation, meal and transportation. PH will discuss with their Indonesian colleague and GAR is keen to work with SEARRP to provide in kind contribution. AR suggested collaboration with IPB. WRI has good experience working with IPB. SEARPP does not work directly with Indonesian Universities but Wagenigen University does. GR will circulate a list of collaborating universities in Indonesia.

GR mentioned that MPOB has approached SEARRP to provide funding to this research. CC shared her opinion that SEARRP should engage with more funders to dilute the risk.

**Action:** ALMF will circulate softcopy of the study brochure to the BHCV WG. GR will share a list of collaborating universities in Indonesia.

## 8. HCV reporting, monitoring and assessor accreditation

AL referred to earlier minutes whereby BHCV WG was requested to increase information on HCV reporting and monitoring. HCV RN is developing a licensing system for HCV assessors for quality control. Besides this, HCV RN is also developing a module for HCV reporting and monitoring. Other manuals from HCV RN such as HCV management at landscape level are linked to specific request on improving HCV management, monitoring and reporting.

MZ said ZSL's monitoring protocol will compliment generic manuals developed by HCV Resource Network. He updated on the progress of ZSL's protocols. The threats monitoring protocol is completed, training is on-going with Wilmar and Sipef. Some other protocols i.e. camera trapping protocol, habitat protocol, biodiversity protocol, HCV monitoring protocol are all in final drafts and a few selected protocols will be translated into French. In addition, software will

be developed to support these protocols. ZSL will submit ZSL's protocols for BHCV WG endorsement.

## 9. AOB

### **P&C review TF request on HCV guidance**

P&C review TF requested the following guidance related to P&C criterion 5.2:

- a. Stronger guidance on the tools to monitor and report on outcomes;*
- b. Clearer guidance on the benefits of river edge habitat conservation;*
- c. Clearer guidance on minimum size of HCV areas that it is worth conserving;*
- d. Clearer guidance on the need to manage HCVs and areas– rather than just set them aside;*
- e. Clearer criteria for assessors to measure company performance against;*
- f. The requirement for HCV management on a landscape level;*
- g. Guidance on enhancement and rehabilitation*

AL highlighted some of this guidance such as minimum size of HCV areas worth conserving will be deliberated under the HCV interpretation by HCV RN.

### **HCV reporting format**

RSPO updated that HCV reporting format was finalized, published and circulated to HCV assessors, certification bodies and growers through various platforms.

### **Joint co-chair for BHCV and CTF**

Due to the new responsibility as the chairperson of the RSPO's Complaint Panel, HB decided to resign as the co-chair of the BHCV WG. A new co-chair will be elected during the next BHCV WG meeting.

### **2013 work plan for BHCV WG**

In the previous meeting, AH had informed the group that RSPO working groups shall submit a work plan and budget to EB for approval before next financial year.

**Action:** RSPO secretariat to prepare a draft work plan and budget for discussion.

### **End of Meeting**

## Annex 1

### 19<sup>th</sup> Meeting of Biodiversity and HCV Working Group

Hotel Istana, Kuala Lumpur

No.	Name	Organization	Signature
1	Nurroam Hamzah	Fucla	
2	Cathy Beamish	rsop kulua	
3	Sakhrin Jaub	RSPO	
4	Anne Rosenbarger	WRI	
5	Tang Men Ken	Sime Darby Plantation	
6	Lee Swee Yen	Sime Darby Plantation	
7	S. Payne	BONA	
8	M. ZROST	ZSL	
9	ANDERS LINDHE	WWF INT.	
10	Sophia Gnych	ZSL	
11	Abdul Hamid Ahmed	BORA	
12	Catherine Gravel-Hen Cassagne	IFC	
13	GLEN REYNOLDS	ROYAL SOCIETY SCIENT	
14	Enrica Tichit	SIBP	





Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil

RSPO Secretariat Sdn Bhd  
Company No.: 787510-K  
Unit A-33A-2, Level 33A, Tower A  
Menara UOA Bangsar,  
No.5 JlnBangsarUtama 1  
59000 Kuala Lumpur  
Malaysia

Telephone : +603-2302 1500/  
Fax : +603 2201 4053  
Email : rspo@rspo.org



Roundtable on Sustainable Palm Oil

RSPO Secretariat Sdn Bhd  
Company No. : 787510-K  
Unit A-33A-2, Level 33A, Tower A  
Menara UOA Bangsar,  
No.5 Jln Bangsar Utama 1  
59000 Kuala Lumpur  
Malaysia

Telephone : +603-2302 1500/  
Fax : +603 2201 4053  
Email : rspo@rspo.org

15.	AENRY BARLOW	Simé Darby	Hesterley
16.	SUBRAMANIAM RASAPPAN	* GAR	Quam2
17.	Haskarlinae Pasang	GAR	#
18.	Juan Carlos	GAR	JM
19.	Richard Kan	GAR	Damen
20.	William Cahyadi	GAR	Ⓟ
21.			
22.			
23.			
24.			
25.			